

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Petition of Duquesne Light Company for :
Approval of its Energy Efficiency and : **Docket No. M-2015-2515375**
Conservation Phase III Plan :

**PETITION TO INTERVENE OF
THE COALITION FOR AFFORDABLE UTILITY SERVICES AND
ENERGY EFFICIENCY IN PENNSYLVANIA (“CAUSE-PA”)**

PENNSYLVANIA UTILITY LAW PROJECT
Counsel for CAUSE-PA
Joline Price, Esq., PA ID: 315405
Patrick M. Cicero, Esq., PA ID: 89039
Elizabeth R. Marx, Esq., PA ID: 309014
118 Locust Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
Tel.: 717-236-9486
Fax: 717-233-4088

December 17, 2015

The Coalition for Affordable Utility Services and Energy Efficiency in Pennsylvania (“CAUSE-PA”), through its counsel at the Pennsylvania Utility Law Project, hereby files this Petition to Intervene in the captioned proceeding, pursuant to the provisions of the Rules of Practice and Procedure of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (“PUC” or “Commission”), 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.71-5.76, and in support, states as follows:

1. Act 129 of 2008 ("Act 129") charged the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission ("Commission") with the task of developing an energy efficiency and conservation program ("EE&C Program.") The Act also established energy efficiency ("EE") and peak demand reduction ("PDR") targets that each electric distribution company ("EDC") with at least 100,000 customers had to meet by May 31, 2011 and/or May 31, 2013.
2. Pursuant to Section 2806.1(C)(3) of Act 129, the Commission was also charged with evaluating the costs and benefits of the EE&C Program by November 30, 2013 and every five years thereafter.
3. On June 11, 2015, after receiving comments and reply comments from the Companies and other interested parties, the Commission issued a Energy Efficiency and Conservation Phase III Implementation Order (“Implementation Order”), setting consumption reduction and demand reduction targets for each Electric Distribution Company (“EDC”) with at least 100,000 customers. The Commission issued a clarifying order on August 20, 2015.
4. On November 30, 2015, Duquesne Light Company (“Duquesne” or “the Company”) filed a Petition with the commission for approval of its Phase III Energy Efficiency and Conservation Plan (“Phase III EE&C Plan” or “Phase III Plan”).
5. Notwithstanding its filing of the instant Petition to Intervene, which if granted will preserve CAUSE-PA’s right to fully participate in the litigated proceeding, CAUSE-PA reserves its right to file responsive pleadings and/or comments by the January 4, 2016 deadline set forth in the December 12, 2015 Notice published in the Pennsylvania Bulletin.
6. Eligibility to intervene in Commission proceedings is governed by 52 Pa. Code § 5.72, which provides in relevant part that “[a] petition to intervene may be filed by a person claiming a right to intervene or an interest of such nature that intervention is necessary or

appropriate to the administration of the statute under which the proceeding is brought.” 52 Pa. Code § 5.72(a).

7. Section 5.72 further provides that the right or interest may be one “which may be directly affected and which is not adequately represented by existing participants, and as to which the petitioner may be bound by the action of the Commission in the proceeding.” 52 Pa. Code. § 5.72(a) (2).
8. Even though Section 5.72 speaks of the rights of a “person” to intervene, the Commonwealth Court has consistently stated that “an association may have standing as a representative of its members ...as long as an organization has at least one member who has or will suffer a direct, immediate, and substantial injury to an interest as a result of the challenged action, [i.e., is aggrieved, the organization] has standing.” *Energy Cons. Council of Pa. v. Pa. P.U.C.*, 995 A.2d 465, 476 (Pa. Commw. 2010) (alteration in original) (citing *Tripps Park v. Pa. P.U.C.*, 415 A.2d 967 (Pa. Commw. 1980); *Parents United for Better Schools v. School District of Philadelphia*, 646 A.2d 689 (Pa. Commw. 1994)).
9. CAUSE-PA is an unincorporated association of low-income individuals that advocates on behalf of its members to enable consumers of limited economic means to connect to and maintain affordable water, electric, heating and telecommunication services.
10. CAUSE-PA membership is open to moderate and low income individuals residing in the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania who are committed helping low-income families maintain affordable access to utility services and achieve economic independence.
11. CAUSE-PA is located, c/o the Pennsylvania Legal Aid Network, at 118 Locust Street, Harrisburg, PA 17101.
12. CAUSE-PA has interests in the impact that the proposed Energy Efficiency and Conservation Program has on moderate and low income residential customers. These interests are not adequately represented by other participants.
13. At least one member of CAUSE-PA is a customer of Duquesne Light and will be directly affected by the outcome of this proceeding.¹

¹ Dorothy Young, Rochelle Jackson, and Anastasia Stratigos are all members of CAUSE-PA and customers of Duquesne Light Company.

14. Because at least one member of CAUSE-PA has or will suffer a direct, immediate, and substantial injury to an interest as a result of this proceeding, CAUSE-PA has standing to intervene. *See Energy Cons. Council of Pa.*, 995 A.2d at 476.

15. CAUSE-PA is represented in this proceeding by:

Joline Price, Esquire
Patrick M. Cicero, Esquire
Elizabeth R. Marx, Esquire
Pennsylvania Utility Law Project
118 Locust Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
Telephone: 717-236-9486
Facsimile: 717-233-4088
E-mail: pulp@palegalaid.net

Counsel for CAUSE-PA consents to the service of documents by electronic mail to pulp@palegalaid.net, as provided in 52 Pa. Code § 1.54(b)(3).

