

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA



OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 Walnut Street, 5th Floor, Forum Place  
Harrisburg, Pennsylvania 17101-1923  
(717) 783-5048  
800-684-6560

FAX (717) 783-7152  
consumer@paoca.org

June 16, 2016

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary  
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission  
Commonwealth Keystone Building  
400 North Street  
Harrisburg, PA 17120

RE: Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission v.  
Pennsylvania Electric Company  
Docket No. R-2016-2537352

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

Attached for electronic filing please find the Office of Consumer Advocate's Prehearing Memorandum in the above-referenced proceeding.

Copies have been served per the attached Certificate of Service.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Lauren M. Burge".

Lauren Burge  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. 311570

Enclosures

cc: Honorable Mary D. Long, ALJ  
Certificate of Service

222504

BEFORE THE  
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	
	:	
v.	:	Docket No. R-2016-2537352
	:	
Pennsylvania Electric Company	:	

---

PREHEARING MEMORANDUM  
OF THE  
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

---

Pursuant to Section 333 of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa. C.S. Section 333, and in response to the Prehearing Conference Order issued by Administrative Law Judge Mary D. Long (ALJ Long) in the above-captioned matter, the Office of Consumer Advocate (OCA) provides the following information:

**I. INTRODUCTION**

On April 28, 2016, the Pennsylvania Electric Company (Penelec or the Company) filed Supplement No. 23 to Penelec’s Tariff Electric – Pa. P.U.C. No. 81, at Docket No. R-2016-2537352. The Company is seeking an increase in annual distribution revenue of \$158.8 million, or an overall increase of 11.42%. Penelec serves approximately 590,000 residential, commercial, and industrial customers in all or portions of thirty-three counties in northern and central Pennsylvania.

The OCA filed a Formal Complaint against the proposed revenue increase on May 3, 2016. On June 9, 2016, the Commission issued an Order initiating an investigation into the

lawfulness, justness and reasonableness of the proposed rate increase in this filing, and suspended the effective date of Supplement No. 23 until January 27, 2017, by operation of law. The case was assigned to ALJ Long. A telephonic Prehearing Conference is scheduled for June 17, 2016.

## **II. ISSUES AND SUB-ISSUES**

Based upon a preliminary analysis of Penelec's base rate filing, the OCA has compiled a list of issues which it anticipates will be included in its investigation of this rate request. It is anticipated that other issues may arise and may be pursued once the answers to all of the OCA's interrogatories have been received and analyzed.

The OCA has served five sets of interrogatories to date. Upon receipt of the answers to those interrogatories, the OCA may then be able to narrow the scope of additional information requests. Once the discovery process has been completed, the OCA will file direct testimony which will set forth the specific issues that the OCA will address in this proceeding. At that time, the OCA will also be able to make and to quantify its specific recommendations.

The following list sets forth the issues, that at this time, the OCA anticipates it may raise:

### **A. Rate of Return**

- **Cost of Common Equity:** The OCA will perform a detailed analysis of the cost of common equity claimed by Penelec. Also, the OCA will carefully examine the Company's methodologies and supporting data used to develop its final cost of common equity claim.
- **Capital Structure:** The OCA will examine whether the capital structure claimed by Penelec is representative of the period in which rates will be in effect and is otherwise appropriate for ratemaking purposes.

- After Tax Weighted Average Cost of Capital (ATWACC): The OCA will examine the methodologies used by the Company to derive its cost of capital.
- Embedded Cost of Debt and Preferred Stock: The OCA will examine the embedded cost of debt and preferred stock.

B. Rate Base/Measure of Value

The OCA will examine the reasonableness of the Company's filing as it relates to rate base/measures of values, including the following areas:

- The Company's plant in service claims in order to determine whether the plant claimed is used and useful in providing utility service;
- The Company's application of the Fully Projected Future Test Year (FPFTY) in this proceeding; and
- The Company's claim for cash working capital.

C. Revenue and Expenses

The OCA will examine the reasonableness of the Company's filing as it relates to revenues and expenses, including the following areas:

- The sales forecast utilized by the Company in order to project future test year sales and revenues;
- Penelec's proposed depreciation expense;
- The Company's rate case expense, labor expense, and advertising expense;
- Inter-company charges;
- Penelec's affiliate charges; and
- Salaries of Penelec's employees, including executive compensation.

D. Rate Structure/Cost of Service/Rate Design

- The OCA will examine the cost of service study, including the methodology used and the reasonableness of the allocations.
- The OCA will examine the Company's proposed customer charge.
- The OCA will examine whether the rate design proposed by the Company is reasonable and appropriate.
- The OCA will examine the Company's proposed distribution of the revenue increase among customer classes.
- The OCA will examine the reasonableness and appropriateness of the Company's proposed tariff changes.
- The OCA will examine any changes to the Company's riders.

