E-File

October 22, 2018

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
Commonwealth Keystone Building
400 North Street
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Re: Alternative Rulemaking Methodologies
Docket No. M-2015-2518883

Dear Ms. Chiavetta:

Enclosed for filing on behalf of PPL Electric Utilities Corporation ("PPL Electric") is an original of PPL Electric's Comments in the above-captioned proceeding. These Comments are being filed pursuant to the Proposed Policy Statement Order issued on May 23 2018 in the above captioned proceeding.

Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.11, the enclosed document is to be deemed filed on October 22, 2018, which is the date it was filed electronically using the Commission's E-filing system.

If you have any questions regarding these comments, please call me at (610)774-5696 or Bethany L. Johnson, Manager – Regulatory Operations for PPL Electric at (610) 774-7011.

Very truly yours,

Kimberly A. Klock

Enclosures

cc via email: Tanya J. McCloskey, Esquire
Mr. John R. Evans
R. Kanaskie, Esquire
Certificate of Service
CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

(Docket No. M-2015-2518883)

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following persons, in the manner indicated, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant).

VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

Elizabeth Rose Triscari
Ofc of Small Business Advocate
300 North Second Street, Ste. 202
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Shelby A. Linton-Keddie
Duquesne Light
800 North Third St, Suite 203
Harrisburg, PA 17102

John Finnigan
Environmental Defense Fund
128 Winding Brook Lane
Terace Park, OH 45174

Thomas J. Sniscak
Hawke McKeon and Sniscak LLP
100 N. Tenth Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Terrance J. Fitzpatrick
Energy Association of Pennsylvania
800 N. 3rd Street, Suite 205
Harrisburg, PA 17102

Donna M. J. Clark
Energy Association of Pennsylvania
800 N. 3rd Street, Suite 205
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Charis Mincavage
Teresa K. Schmittberger
Pamela C. Polacek
Susan E. Bruce
Adeolu A. Bakare
Alessandra L. Hylander
McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC
100 Pine Street
P.O. Box 1166
Harrisburg, PA 17108-1166

Eric Ackerman
Edison Electric Institute
701 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20004-2696

Tori L. Giesler
First Energy
2800 Pottsville Pike
PO Box 16001
Reading, PA 19612-6001

William H. Roberts, III
Peoples Natural Gas Company LLC
375 North Shore Drive
Pittsburgh, PA 15212

Eric D. Miller
KEEA
1501 Cherry Street
Philadelphia, PA 19102

Christopher M. Arfaa
Hawke McKeon & Sniscak LLP
100 North Tenth Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Richard Sedano
Regulatory Assistance Project
50 State Street Suite 3
Montpelier, VT 05602

Kristine E. Marsilio, Esq.
Barrett Sheridan, Esq.
Christine M. Hoover, Esq.
Darryl A. Lawrence, Esq.
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut St, 5th Fl, Forum Place
Harrisburg, PA 17101-1923
Julia Jazynka
Energy Freedom Coalition of America, LLC
601 13th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005

AARP Pennsylvania
30 North Third Street Suite 750
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Craig Williams
PECO Energy Company
2301 Market Street
Legal Department S23-1
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Mark C. Morrow
UGI Corporation
460 North Gulph Road
King of Prussia, PA 19406-2807

Maureen Geary Krowicki
National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation
PO Box 2081
11 State Street
Erie, PA 16512

Mark Szymbist
Natural Resources Defense Council
1152 15th Street NW
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20005

Alexander R. Stahl
Aqua PA
762 W. Lancaster Avenue
Bryn Mawr, PA 19010

Carrie B. Wright, Esq.
Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement
400 North Street, 2nd Floor West
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Theodore S. Robinson
Citizen Power
5274 Duncan Street
Pittsburg, PA 15201

Erik A. Ross
GMEREK Gov Relations
Locust Ct Bldg, 212 Locust St.
Suite 600
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Patrick Cicero
PA Utility Law Project
118 Locust Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101

Brendon Baatz, Sr. Manager
American Council for an Energy-Efficient Economy
529 14th Street NW, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20045

Thomas Schuster
Sierra Club
PO Box 51
Windber, PA 15963

Brian D. Buckley
Northeast Energy Efficiency Partnerships
91 Hartwell Ave
Lexington, MA 02421

Brandon J. Pierce
Philadelphia Gas Works
800 West Montgomery Avenue
Legal – 4th floor
Philadelphia, PA 19122

Michael Giberson
Strata
TTU Rawls College of Business
Box 42101
Lubbock, TX 79409
Jennifer Kefer, Directory
Alliance for Industrial Efficiency
2609 11th Street N
Arlington, VA 22201

Benjamin Stafford
Advanced Energy Economy Institute
1000 Vermont Ave. NW, 3rd floor
Washington, DC 20009

Susan Simms Marsh, Esq.
Pennsylvania American Water Company
800 Hersheypark Drive
Hershey, PA 17033