16. Act 129 identifies low income customers as a specific group of customers designated to receive specific energy saving levels in the EE&C Plans.

The Plan shall include specific energy efficiency measures for households at or below 150% of the federal poverty income guidelines. The number of measures shall be proportionate to those households' share of the total energy usage in the service territory.²

17. The Commission, in its Implementation Order, required EDCs to develop specific low-income programs:

The Commission is satisfied with the confidence level of the SWE analysis and will retain the 5.5% low-income savings target for the EDCs with the following modification. Savings counted towards the 5.5% target may only come from specific low-income programs or low-income verified participants in multifamily housing programs. Savings from non-low-income programs will not be counted for compliance.³

18. CAUSE-PA has reviewed Duquesne Light Company's EE&C Petition and identified a number of issues presented by the filing which may positively or negatively affect its members. CAUSE-PA anticipates that additional issues may arise as a more

² 66 Pa. C.S. §§ 2806.1(b)(1)(I)(G).

³ Energy Efficiency and Conservation Program, Docket No. M-2014-2424864 (Implementation Order entered on June 11, 2015).

comprehensive review of the filing is undertaken.

19. It is critical for CAUSE-PA to intervene in the proceeding to resolve potential negative aspects of Duquesne Light's Plan and to ensure that the positive aspects of the Plan are not changed.
20. CAUSE-PA asserts that its issues, and any future modifications presented by intervening parties, must be thoroughly reviewed through discovery and an evidentiary hearing, at which all parties are provided an opportunity to submit expert testimony on the record and to fully participate in the proceeding.

WHEREFORE, CAUSE-PA respectfully request that the Public Utility Commission, through its Office of Administrative Law Judge:

- (1) enter an order granting CAUSE-PA full status as an intervener in this proceeding with active party status;
- (2) set forth a procedural process and schedule for litigation in the instant proceeding which allows for full and meaningful participation of all parties, including the submission of expert testimony; and
- (3) grant such other relief as is just and appropriate.

Respectfully submitted,

PENNSYLVANIA UTILITY LAW PROJECT
Counsel for CAUSE-PA



Joline Price, Esq., PA ID: 315405
Patrick M. Cicero, Esq., PA ID: 89039
Elizabeth R. Marx, Esq., PA ID: 309014
118 Locust Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
Tel.: 717-236-9486
Fax: 717-233-4088
pulp@palegalaid.net

December 17, 2015

Verification

I, **Minta Livengood**, a member of the Executive Committee of the Coalition for Affordable Utility Services and Energy Efficiency (“CAUSE-PA”), on behalf of CAUSE-PA, hereby state that the facts contained in the foregoing pleading are true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief, that I am duly authorized to make this Verification, and that I expect to be able to prove the same at a hearing held in this matter. I understand that the statements herein are made subject to the penalties of 10 Pa.C.S. § 4904 (relating to unsworn falsification to authorities).


Ms. Minta Livengood

On behalf of the Executive Committee of the
Coalition for Affordable Utility Services and
Energy Efficiency in Pennsylvania (CAUSE-PA)

Date: December 17, 2015

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served copies of the **Petition to Intervene**, as set forth below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a party).

VIA EMAIL and/or FIRST CLASS MAIL

Honorable Charles E. Rainey Jr.
Chief Administrative Law Judge
PA Public Utility Commission
P.O. Box 3265
Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265
crainey@pa.gov

Linda R. Evers, Esq.
Stevens & Lee, P.C.
111 N. Sixth Street
PO Box 679
Reading, PA 19601
lre@stevenslee.com

Michael A. Gruin, Esq.
Stevens & Lee, P.C.
17 North Second Street, 16th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101
mag@stevenslee.com

Robert H. Hoaglund II
Assistant General Counsel
Duquesne Light Company
411 Seventh Avenue 16th Floor 16-1
Pittsburgh, PA 15219
rhoaglund@duqlight.com

David R. Evrard, Esq.
Brandon J. Pierce
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street,
5th Floor, Forum Place
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923
devrard@paoca.org
bpierce@paoca.org

Sharon Webb, Esq.
Office of Small Business Advocate
300 N. 2nd Street – Ste 202
Harrisburg, PA 17101
swebb@pa.gov

Johnnie Simms, Esq.
Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
Commonwealth Keystone Building
400 North Street, 2nd Floor West
PO Box 3265
Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265
jsimms@pa.gov

Pamela C. Polacek, Esq.
Teresa K. Schmittberger, Esq.
McNees, Wallace & Nurick, LLC
100 Pine Street
PO Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166
ppolacek@mwn.com
tschmittberger@mwn.com

Theodore S. Robinson, Esq.
Citizen Power Inc.
2121 Murray Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15217

Jeffrey J. Norton, Esq.
Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC
213 Market Street, 8th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Joseph L. Vullo, Esq.
Burke Vullo Reilly Roberts
1460 Wyoming Avenue
Forty Fort, PA 18704

Respectfully submitted,
PENNSYLVANIA UTILITY LAW PROJECT
Counsel for CAUSE-PA



Joline Price, Esq.
PA ID # 315405
118 Locust Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
717-236-9486
pulp@palegalaid.net
jpricepulp@palegalaid.net

Dated: December 17, 2015