E. Universal Service Programs

- The OCA will review the Company's Customer Assistance Program to ensure that the budget amount is reasonable and that costs are recovered appropriately.
- The OCA will review the Company's Low-Income Usage Reduction Program to ensure that the budget amount is reasonable and that costs are recovered appropriately.
- The OCA will review the cost recovery mechanism to ensure that the Company recovers only those costs permitted to be recovered.

### **III. WITNESSES**

The OCA intends to present the direct, rebuttal, and surrebuttal testimony, as may be necessary, of the following witnesses in this proceeding. The witnesses will present testimony in written form and will also attach various exhibits, documents, and explanatory information which will assist in the presentation of the OCA's case. In order to expedite the resolution of this proceeding, the OCA requests that copies of all interrogatories, testimony, and answers to

interrogatories be mailed directly to the expert witnesses responsible for the area of the case, as well as mailing a copy to counsel for the OCA.

A. Rate Base, Revenues, Expenses, and General Accounting

Ralph Smith  
Larkin and Associates, PLLC  
15728 Farmington Road  
Livonia, Michigan 48154

Telephone: 734-522-3420  
E-mail: [rsmithla@aol.com](mailto:rsmithla@aol.com)

B. Rate Structure and Cost Allocation

Clarence Johnson  
CJ Energy Consulting  
3707 Robinson Avenue  
Austin, TX 78722

Telephone: 512-506-1896  
E-mail: [cjenergyconsult@att.net](mailto:cjenergyconsult@att.net)

C. Rate of Return

David C. Parcell  
Technical Associates, Inc.  
1503 Santa Rosa Road  
Suite 130  
Richmond, VA 23229

Telephone: 804-272-5363  
E-mail: [parcelld@tai-econ.com](mailto:parcelld@tai-econ.com)

D. Universal Service/CAP

Roger Colton  
Fisher, Sheehan and Colton  
34 Warwick Road  
Belmont, MA 02478

Telephone: 617-484-0597  
E-mail: [roger@fsconline.com](mailto:roger@fsconline.com)

The OCA specifically reserves the right to call additional witnesses, as necessary. As soon as the OCA has determined whether an additional witness or witnesses will be necessary for any portion of its case, the OCA will promptly notify ALJ Long and all parties of record.

#### **IV. SERVICE ON THE OCA**

The OCA will be represented in this case by Senior Assistant Consumer Advocate Darryl Lawrence and Assistant Consumer Advocates David Evrard, Candis Tunilo, and Lauren M. Burge. Two copies of all documents should be served on the OCA as follows:

Darryl Lawrence  
Office of Consumer Advocate  
555 Walnut Street  
5th Floor, Forum Place  
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923  
Telephone: (717) 783-5048  
Fax: (717) 783-7152  
E-mail: [2016FIRSTENERGYRATECASES@paoca.org](mailto:2016FIRSTENERGYRATECASES@paoca.org)

#### **V. DISCOVERY**

The OCA has served five sets of discovery to date. The OCA expects that the Company's responses will trigger follow-up discovery due to the nature and complexity of the issues involved. Because the time period for discovery and preparation of testimony is limited, the OCA supports a shortened discovery response time in this proceeding. The OCA, therefore, requests the following modifications:

a. Answers to written interrogatories propounded in preparation of direct and rebuttal testimony shall be served in-hand within ten (10) calendar days of service. Answers to written interrogatories propounded in preparation of surrebuttal testimony shall be served in-hand within five (5) calendar days of service. Discovery propounded after 12:00 noon on a Friday will be deemed served on the next business day for purposes of determining the due date of the responses.

b. Objections to interrogatories shall be communicated orally within three (3) calendar days of service of the interrogatories; unresolved objections shall be served to the ALJ in writing within five (5) days of service of the

interrogatories. Objections to interrogatories served on a Friday shall be communicated orally within four (4) calendar days, and unresolved objections shall be served to the ALJ in writing within six (6) days of service of the interrogatories.

c. Motions to dismiss objections and/or direct the answering of interrogatories shall be filed within three (3) calendar days of service of the written objections.

d. Answers to motions to dismiss objections and/or direct the answering of interrogatories shall be filed within three (3) calendar days of service of such motions.

e. Responses to requests for document production, entry for inspection, or other purposes must be served in-hand within ten (10) calendar days.

f. Requests for admissions will be deemed admitted unless answered within ten (10) calendar days or objected to within five (5) calendar days of service.

In addition to the preceding modifications to the Commission's Discovery Regulations, the OCA has one further request as to the exchange of information for this proceeding. The OCA requests that parties providing Direct and Rebuttal testimony, either include with such testimony electronic workpapers, cited studies and other documents relied on, or, provide same in workable electronic format within two (2) business days of the testimony submission date to all parties. In the OCA's experience, following the submission of these rounds of testimony parties routinely request the information just described through the normal discovery channels. The OCA submits that much time and effort could be saved by agreeing to streamline the process through an informal discovery modification as the OCA proposes here.

