

17 North Second Street 12th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1601 717-731-1970 Main 717-731-1985 Main Fax www.postschell.com

Garrett P. Lent Associate

glent@postschell.com 717-612-6032 Direct 717-731-1979 Direct Fax File #: 166407

July 8, 2019

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission Commonwealth Keystone Building 400 North Street, 2nd Floor North P.O. Box 3265 Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265

Re: Application of Duquesne Light Company filed Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code Chapter 57, Subchapter G, for Approval of the Siting and Construction of the 138 kV Transmission Lines Associated with the Brunot Island-Crescent Project in the City of Pittsburgh, McKees Rocks Borough, Kennedy Township, Robinson Township, Moon Township, and Crescent Township, Allegheny County, Pennsylvania Docket No. A-2019-3008589

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

Enclosed for filing is the Answer of Duquesne Light Company to the Protest of Richard I. Gable.

Copies are being provided per the attached Certificate of Service.

Sincerely, Garrett P. Lent GPL/kls Enclosures

cc: Certificate of Service

BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Application of Duquesne Light Company : filed Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code Chapter 57, : Subchapter G, for Approval of the Siting and : Construction of the 138 kV Transmission Lines Associated with the Brunot Island -Crescent Project in the City of Pittsburgh, Rocks Borough, Kennedy McKees Township, Moon Township, Robinson Crescent Township, Township, and Allegheny County, Pennsylvania

Docket No. A-2019-3008589

Protest of Richard I. Gable

ANSWER OF DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY TO THE PROTEST OF RICHARD I. GABLE

:

:

TO THE HONORABLE ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE MARY D. LONG:

Duquesne Light Company ("Duquesne Light" or the "Company") files this Answer to Protest filed by Richard I. Gable ("Protestant")¹ pursuant to Section 5.61 of the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission's ("Commission") regulations, 52 Pa. Code § 5.61. Although the Commission's regulations do not require an answer to a Protest, Duquesne Light responds to each of the separately-numbered paragraphs of the Gable Protest as follows:

ANSWER

- 1. Admitted.
- 2. Admitted.
- 3. Admitted.

¹ Duquesne Light received a Formal Complaint from the Protestant on June 18, 2019. No docket number has been assigned to the pleading. As the pleading contests and opposes the electric transmission line siting application at Docket No. A-2019-3008589, Duquesne Light is treating the pleading as a Protest to the Application.

4. Admitted in part and denied in part. It is admitted Duquesne Light recently filed: (1) "Application of Duquesne Light Company filed Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code Chapter 57, Subchapter G, for Approval of the Siting and Construction of the 138 kV Transmission Lines Associated with the Brunot Island – Crescent Project in the City of Pittsburgh, McKees Rocks Borough, Kennedy Township, Robinson Township, Moon Township, and Crescent Township, Allegheny County, Pennsylvania," at Docket No. A-2019-3008589 ("BI-Crescent Full Siting Application"); and (2) "Application of Duquesne Light Company Under 15 Pa.C.S. § 1511(c) For A Finding and Determination That the Service to be Furnished by the Applicant Through Its Proposed Exercise of the Power of Eminent Domain to Acquire a Certain Portion of the Lands of George N. Schaefer of Moon Township, Allegheny County, Pennsylvania for the Siting and Construction of Transmission Lines Associated with the Proposed Brunot Island – Crescent Project is Necessary or Proper for the Service, Accommodation, Convenience, or Safety of the Public," at Docket No. A-2019-3008652 ("Schaefer Condemnation Application").²

It is denied that route selected for the BI-Crescent Project is "too close to existing and will damage the health of" the Protestant "and those within the EMF range." By way of further response, Duquesne Light Company described its EMF practices and policies in Attachment 11 - Design Criteria and Safety Practices to the BI-Crescent Full Siting Application and incorporates the information contained therein into this Answer. In addition, Duquesne Light thoroughly evaluated the potential impacts of the BI-Crescent Project as detailed in Attachment 3 – Environmental Assessment and Line Route Study and Duquesne Light Statement No. 2, the

² While the Protest references the Schaefer Condemnation Application and/or its docket number, Duquesne Light denies that the Protestants are a property owner of record for the subject property.

direct testimony of Aimee Kay, both of which were attached to the BI-Crescent Full Siting Application and are incorporated by reference herein.

