**BEFORE THE  
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537349, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

Metropolitan Edison Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537352, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

Pennsylvania Electric Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537355, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

Pennsylvania Power Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537359, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

West Penn Power Company :

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  |  |  |

PROTECTIVE ORDER

Upon consideration of the Motion for entry of a Protective Order made by Metropolitan Edison Company, Pennsylvania Electric Company, Pennsylvania Power Company and West Penn Power Company (the “Companies”) and the parties participating in the June 17, 2016 Prehearing Conference in this matter:

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. That the Motion is hereby granted and this Protective Order is issued to establish procedures for the protection of all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 and 3 below, which are or will be filed with the Commission, produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during the above-captioned proceeding and all proceedings consolidated with it. All persons now or hereafter granted access to the materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 and 3of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Order.
2. That the information subject to this Protective Order is all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, in whatever form produced, stored or contained, including computerized memory, magnetic, electronic or optical media, furnished in this proceeding that the producing party believes to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and are so designated by being stamped “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material. Such materials are referred to in this Protective Order as “Proprietary Information.” When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be designated as such for the record.
3. That for purposes of this Protective Order, there are two categories of Proprietary Information: “CONFIDENTIAL” and “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material. A producing party may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that are customarily treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, that are not available to the public, and that, if generally disclosed, would subject that party to the risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury. A producing party may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature, relative to the business interests of parties to this proceeding, or of such a private or personal nature, that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. The parties shall endeavor to limit the information designated as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material.
4. That subject to the terms of this Protective Order, Proprietary Information shall be provided to counsel for a party who meets the criteria of a “Reviewing Representative” as set forth below. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, testimony, cross-examination, argument, or settlement discussions in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, such counsel may allow others to have access to Proprietary Information only in accordance with the conditions and limitations set forth in this Protective Order.
5. That nothing in this Protective Order precludes the use by the Commission and its Staff, consistent with this Protective Order, of Proprietary Information produced in this proceeding and made part of the record.
6. That information deemed “CONFIDENTIAL” shall be provided to a “Reviewing Representative.” For purposes of “CONFIDENTIAL” Proprietary Information, a “Reviewing Representative” is a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and is:
   1. An attorney who has formally entered an appearance in this proceeding on behalf of a party;
   2. An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph (i) above;
   3. An expert or an employee of an expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising that party or testifying in this proceeding on behalf of that party; or
   4. Employees or other representatives of a party who have significant responsibility for developing or presenting that party’s positions in this docket.
7. That information deemed “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material shall be provided to a Reviewing Representative, provided, however that a Reviewing Representative, for purposes of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material, is limited to a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and is:
   1. An attorney who has formally entered an appearance in this proceeding on behalf of a party;
   2. An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph (i) above;
   3. An outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising that party or testifying in this proceeding on behalf of that party; or
   4. A person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material pursuant to Paragraph 12.
8. That for purposes of this Protective Order, a Reviewing Representative may not be a “Restricted Person” absent agreement of the party producing the Proprietary Information pursuant to Paragraph 12. A “Restricted Person” shall mean: (a) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services or advising another person who has such duties: (b) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the parties (including any association of competitors of the parties) or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services or advising another person who has such duties; (c) an officer, director, stock holder, owner, agent or employee of a competitor of a customer of or vendor to the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of or vendor of the parties; and (d) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert’s interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violating the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than $10,000 or constituting more than a 1% interest in a business establish a significant motive for violation.
9. That if an expert for a party, another member of the expert’s firm or the expert’s firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person, that expert must: (1) identify for the parties each Restricted Person and all personnel in or associated with the expert’s firm that work on behalf of the Restricted Person; (2) take all reasonable steps to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert’s participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (3) if segregation of such personnel is impractical, the expert shall give to the producing party a written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way adversely affect the interest of the parties or their customers. The parties retain the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the parties’ or their customers’ interests will not be adversely affected. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission or the presiding Administrative Law Judge(s). The Office of Small Business Advocate’s consultant, Robert D. Knecht, will not be considered to be a “Restricted Person” and Paragraphs 8 and 9 will not apply to Mr. Knecht, provided that Mr. Knecht does not share, distribute, or discuss the Proprietary Information with any person except authorized Office of Small Business Advocate representatives.
10. That Reviewing Representatives qualified to receive “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material may discuss HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material with their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a “Restricted Person,” but may not share with, or permit the client or entity to review or have access to, the HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material. Counsel for the Office of Consumer Advocate, Office of Small Business Advocate and Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”) may share Proprietary Information with the Consumer Advocate, Small Business Advocate, or I&E Director, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure Certificate from the Consumer Advocate, Small Business Advocate, or I&E Director, provided however, that the Consumer Advocate, Small Business Advocate, or I&E Director otherwise abides by the terms of this Protective Order.
11. That Proprietary Information shall be treated by the parties and by the Reviewing Representative in accordance with the terms of this Protective Order, which are hereby expressly incorporated into the certificate that must be executed pursuant to Paragraph 13(a). Proprietary Information shall be used as necessary, for the conduct of this proceeding and for no other purpose. Proprietary Information shall not be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person’s responsibilities in this proceeding.
12. That Reviewing Representatives may not use anything contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through this proceeding to give any party or any competitor of any party a commercial advantage. In the event that a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraph 7(i) through (iii) above, as qualified by Paragraph 8 above, the party must first seek agreement to do so from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, the designated individual shall be a Reviewing Representative pursuant to Paragraph 7(iv) above with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party seeking to have a person designated a Reviewing Representative shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge(s) for resolution.
13. That (a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate in the form provided in Appendix A, provided, however, that if an attorney or expert qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney’s instruction, supervision or control need not do so. A copy of each executed Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel for the party asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

