

17 North Second Street 12th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1601 717-731-1970 Main 717-731-1985 Main Fax www.postschell.com

Devin T. Ryan

dryan@postschell.com 717-612-6052 Direct 717-731-1985 Direct Fax File #: 161198

January 29, 2015

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street, 2nd Floor North P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265

Re: Application of Lyft, Inc., a corporation of the State of Delaware, for the right to begin to transport, by motor vehicle, persons in the experimental service of Transportation Network Company for passenger trips between points in Allegheny County, PA - Docket No. A-2014-2415045

Application of Lyft, Inc., a corporation of the State of Delaware, for the right to begin to transport, by motor vehicle, persons in the experimental service of Transportation Network Company for passenger trips between points in Pennsylvania - Docket No. A-2014-2415047

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

Enclosed for filing, on behalf of Lyft, Inc., is a Motion to Strike Protestants' Response to Lyft's Petition for Partial Reconsideration, in the above-referenced proceeding. Copies will be provided as indicated on the Certificate of Service.

Respectfully submitted,

Devin T. Ryan

DTR/jl Enclosures Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary January 29, 2015 Page 2

cc: Honorable Mary D. Long Honorable Jeffrey Watson Certificate of Service

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE(Docket Nos. A-2014-2415047 and A-2014-2415045)

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following persons, in the manner indicated, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant).

VIA E-MAIL & FIRST CLASS MAIL

Lloyd R. Persun, Esquire Persun & Heim, P.C. P.O. Box 659 Mechanicsburg, PA 17055-0659 Email: pagelbaugh@persunheim.com

Michael S. Henry, Esquire Michael S. Henry LLC 100 South Broad Street, Suite 650 Philadelphia, PA 19110-1030 Email: mshenry@ix.netcom.com David William Donley, Esquire 3361 Stafford Street Pittsburgh, PA 15204 Email: dwdonley@chasdonley.com

Samuel R. Marshall
CEO and President
Insurance Federation of Pennsylvania
1600 Market Street, Suite 1720
Philadelphia, PA 19106
Email: smarshall@ifpenn.org
dwatson@ifpenn.org

VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

Dennis G. Weldon, Jr., Esquire Bryan L. Heulitt, Jr., Esquire Philadelphia Parking Authority 701 Market Street, Suite 5400 Philadelphia, PA 19106

Date: January 29, 2015

Devin T. Ryan

BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Application of Lyft, Inc., a corporation of the State of Delaware, for the right to begin to transport, by motor vehicle, persons in the experimental service of Transportation Network Company for passenger trips between points in Allegheny County, PA

Docket No. A-2014-2415045

Application of Lyft, Inc., a corporation of the State of Delaware, for the right to begin to transport, by motor vehicle, persons in the experimental service of Transportation Network Company for passenger trips between points in Pennsylvania

Docket No. A-2014-2415047

MOTION TO STRIKE PROTESTANTS' RESPONSE TO LYFT'S PETITION FOR PARTIAL RECONSIDERATION

Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.38, Lyft, Inc. ("Lyft"), respectfully submits this Motion to Strike the January 12, 2015 Response ("Response") to Lyft's January 2, 2015 Petition for Partial Reconsideration ("Petition"), filed by Protestants Executive Transportation Company, Inc., Aceone Trans Co., AF Taxi, Inc. AG Taxi, Inc. AGB Trans, Inc., Almar Taxi, Inc. ATS Cab, Inc, BAG Trans, Inc., BNG Cab Co., BNA Cab Co., BNJ Cab, Inc., Bond Taxi, Inc., BSP Trans, Inc., Double A Cab Co., FAD Trans, Inc., GA Cab, Inc., GD Cab, Inc. GN Trans, Inc., God Bless America Trans, Inc., Grace Trans, Inc., IA Trans, Inc., Jarnail Taxi, Inc., Jaydan, Inc. LAN Trans, Inc., LMB Taxi, Inc. MAF Trans, Inc., MDS Cab, Inc., MG Trans Co., Noble Cab, Inc., Odessa Taxi, Inc., RA V Trans, Inc., Rosemont Taxicab Co., Inc., S&S Taxi Cab, Inc., SAJ Trans, Inc., Saba Trans, Inc., SF Taxi, Inc., Society Taxi, Inc., Steele Taxi, Inc., TGIF Trans, Inc., V &S Taxi, Inc., VAL Trans, Inc., VB Trans, Inc., and VSM Trans, Inc., BM Enterprises, Inc., t/a A.G. Taxi, Bucks County Services, Inc., Dee Dee Cab Company, Germantown Cab Company, Ronald Cab, Inc., t/a Community Cab, Shawn Cab, Inc., t/a Delaware County Cab and

Sawink, Inc., t/a County Cab (together, "Protestants"). As explained below, Protestants' filing should be stricken from the record because it seeks affirmative relief outside the scope of Lyft's Petition and is thus properly considered as an out-of-time petition for reconsideration of the Commission's December 18, 2014 Orders granting Lyft experimental authority to operate a transportation service network in the Commonwealth.