Joseph Minott, Esq.
Clean Air Council
135 South 19th Street, Suite 300
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Alexandra Rekkas, Sr. Associate
2101 Wilson Blvd., Suite 550
Arlington, VA 22201

Meagan B. Moore, Esq.
Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc.
121 Champion Way, Suite 100
Canonsburg, PA 15317

Date: 10/22/18

[Signature]
Kimberly A. Klock
I. BACKGROUND

On December 31, 2015, the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission ("Commission" or "PUC") issued a Secretarial Letter scheduling an *en banc* hearing to gather information regarding alternatives to traditional rate making principles for public utilities in Pennsylvania. *See* Secretarial Letter, December 31, 2015, Docket No. M-2015-2518883 ("Secretarial Letter"). On March 3, 2016, PPL Electric Utilities Corporation ("PPL Electric" or the "Company"), and a number of other invited parties, including researchers, energy companies and consumer advocates testified before the Commission at the *en banc* hearing. Following the *en banc* hearing, PPL Electric filed its testimony in this proceeding on March 16, 2016. The topics for the *en banc* hearing and subsequent comments were focused on 3 areas: 1) whether alternative ratemaking mechanisms\(^1\) encourage energy utilities to better implement energy efficiency and

---

\(^1\) "In the context of this proceeding, examples of alternative rate methodologies to be considered in order to encourage better implementation of energy efficiency and conservation programs include (1) revenue decoupling and other rate designs that separate some or all of a utility’s authorized revenue recovery from volumetric sales following determination or an overall revenue requirement; and/or (2) a utility’s performance with respect to energy efficiency and conservation as a part of the determination of the overall authorized revenue requirement." Alternative Ratemaking Methodologies Tentative Order issued March 2, 2017 ("Tentative Order"), p.1.
conservation programs; 2) whether such rate mechanisms are just and reasonable and in the public interest and 3) whether the benefits of implementing such rate mechanisms outweigh any associated costs. See Secretarial Letter p.1.

The Commission then issued a Tentative Order in this proceeding on March 2, 2017 seeking comments and reply comments addressing the potential processes to advance alternative rate methodologies that public utilities are facing. See Tentative Order p.1-2. PPL Electric submitted Comments to the Tentative Order on May 31, 2017 and Reply Comments on July 31, 2017.

On May 23, 2018, the Commission entered a Proposed Policy Statement Order on May 23, 2018 at Docket No. M-2015-2518883 ("Proposed Policy Statement Order") seeking comment in determining just and reasonable distribution rates that promote the efficient use of electricity, natural gas, or water, the use of distributed energy resources, reduce disincentives for such efficient use and resources, and ensure adequate revenue to maintain the safe and reliable operation of the distribution grid. See Proposed Policy Statement Order, p.2. The Commission notes that its proposal "may help customers and utilities move forward to minimized future long-term costs, allocate capital more efficiently, and achieve important policy objectives." Proposed Policy Statement Order, p. 2.

II. COMMENTS

PPL Electric is a public utility and an electric distribution company ("EDC") as defined in Sections 102 and 2803 of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Code, 66 Pa. C.S. §§ 102, 2803. PPL Electric furnishes electric distribution, transmission, and default supply services to approximately 1.4 million customers throughout its certificated service territory, which includes all or portions of 29 counties and encompasses approximately 10,000 square miles in eastern and central Pennsylvania. As a result, Sections §69.3301, 69.3302, 69.3303 and 1330 of the PA Public Utility Code and any issues related to those sections pertain to the Company.

A. General

PPL Electric appreciates the Commission’s work with regard to alternative ratemaking in Pennsylvania and has been active in providing comments with regard to the topics requested. However, the confluence of Act 58 and the Fixed Utility Distribution Rates Policy Statement has created some fundamental conflicts in the two proceedings. The Commission proceeding at this instance begins with a policy statement focused on utilities promoting the efficient use of electricity and other resources, reducing utility disincentives promoting these objectives and avoiding future capital investment. In fact, the very definition of alternative rate methodologies in the proceeding includes “a utility’s performance with respect to energy efficiency and conservation as part of the determination of the overall authorized revenue requirement.” Proposed Policy Statement Order, p. 1. While PPL Electric is generally supportive of energy efficiency efforts, the Company believes that it is inappropriate to define the foundation of alternative ratemaking mechanisms, the state’s policy regarding ratemaking fundamentals, and Section 1308 rate cases around adoption of energy efficiency.

The very policy position that guides the remainder of the proposed policy statement is flawed and in conflict with the recently passed Act 58 and the Commission’s own interpretation
of the Declaration of Policy outlined in Section 1330(a). For this reason, PPL Electric recommends either a revision or reconciliation of the two proceedings in favor of the path set forth with the passage of Act 58 and the Act 58 TIO. The Company believes this will allow stakeholders to focus resources and provide for a more comprehensive examination of implementation of alternative ratemaking mechanisms as provided for under Act 58. Notwithstanding this recommendation, PPL Electric offers the following, more specific, Comments.