5. Denied. The averments contained in Paragraph 5 (referencing the requests for relief on page 2 of 2 of the attachment to the Protest) of the Protest are requests for relief to which no responsive pleading is required. To the extent a response is deemed necessary, Duquesne Light denies that the Protestants are entitled to the relief requested.

By way of further response, Duquesne Light incorporates Paragraphs 2 through 4, *supra*, as though fully set forth herein.

6. Paragraph 6 of the Protest relates to Protection from Abuse orders, to which no responsive pleading is required.

7. Admitted in part and denied in part. It is admitted that the Protest is not an appeal from a decision of the Commission's Bureau of Consumer Services. It is also admitted that the Protestant has contacted a Duquesne Light representative regarding the subject matter of the Protest. By way of further response, Duquesne Light has attempted to be responsive to all contacts and communications from the Protestant and has treated the Protestant in the same respectful and fair manner that it treats all other customers.

8. Paragraph 8 of the Protest pertains to the Protestant's legal representation, to which no responsive pleading is required.

9. Paragraph 9 sets forth the verification and signature, to which no responsive pleading is required.

10. Paragraph 10 sets forth the instructions for filing the Protest, to which no responsive pleading is required.

18922503v2

3

WHEREFORE, Duquesne Light Company respectfully requests that the Protest of Richard I. Gable be denied and with prejudice as against Duquesne Light.

Respectfully submitted,

Tishekia William (PA ID # 208997) Emily Farah (PA ID # 322559) Duquesne Light Company 411 Seventh Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15230 E-mail: twilliams@duqlight.com efarah@duqlight.com Anthony D Kanagy (PA ID # 85522) Garrett P. Lent (PA ID # 321566) Post & Schell, P.C. 17 North Second Street 12th Floor Harrisburg, PA 17101-1601 Voice: 717-731-1970 Fax: 717-731-1985 E-mail: akanagy@postschell.com E-mail: glent@postschell.com

Date: July 8, 2019

•3

Attorneys for Duquesne Light Company

BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Application of Duquesne Light Company : filed Pursuant to 52 Pa. Code Chapter 57, : Subchapter G, for Approval of the Siting and : Construction of the 138 kV Transmission : Lines Associated with the **Brunot Island** – : **Crescent Project** in the City of Pittsburgh, : McKees Rocks Borough, Kennedy Township, : Robinson Township, Moon Township, and : Crescent Township, Allegheny County, : Pennsylvania

Protest of Richard I. Gable

Docket No. A-2019-3008589

VERIFICATION

:

:

I, <u>MEENAM SHYu</u>, hereby state that the facts above set forth are true and correct (or are true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief) and that I expect to be able to prove the same at a hearing held in this matter. I understand that the statements herein are made subject to the penalties of 18 Pa.C.S. § 4904 (relating to unsworn falsification to authorities).

Men &

Dated:

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE (A-2019-3008589 and A-2019-3008652)

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following persons, in the manner indicated, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a participant).

VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

Michael Syme Partner Fox Rothschild LLP 500 Grant Street Suite 2500 Pittsburgh, PA 15219

George N. Schaefer Schaefer Boulevard Coraopolis, PA 15108

John P. Crowe Jennifer A. Crowe 1123 Juanita Drive Coraopolis, PA 15108

Victoria Adams 306 Konter Road Coraopolis, PA 15108

Aaron Siegel Rebecca Siegel 110 Wynview Drive Coraopolis, PA 15108

Dennis J. Zona Jeanne M. Zona 108 Wynview Drive Coraopolis, PA 15108

Dated: July 8, 2019

Richard I. Gable 126 Flaugherty Run Road Coraopolis, PA 15108

Zachariah R. Nave P.O. Box 524 Clarion, PA 16214

Zachariah R. Nave 7 McGovern Boulevard Crescent, PA 15046

Folezia A. Marinkovic Steve M. Marinkovic 205 Purdy Road Crescent, PA 15046

Cynthia Chamberlin Wilson Patrick Wilson 9 McGovern Boulevard Crescent, PA 15046

Joseph G. and Suzanne L. Rabosky 104 Wynview Drive Coraopolis, PA 15108

Garrett P