# BAKER BOTTS LLP

THE WARNER 1299 PENNSYLVANIA AVE., NW WASHINGTON, D.C. 20004:2400 ABU DHABI H AUSTIN IG BEIJING N BRUSSELS N DAILAS P/ DUBAI RI HONG KONG RI

Houston Lonidon Moscow New York Paio Alto Rio de Janeiro Riyadh **Washington** 

1

TEL +1 202.639.7700 FAX +1 202.639.7890 BakerBotts.com

November 26, 2014

# VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street, 2nd Floor Harrisburg, PA 17120 Rich Sobiecki TEL: 202.639.7906 FAX: 202.639.1168 RECEIVE

# NOV 26 2014

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUREAU

#### Re: Application of Lyft, Inc. (Experimental Service in Allegheny County) (A-2014-2415045) A-2014-2415047

Application of Lyft, Inc. (Experimental Service in Pennsylvania) (A-20140241-5047)

# Petition of Kim Lyons and PG Publishing, Inc. d/b/a The Pittsburgh Post-Gazette for an Interim Emergency Order (P-2014-2442001)

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

١

Attached for filing with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission is an Answer to Motion to Strike Petition for Reconsideration by Kim Lyons and PG Publishing, Inc. d/b/a The Pittsburgh Post-Gazette on behalf of Lyft, Inc., in the above-captioned proceeding.

As shown by the attached Certificate of Service, all parties to this proceeding are being duly served.

Sincerel

Richard P. Sobiecki Counsel for Lyft, Inc. PA Attorney ID # 94366

Enclosures

c: Administrative Law Judge Mary D. Long (via e-mail and First-Class Mail) Administrative Law Judge Jeffrey A. Watson (via e-mail and First-Class Mail) Certificate of Service

# RECEIVED

# NOV 26 2014

# **BEFORE THE** PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

KIM LYONS & PG PUBLISHING INC.	:		
d/b/a THE PITTSBURGH POST-GAZETTE Petitioners	:		
i entioners	:	Docket No. A-2014-2415045	
<b>v</b> .	:		
	:		
LYFT, INC.	i		
Respondent	• :		

# LYFT'S ANSWER TO MOTION TO STRIKE PETITION FOR RECONSIDERATION OF KIM LYONS AND PG PUBLISHING, INC. D/B/A THE PITTSBURGH POST-GAZETTE

Pursuant to Section 5.61(a)(1) of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission's ("PUC" or "Commission") Regulations, Lyft, Inc. ("Lyft" or "Respondent") submits this Answer to Kim Lyons & PG Publishing Inc. d/b/a the Pittsburgh Post-Gazette's ("PPG") Motion to Strike the Petition of Lyft for Reconsideration of the Commission's October 23 Order. Although the Commission granted Lyft's Petition for Reconsideration on November 13, 2014, thus presumably mooting PPG's Motion to Strike, Lyft submits this Answer in an abundance of caution and to ensure that the record is complete and accurate.

#### BACKGROUND

1. On July 31, 2014, Administrative Law Judges Mary D. Long and Jeffrey A. Watson issued an Interim Order at Docket No. A-2014-2415045 directing Lyft to furnish data relating to rides provided using Lyft's mobile application platform. Because such information constitutes Lyft's highly confidential trade secrets, on August 29, 2014, Lyft sought a protective order to prevent its disclosure.

2. On September 2, 2014, ALJs Long and Watson issued an Interim Order denying Lyft's motion for a protective order. Lyft sought interlocutory review of the Interim Order on September 23, 2014.

3. On October 23, 2014, the Commission denied Lyft's petition for interlocutory review, ordering that the record be unsealed in 10 days (i.e., on November 3, 2014).

4. On November 3, 2014, Lyft filed a Petition for Reconsideration of the Commission's October 23 Order (the "Petition for Reconsideration").

5. On November 13, 2014, the Commission granted Lyft's Petition for Reconsideration pending further review and consideration of the merits.