- 1. On December 18, 2014, the Commission conditionally approved Lyft's applications for experimental transportation authority, subject to Lyft's satisfaction of certain requirements set forth in the Commission's orders.
- 2. On January 2, 2014, Lyft Petitioned the Commission for Partial Reconsideration of two issues from its December 18 Orders. First, Lyft asked the Commission to modify its interpretation of 52 Pa. Code § 32.11(b) to accommodate new personal insurance policies designed for those who drive for Transportation Network Companies ("TNCs") like Lyft. Second, Lyft asked the Commission to reconsider its requirement that Lyft compel its drivers to notify their insurance companies of their participation in Lyft.
- 3. Protestants' filing nominally addresses these issues before raising arguments and seeking affirmative relief having nothing to do with them. Its sole contribution to the matters being reconsidered is the erroneous suggestion that, if the Commission were to find its primary insurance requirements met by TNC-specific driver policies, then the Commission would be flooded with "hundreds or thousands" of insurance forms for individual driver policies. Response at 5. But the Commission's rules only require that *motor carriers* (here, Lyft), not individual drivers, certify proof or cancellation of insurance. *In Re Ins. Coverage Requirements for Motor Carriers*, M-00041816, 2005 WL 1876133 (May 23, 2005). And Lyft, to be clear, would still provide secondary insurance behind TNC-specific policies if the Commission

allowed them. So individual driver certifications would be both legally and practically unnecessary. Only *Lyft's* insurer would need to certify coverage to the Commission, as it has done.

- 4. Beyond this, Protestants respond not to Lyft's Petition but instead to the Commission's December 18 ruling itself. As an example, Protestants criticize the ruling by invoking the tragedy of a child being "killed by a driver backing out of a driveway after dropping off a passenger and shutting off the smartphone application" and claiming that Lyft's insurance coverage would not apply. Response at 4. Its concern is (a) invalid because drivers who use the Lyft application are required to provide proof of valid and current liability insurance that would cover Stage 0 (when drivers are not using Lyft's app), *see* December 18 Order at 46, and (b) wholly irrelevant to the questions raised in Lyft's Petition, which did not pertain to Stage 0.
- 5. The rest of Protestants' filing also attacks the December 18 Order, arguing at length that the Commission lacked jurisdiction to grant Lyft's experimental applications in the first place. Response at 8–10. These arguments, which are wholly detached from Lyft's Petition and which simply argue that the Commission's December 18 Order was incorrect, are not an "Answer" to Lyft's Petition under 52 Pa. Code § 5.572(e), but instead are a "Petition for Relief" subject to 52 Pa. Code § 5.572(c).
- 6. The distinction matters because of the requisite filing deadline. Under Section 5.572(e), answers to petitions for reconsideration must be filed within 10 days of the petition. So, because Lyft's Petition was filed January 2, Protestants' January 12 filing would be timely under this rule. But under Section 5.572(c), a petition for reconsideration must be filed within 15 days of an order. Properly considering Protestants' filing as a petition for reconsideration, it was due on

January 2, 2015, the same day that Lyft's Petition was due (and filed). Thus, because it was filed ten days later, it was untimely. It should therefore be stricken from the record.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael W. Gang (Pa. I.D. 25670) Devin T. Ryan (Pa. I.D. 316602) Post & Schell, P.C.

17 North Second St., 12th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1601

Phone: (717) 731-1970 Fax: (717) 731-1985 mgang@postschell.com

dryan@postschell.com

Richard P. Sobiecki (Pa. I.D. 94366)

Andrew T. George (Pa. I.D. 208618)

Baker Botts L.L.P.

1299 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, D.C. 20004

Phone: (202) 639-7700

Fax: (202) 639-1168

rich.sobiecki@bakerbotts.com andrew.george@bakerbotts.com

Danny David (admitted pro hac vice) Baker Botts L.L.P.

910 Louisiana St. Houston, TX 77002

Phone: (713) 229-1234

Fax: (713) 229-2855

danny.david@bakerbotts.com

Dated: January 29, 2015