That (b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with this Protective Order.

1. That the parties shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by stamping the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material. Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the parties, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information.
2. That the Commission and all parties, including the statutory advocates and any other agency or department of state government, will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the definition of “confidential proprietary information” in Section 102 of the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Law of 2008, 65 P.S. § 67.102 and subject to the exemptions from disclosure provided in the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Act (65 P.S. § 67.101 et seq.) until such information is found by a tribunal with jurisdiction to be not confidential or subject to one or more exemptions.
3. That any public reference to Proprietary Information by a party or its Reviewing Representative shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.
4. That the part(s) of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits (including discovery responses made part of the record), writings, testimony, cross examination, and argument, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 16 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties to this proceeding or pursuant to an order of the Commission.
5. That the parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information. If a party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the producing party retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.
6. That the parties shall retain the right to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground, to refuse to produce Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection, and to seek additional measures of protection of Proprietary Information beyond those provided in this Protective Order.
7. That within 30 days after a Commission final order is entered in the above-captioned proceedings, or in the event of appeals, within thirty days after appeals are finally decided, the receiving party, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the producing party all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. This provision, however, shall not apply to I&E, the Office of Consumer Advocate, or the Office of Small Business Advocate, or any other party receiving the consent of the producing party; except, however, that HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material provided to any party shall be returned to the producing party or destroyed in all cases. In the event that a receiving party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information to the producing party, upon request, the receiving party shall certify in writing to the producing party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed.

Date: June 22, 2016 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Mary D. Long   
 Administrative Law Judge

**APPENDIX A**

**BEFORE THE  
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537349, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

Metropolitan Edison Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537352, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

Pennsylvania Electric Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537355, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

Pennsylvania Power Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, *et al.* : R-2016-2537359, *et al*.

:

v. :

:

West Penn Power Company :

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_(the receiving party).

The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order executed in the above-captioned proceedings that deals with the treatment of Proprietary Information. The undersigned

agrees to be bound by, and comply with, the terms and conditions of said Protective Order, which are incorporated herein by reference.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

SIGNATURE

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

PRINT NAME

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

ADDRESS

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

EMPLOYER

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_, 2016

**R-2016-2537349 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. METROPOLITAN EDISON COMPANYR-2016-2537352 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. PENNSYLVANIA ELECTRIC COMPANY R-2016-2537355 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. PENNSYLVANIA POWER COMPANY**

**R-2016-2537359 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. WEST PENN POWER COMPANY**

*Revised 6-20-16*

TORI L GIESLER ESQUIREFIRSTENERGY2800 POTTSVILLE PIKEPO BOX 16001READING PA 19612-6001**610.921.6658**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Metropolitan Edison Company, Pennsylvania Electric Company, Pennsylvania Power Company, and West Penn Power Company* THOMAS P GADSDEN ESQUIREANTHONY C DECUSATIS ESQUIRECATHERINE G

VASUDEVAN ESQUIREBROOKE E MCGLINN ESQUIREMORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP1701 MARKET STREETPHILADELPHIA PA 19103-2921**215.963.5034**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Metropolitan Edison Company, Pennsylvania Electric Company, Pennsylvania Power Company, and West Penn Power Company*

DARRYL A LAWRENCE ESQUIRE\*LAUREN M BURGE ESQUIREDAVID T EVRARD ESQUIRECANDIS A TUNILO ESQUIRE

OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

5TH FLOOR FORUM PLACE555 WALNUT STREETHARRISBURG PA 17101-1923**717.783.5048**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Office of Consumer Advocate*

**C-2016-2543247 -** *Metropolitan Edison Company*

**C-2016-2543266** *- Pennsylvania Electric Company***C-2016-2543268 -** *Pennsylvania Power Company*

**C-2016-2543315 -** *West Penn Power Company*

DANIEL G ASMUS ESQUIRE

OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE300 NORTH SECOND STREET

SUITE 202HARRISBURG PA 17101**717.783.2525**

*Representing Office of Small Business Advocate*

**C-2016-2544355 -** *Metropolitan Edison Company*

**C-2016-2544356 -** *Pennsylvania Electric Company***C-2016-2544358 -** *Pennsylvania Power Company*

**C-2016-2544359 -** *West Penn Power Company*

ALLISON C KASTER ESQUIREGINA L LAUFFER ESQUIRE

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION AND

ENFORCEMENT

PO BOX 3265HARRISBURG PA 17105-3265**717.783.7998**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing PUC Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement*