### ARGUMENT

6. PPG raises two objections to Lyft's Petition for Reconsideration. First, it claims that the Petition was due "before" November 3, 2014 (the day it was filed), because the Commission's October 23 Order became final on that date. Second, it objects to Lyft's use of an affidavit to support its Petition. To the extent these objections were not mooted by the Commission's November 13, 2014 Order granting Lyft's Petition for Reconsideration, both can be easily rejected.

7. First, as PPG correctly notes, the Pennsylvania Code provides that "[p]etitions for reconsideration . . . shall be filed within 15 days *after* the Commission order involved is entered or *otherwise becomes final.*" 52 Pa. Code § 5.572 (emphasis added). PPG appears to have overlooked the word "after" in this provision, however. Because November 3 was the date on which the October 23 Order became final, under Section 5.572, Lyft had to file its Petition. "within 15 days *after*" that date. Lyft therefore had until November 18 to file its Petition.

8. Second, as to PPG's uncited proposition that Lyft was not permitted to support its Petition with an affidavit, it overlooks the fact that the Petition for Reconsideration was filed

2

under Section 703(g) of the Public Utility Code, which permits a reopening of the record. In Re Penn Estates Utilities, Inc., 248 P.U.R.4th 60, 2006 WL 1070907 (Mar. 31, 2006) (Commission reopened record sua sponte under Section 703(g)). The record here should be reopened because, at the relevant evidentiary hearing, the ALJs declined to hear testimony regarding the proprietary nature of trip data. Hr'g Tr. at 241:11-242:13 (Sept. 3, 2014).

### CONCLUSION

9. For these reasons, Lyft respectfully requests that the Commission deny PPG's Motion to Strike Lyft's Petition for Reconsideration.

Respectfully submitted:

:

ţ

James P. Dougherty (Pa. I.D. 59454) Adeolu A. Bakare (Pa. I.D. 208541) Barbara A. Darkes (Pa. I.D. No. 77419) McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC 100 Pine Street P.O. Box 1166 Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166 Phone: 717.232.8000 Fax: 717.237.5300 jdougherty@mwn.com abakare@mwn.com bdarkes@mwn.com Richard P. Sobiecki (Pa. I.D. 94366) Andrew T. George (Pa. I.D. 208618) Baker Botts L.L.P. 1299 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, D.C. 20004 Phone: (202) 639-7700 Fax: (202) 639-1168 rich.sobiecki@bakerbotts.com andrew.george@bakerbotts.com

Danny David (pro hac vice to be filed) Baker Botts L.L.P. 910 Louisiana St. Houston, TX 77002 Phone: (713) 229-1234 Fax: (713) 229-2855 danny.david@bakerbotts.com

Dated: November 26, 2014

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document has been served upon the following persons, in the manner indicated, in accordance with the requirements of § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant).

## VIA E-MAIL AND FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Lloyd R. Persun, Esq. Persun and Heim, P.C. MTR TRANS INC & BILLTOWN CAB P.O. Box 659 Mechanicsburg, PA 17055-0659 pagelbaugh@persunheim.com

Michael S Henry, Esq. SALAMAN, GRAYSON & HENRY 100 S. Broad Street, Suite 650 Philadelphia, PA 19110 mshenry@ix.netcom.com

David William Donley, Esq. JB Taxi LLC t/a County Taxi Cab 3361 Stafford Street Pittsburgh, PA 15204 dwdonley@chasdonley.com Samuel R. Marshall CEO and President Insurance Federation of Pennsylvania 1600 Market Street, Suite 1720 Philadelphia, PA 19103 smarshall@ifpenn.org dwatson@ifpenn.org

Ellis W. Kunka, Esq. Frederick N. Frank, Esq. Frank, Gale, Bails, Murcko & Pocrass, P.C. 707 Grant Street, Suite 3300 Pittsburgh, PA 15219 kunka@fbmgg.com frank@fbmgg.com

RECEIVE

# VIA FIRST-CLASS MAIL

Dennis G. Weldon Jr, Esq. Bryan L. Heulitt Jr., Esq. Philadelphia Parking Authority 701 Market Street, Suite 5400 Philadelphia, PA 19106 NOV **26** 2014

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION SECRETARY'S BUEL

Richard P. Sobiecki Counsel for Lyft, Inc.

Dated this 26th day of November 2014 in Washington, D.C.