B. Discussion

The Proposed Policy Statement Order outlines 7 different alternative ratemaking mechanisms. PPL Electric agrees that several of the items highlighted (i.e. revenue decoupling, lost revenue adjustments, multi-year rate plans, demand-side management performance incentives) may be considered alternative ratemaking mechanisms; such items are also further defined under Act 58 which now provides the PUC with clear authority to approve such mechanisms when proposed in a Section 1308 base rate case proceeding. Other items (i.e., straight fixed/variable pricing, demand charges, standby and backup charges) are rate designs, which are used by many utilities in various ways today. The determination of just and reasonable rates through rate design is well established in existing regulations based on fundamental ratemaking principles. Additionally, the Act 58 TIO proposes that Section 1308 is the appropriate process for assessment of proposed alternative ratemaking mechanisms as defined by Act 58, which include the 7 items identified in the Proposed Policy Statement Order.

PPL Electric believes that the Commission is attempting to recognize the potential opportunities of alternative mechanisms in its mention of combining various mechanisms, such as multi-year rate plans that include a performance-based incentive and charges that are reflective of the distribution costs for certain customers with similar characteristics or geographic
areas. In proposed §69.3301 Purpose and Scope, the Commission also notes the desire to avoid future capital investments. PPL Electric believes that deferral of typical capital investment or the transfer of that capital investment to innovative technologies (such as energy storage, demand response and voltage optimization) should be entertained as better options available under Act 58 than strict avoidance of capital investment. These non-wires alternatives will allow utilities to more efficiently invest in the system optimizing grid utilization and keep customer rates reasonable. This deferral or transfer of capital investment also better aligns with the interpretation of Section 1330(a) Declaration of Policy outlined in the Commission’s Act 58 TIO. The Company commends the Commission for its strategic view of possibilities, but believes it is premature to attempt to apply a level of specificity to complex issues that are not yet ripe for such level of granularity.

C. Section 69.3301 Purpose and Scope

As explained previously, PPL Electric believes that the Policy and Scope as outlined in the proposed policy statement are in conflict with the interpretation of Section 1330(a) Declaration of Policy in the Act 58 TIO. Without a reconciliation of the fundamental policy position on alternative ratemaking mechanisms, the Company believes that Pennsylvania will find itself handcuffed when attempting to move forward progressively and achieve any alternative ratemaking goals of any stakeholders.

D. Section 69.3302 Distribution Rate Considerations

This section addresses the 13 items for consideration when determining just and reasonable rates that meet the policy objection set forth in Section 69.3301. While appreciative of the effort to raise awareness of the some of the considerations and interest in specific areas of customer impacts, this section adds more confusion than clarity. The specificity of the considerations lends itself to obligate a utility to develop evidence defending how, when, and
where it addressed each of these 13 items either within or beyond the requirements in 52 Pa. Code §§ 53.52 and 53.53 (pertaining to the documentation required when filing a Section 1308 base rate case proceeding). The Commission further encourages parties to comment on specific rate design options. Again, as a matter of policy, the Company believes that it is inappropriate to attempt to define rate design in this context. Rate design, often part art and part science, is ultimately a balance of the utility’s unique financial position at the time of its rate case, its specific customer base and demographics, the priorities of the parties to the case and the emerging issues of the time. To attempt to codify particular methods lends itself to narrowly defined conditions that will become quickly outdated in a rapidly changing industry.

E. Section 69.3303 Illustration of possible distribution ratemaking and rate design options for the energy industry.

While the Commission notes extensively throughout the Proposed Policy Statement Order its openness to other issues for consideration and the guidelines are not meant to be exclusive, PPL Electric believes that mere inclusion of “Illustrations” in the proposed policy statement itself signals clear direction for preference and acceptance of said illustrations. A proposal for any variation of those illustrations will likely be fraught with opposition as not being in line with the Commission’s policy statement. If the intent is truly to present examples and not recommendations, PPL Electric recommends removing Section 69.3303 from the proposed policy statement.

III. CONCLUSION

In closing, PPL Electric is supportive of the Commission’s work with regard to Alternative Ratemaking and appreciates the opportunity to provide these Comments. The Company is appreciative of the significant effort applied to the detailed discussion and development of the proposed policy statement. It is evident that even at the instant proceeding,
which began in 2015 and has continued through the recent Act 58 TIO, that general policy
objectives may shift. It is for this reason that the Company suggests that the details of
implementation included in the proposed policy statement be left to each utility to propose in an
alternative ratemaking proposal submitted under Section 1308 base rate case proceedings as
established under Act 58.

PPL Electric Utilities Corporation respectfully requests that the Commission take these
Comments into consideration in preparing its Final Order.

Respectfully submitted,

[Signature]

Kimberly A. Klock (ID #89716)
PPL Services Corporation
Two North Ninth Street
Allentown, PA 18101
Voice: 610-774-5696
Fax: 610-774-4102
E-mail: klock@pplweb.com

Date: October 22, 2018

Counsel for PPL Electric Utilities Corporation