JOSEPH OTIS MINOTT ESQUIRELOGAN WELDE ESQUIRE

CLEAN AIR COUNCIL135 S 19TH STREETSUITE 300PHILADELPHIA PA 19103**215.567.4004**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Clean Air Council, Intervenor* SCOTT J RUBIN ESQUIRELAW OFFICE OF SCOTT J RUBIN333 OAK LANEBLOOMSBURG PA 17815-2036**570.387.1893**

*Accepts E-service*

*Intervenor Pennsylvania Electric Company*

*Representing International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 459*JOLINE PRICE ESQUIRE

PENNSYLVANIA UTILITY LAW PROJECT

118 LOCUST STREET

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717-236-9486**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing CAUSE-PA*

SUSAN E BRUCE ESQUIREMCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC100 PINE STREETP O BOX 1166HARRISBURG PA 17108-1166**717.237.5254**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing West Penn Power Industrial Intervenors*

**C-2016-2549413**- *West Penn Power Company*

GEORGE JUGOVIC JR ESQUIRE

ROBERT ALTENBURG ESQUIRE

CITIZENS FOR PENNSYLVANIA’S FUTURE

200 FIRST AVENUE

SUITE 200

PITTSBURGH PA 15222

**412.465.2785**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Citizens for Pennsylvania’s Future*

BARRY A NAUM ESQUIRE

DERRICK PRICE

WILLIAMSON ESQUIRE

SPILMAN THOMAS & BATTLE PLLC

1100 BENT CREEK BOULEVARD

SUITE 101

MECHANICSBURG PA 17050

**717-795-2742**

**717-795-2740**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Wal-Mart Stores East, LLP and Sam’s East, Inc.*

CHARIS MINCAVAGE ESQUIREVASILIKI KARANDRIKAS ESQUIRE

KENNETH STARK ESQUIRE

ALESSANDRA L HYLANDER

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK100 PINE STREETPO BOX 1166HARRISBURG PA 17108**717.237.5437**

*Accepts E-service*

*Representing Met-Ed Industrial Users Group and Penelec Industrial Users Group*

**C-2016-2549787 *-*** *Metropolitan Edison Company.*

**C-2016-2549792** *- Pennsylvania Electric Company*

GEORGE W KERR BOROUGH COUNCIL PRESIDENTWORTHINGTON BOROUGH

STREET LIGHTSPO BOX 66STREET LIGHT STREETWORTHINGTON PA 16262**724.297.3233**

*Worthington Borough Street Lights*

**C-2016-2548424** *- West Penn Power Company*

JANINE AND JEFF RIBBLETT

240 CHURCHILL STREET

JOHNSTOWN PA 15904

**814-262-0327**

*Complainants*

**C-2016-2550110 -** *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

ROBERT REDINGER JR1881 PAINTERS RUN RDPITTSBURGH PA 15241**412.221.7682**

*Complainant***C-2016-2542278** -*West Penn Power*

JEANETTE LIPPY3672 CENTENNIAL ROADHANOVER PA 17331**717.632.6474**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2549370** - *Metropolitan Edison Company*

DENNIS P MILLER

1446 RT 143

PO BOX 24

LENHARTSVILLE PA 19534

**610.562.3295**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551248 -***Metropolitan Edison Company*

KENNETH C SPRINGIRTH4720 CLIFF DRIVEERIE PA 16511**814.899.4202**

*Complainant***C-2016-2546231 -** *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

LARRY E COLE

74 E LAUREL STREET

MONROETON PA 18832

**570.268.5686**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551244** - *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

KENNETH L HALL

115 GROUSE LANE

MOSHANNON PA 16859

**814.280.1476**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551643** - *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

ERIC L HETRICK

143 WATERLOO STREET

FRIEDENS PA 15541

**814.279.5522**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551207** - *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

ROBERT MOORE

316 BRAZIL LANE

JOHNSTOWN PA 15909

**814.322.4950**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551236** - *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

REBECCA A STILES

372 EAST JACKSON STREET

JOHNSTOWN PA 15909

**814.410.3581**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551244** - *Pennsylvania Electric Company*

RICHARD COLLINS ENGINEER440 MONMOUTH DRIVECRANBERRY TOWNSHIP PA

16066-5756**724.742.0414**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2547484** *- Pennsylvania Power Company*

JOHN S MCDOWELL

51 WASSER ROAD

GREENVILLE PA 16125

**724.588.9127**

*Complainant*

**C-2016-2551614** – *Pennsylvania Power Company*