## **VI. PUBLIC INPUT HEARINGS**

The OCA has received requests for public input hearings through its Customer Call Center for hearings throughout the Penelec service territory. The OCA has worked with the Company to identify appropriate locations for public input hearings to be held within the



Company's service territory. The OCA supports the proposal included in the Company's Prehearing Memorandum as to times and places for public input hearings.

The OCA reserves the right to request additional locations for public input hearings in response to future requests from ratepayers and/or legislators, and will promptly advise ALJ Long and the parties of any further requests.

#### **VII. PROPOSED SCHEDULE**

The OCA has worked with the Company and the parties to develop a litigation schedule for this proceeding. The OCA supports the adoption of the schedule outlined in the Company's Prehearing Memorandum.

#### **VIII. CONSOLIDATION**

The OCA supports the consolidation of the four FirstEnergy base rate proceedings: Metropolitan Edison Company (R-2016-2537349); Pennsylvania Electric Company (R-2016-2537352); Pennsylvania Power Company (R-2016-2537355); and West Penn Power Company (R-2016-2537359).

Respectfully submitted,



Lauren M. Burge  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 311570  
E-mail: [LBurge@paoca.org](mailto:LBurge@paoca.org)

Darryl Lawrence  
Senior Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 93682  
E-mail: [DLawrence@paoca.org](mailto:DLawrence@paoca.org)

David T. Evrard  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 33870  
E-mail: [DEvrard@paoca.org](mailto:DEvrard@paoca.org)

Candis Tunilo  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 89891  
E-mail: [CTunilo@paoca.org](mailto:CTunilo@paoca.org)

Counsel for:  
Tanya J. McCloskey  
Acting Consumer Advocate

Office of Consumer Advocate  
5th Floor, Forum Place  
555 Walnut Street  
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923  
Telephone: 717-783-5048  
Fax: 717-783-7152

June 16, 2016

222416

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission :  
v. : Docket No. R-2016-2537352  
Pennsylvania Electric Company :

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document, the Office of Consumer Advocate's Prehearing Memorandum, upon parties of record in this proceeding in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code §1.54 (relating to service by a participant), in the manner and upon the persons listed below:

Dated this 16<sup>th</sup> day of June 2016.

SERVICE BY E-MAIL & INTER-OFFICE MAIL

Allison C. Kaster, Esquire  
Gina L. Lauffer, Esquire  
Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement  
Pa. Public Utility Commission  
P.O. Box 3265  
Harrisburg, PA 17105

SERVICE BY E-MAIL & U.S. MAIL, POSTAGE PREPAID

Thomas P. Gadsden, Esquire  
Anthony DeCusatis, Esquire  
Catherine G. Vasudevan, Esquire  
Brooke E. McGlenn  
Morgan, Lewis & Bockius LLP  
1701 Market Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Tori L. Giesler, Esquire  
First Energy Service Company  
2800 Pottsville Pike  
Reading, PA 19612

Charis Mincavage, Esquire  
Vasiliki Karandrikas, Esquire  
Kenneth Stark, Esquire  
Alessandra L. Hylander, Esquire  
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC  
100 Pine Street  
P.O. Box 1166  
Harrisburg, PA 17108  
*Counsel for PICA*

Daniel G. Asmus, Esquire  
Office of Small Business Advocate  
Suite 202, Commerce Building  
300 North Second Street  
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Scott J. Rubin  
333 Oak Lane  
Bloomsburg, PA 17815  
*Counsel for IBEW- Local 459*

SERVICE BY E-MAIL ONLY

Joseph O. Minott, Esquire  
Logan Welde, Esquire  
135 S. 19<sup>th</sup> Street  
Suite 300  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
*Counsel for Clean Air Council*

SERVICE BY U.S. MAIL, POSTAGE PREPAID

Kenneth Springirth  
4720 Cliff Drive  
Erie, PA 16511



---

Darryl A. Lawrence  
Senior Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 93682  
Email: [DLawrence@paoca.org](mailto:DLawrence@paoca.org)

Lauren M. Burge  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 311570  
Email: [LBurge@paoca.org](mailto:LBurge@paoca.org)

David T. Evrard  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 33870  
E-Mail: [DEvrard@paoca.org](mailto:DEvrard@paoca.org)

Candis A. Tunilo  
Assistant Consumer Advocate  
PA Attorney I.D. # 89891  
E-Mail: [CTunilo@paoca.org](mailto:CTunilo@paoca.org)

Counsel for  
Office of Consumer Advocate  
555 Walnut Street 5th Floor, Forum Place  
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923  
Phone: (717) 783-5048  
Fax: (717) 783-7152  
222507