COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES OF PHILADELPHIA

March 19, 2010

James J. McNulty, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission The Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street, 2nd Floor, P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17120

(****

Re: Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission v. Philadelphia Gas Works Docket No. R-2009-2139884 and P-2009- よんううんろう

TURN et al.'s Letter Brief in Response to the Joint Petition for Interlocutory Review of a Material Question and Approval of Partial Settlement

Dear Secretary McNulty:

Community Legal Services, Inc. represents two consumer organizations, Tenant Union Representative Network ("TURN") and Action Alliance of Senior Citizens of Greater Philadelphia ("Action Alliance")(hereinafter collectively "TURN <u>et al</u>.") in the above-captioned matters. This letter registers TURN <u>et al</u>.'s opposition to the Joint Petition for Interlocutory Review of a Material Question and Approval of Partial Settlement.

While TURN <u>et al</u>. strongly support utility programs to further energy conservation, especially for low and lower income residential households, such programs should not be implemented until there has been a thorough regulatory review of the costs and benefits of those programs. In this multi-party proceeding, PGW, with the support of only one other party, rashly seeks to bypass that regulatory process, by requesting that the Commission provide interlocutory review of this question, not by holding hearings and developing the record, but by granting a Motion for Partial Summary Judgment.

However, as the answers of OCA, OTS and OSBA demonstrate, there are numerous genuine issues of material fact concerning the costs, benefits and design of both the Enhanced Low-Income Retrofit Program and the Comprehensive Residential Heating Retrofit Program. The grant of Summary Judgment pursuant to 52 Pa.Code § 5.102(d)(1) or § 5.102(d)(2) may only occur when, *inter alia*, it has been demonstrated that there is "no genuine issue as to a material fact." This is a very high standard because the Commission must view the pleadings and supporting documents "in the light most favorable to the non-moving party." <u>Re MidAtlantic Cogen, Inc.</u>, Docket No. P-00940820, 86 Pa.P.U.C. 41, 1996 WL 944497 (Pa.P.U.C.). With the other opposing parties, TURN et al. submit that the Joint Petitioners have not met their

Page 1 of 2

1424 CHESTNUT STREET, PHILADELPHIA, PENNSYLVANIA 19102 P 215.981.3700 F 215.981.0434

- WWW.CLSPHILA.ORG -----

burden of satisfying this standard.

For these reasons, TURN et al. oppose the granting of the Joint Petition.

Respectfully submitted, S.e. $\hat{\mathbf{v}} \subset \mathcal{O}$. 0, 20

PHILIP A. BERTOCCI, ESQUIRE THU B. TRAN, ESQUIRE Attorneys for TURN <u>et al</u>.

cc: Certificate of Service Hon. Charles E. Rainey, Jr.

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission v. PGW Docket Nos. R-2009-2139884; P-2009-2097639

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the TURN's Letter-Brief upon

the participants listed below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa.Code § 1.54 (relating

to service by a participant).

VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL AND BY E-MAIL

Daniel Clearfield, Esquire Kevin J. Moody, Esquire Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC 213 Market Street, 8th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101 <u>dclearfield@eckertseamans.com</u> <u>kmoody@eckertseamans.com</u>

Johnnie Simms, Esquire Richard A. Kanaskie, Esquire Office of Trial Staff PA Public Utility Commission P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265 josimms@state.pa.us rkanaskie@state.pa.us

Sharon Webb, Esquire Lauren Lepkowski, Esquire Office of Small Business Advocate Commerce Building, Suite 1102 300 North 2nd Street Harrisburg, PA 17101 <u>swebb@state.pa.us</u> <u>llepkoski@state.pa.us</u> Todd Stewart, Esquire Hawke McKeon Sniscak & Kennard, P.O. Box 1778 Harrisburg, PA 17105 <u>TSStewart@hmslegal.com</u>

Darryl Lawrence, Esquire Jennedy S. Johnson, Esquire Office of Consumer Advocate 5th Floor, Forum Place Bldg. 555 Walnut Street Harrisburg, PA 17101-1921 <u>dlawrence@paoca.org</u> jjohnson@paoca.org

Charis Mincavage, Esquire Barry Naum, Esquire McNees Wallace Nurick 100 Pine Street P.O. Box 1166 Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 <u>cmincavage@mwn.com</u> <u>bnaum@mwn.com</u>

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

2010 MAR 22

VH 10:

ម្នា

Philip L. Hinerman, Esquire Jill Guldin, Esquire Robert Clothier, Esquire Fox Rothschild LP 2000 Market Street, 10th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103-3291 <u>phinerman@foxrothschild.com</u> <u>jguldin@foxrothschild.com</u> rclothier@foxrothschild.com Adam H. Cutler, Esquire Public Interest Law Center of Philadelphia 125 S. 9th Street, Suite 700 Philadelphia, PA 19107 acutler@pilcop.org

C. Se-ってい

Philip A. Bertocci, Esquire

Dated: March 19, 2010



COMMUNITY LEGAL SERVICES OF PHILADELPHIA

1424 CHESTNUT STREET, PHILADELPHIA, PA 19102



049J82040473

\$00.440 03/19/2010 Mailed From 19102 US POSTAGE

James J. McNulty, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission The Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street, 2nd Floor, P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17120

نىر ئىتى مەربىغ