**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission : R-2020-3018835

Office of Consumer Advocate : C-2020-3019702

Office of Small Business Advocate : C-2020-3019714

Columbia Industrial Intervenors : C-2020-3020105

Dr. Richard Collins : C-2020-3020207

Ionut R. Ilie : C-2020-3020498

Pennsylvania State University : C-2020-3020666

:

v. :

:

Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc. :

**POST-HEARING ORDER**

Admitting Evidence Introduced

at Evidentiary Hearing

and

Closing the Hearing Record

On April 24, 2020, Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc. (Columbia) filed Supplement No. 307 to Tariff Gas Pa. P.U.C. No. 9 at Docket No. R-2020-3018835, with an effective date of January 23, 2021. Columbia proposed to increase overall rates by approximately $100.4 million per year, or 17.54% over present revenues. Columbia’s proposal, if granted, would increase the average residential customer bill from $87.57 to $103.19, or by approximately 17.84%. Columbia also proposed to increase the residential fixed monthly charge from $16.75 to $23.00.

On September 24, 2020, the presiding officer conducted the evidentiary hearing. During the evidentiary hearing, various parties identified and moved to admit evidence in the form of written statements and exhibits. All parties present waived the right to cross-examine the evidence. Accordingly, the evidence was marked and admitted into the hearing record by order of the presiding officer, without objection from any party.

Due to the ongoing impact of the Coronavirus 2019 (COVID19) pandemic on the Commission’s normal operations,[[1]](#footnote-1) the presiding officer directed the parties submitting evidence to electronically file the evidence with the Commission within two weeks of the date of this Post-Hearing Order along with a cover letter which notes the admission at the evidentiary hearing on September 24, 2020 and the issuance of the Post-Hearing Order.

AND NOW, having received evidence into the hearing record from Columbia Gas plus the statutory advocates and other active parties on September 4, 2020, without an objection; and

FURTHER, because the Commission continues to operate remotely and electronically; and

FURTHER, because the admitted evidence must be included in the hearing record for this proceeding; and

FURTHER, because no further hearing is to be scheduled in this proceeding.

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. That the hearing record in the proceeding listed above, at Docket   
   No. R-2020-3018835, and the related docket numbers listed above, is closed.

2. That all parties which sponsored and moved for the admission of the evidence at the evidentiary hearing conducted on September 24, 2020, shall reference this Post-Hearing Order when filing electronically (through eFile) with the Commission all of the items listed in Appendix A, attached, within 14 days of the date of this Order.

3. That any party wishing to place evidence into the hearing record, when the evidence is marked as “Confidential”, “Highly Confidential” or “Proprietary”, shall ensure the evidence is clearly marked as “Confidential”, “Highly Confidential” or “Proprietary “and shall reference this Post-Hearing Order when electronically mailing the evidence directly to the Commission’s Secretary, Rosemary Chiavetta, for inclusion in the Commission’s hearing record in a protected file.

4. That main briefs are due on or before October 16, 2020, and reply briefs are due on or before October 30, 2020. Any settlement documents, whether settled in whole or in part, are due on or before October 30, 2020, with Statements in Support from all signatories.

5. That all briefs must comply with the instructions attached hereto as Appendix B.

6. That the Recommended Decision in this case shall be prepared and issued after the receipt of main briefs and reply briefs.

Date: September 25, 2020 /s/

Katrina L. Dunderdale

Administrative Law Judge

Appendix A

**Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc.**

The April 24, 2020 initial filing, which included:

- Exhibits 1-17, 101-117 and 400-414

- Standard Data Responses COS 1-21, ROR 1-23 and RR 1-55

Columbia Statement No. 1, the Direct Testimony of Michael Huwar, and

Exhibit MWH-1, as adopted by Andrew Tubbs

Columbia Statement No. 1-SR, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Andrew Tubbs

Columbia Statement No. 1-R, the Redacted Rebuttal Testimony of Andrew Tubbs

and Exhibits AST-1R, AST-2R, AST-3R, AST-4R, AST-5R,

AST-6R and AST-11R, dated September 24, 2020

**Highly Confidential** Columbia Statement No. 1-RJ, the Redacted Rejoinder

Testimony of Andrew Tubbs, dated September 24, 2020

Columbia Statement No. 2, the Direct Testimony of Mahamadou Bikienga

Columbia Statement No. 3, the Direct Testimony of Melissa Bell

and Exhibits MJB-1 through MJB-7

Columbia Statement No. 3-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Melissa Bell

and Exhibits MJB-1R through MJB-2R

Columbia Statement No. 4, the Direct Testimony of Kelly Miller

and Exhibit KKM-1

Columbia Statement No. 4-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Kelly Miller and

Exhibits KKM-1R, **Confidential** Exhibit KKM-2R,

Exhibit KKM-3R and Exhibit KKM-4R

Columbia Statement No. 5, the Direct Testimony of John Spanos and

Exhibit JJS-1

Columbia Statement No. 5-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of John Spanos

Columbia Statement No. 6, the Direct Testimony of Nicole Shultz

and Exhibits NMS-1 through NMS-4

Columbia Statement No. 6-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Nicole Shultz

Columbia Statement No. 7, the Direct Testimony of Michael Davidson

Columbia Statement No. 7-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Michael Davidson

and Exhibits MJD-1R through MJD-3R

Columbia Statement No. 8, the Direct Testimony of Paul Moul and

Exhibit PRM-1

Columbia Statement No. 8-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Paul Moul

and Exhibits PRM-1R, PRM-2R and updated Exhibit 400

Columbia Statement No. 8-SR, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Paul Moul

Columbia Statement No. 9, the Direct Testimony of Nancy Krajovic and

Exhibit No. NJDK-1

Columbia Statement No. 9-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Nancy Krajovicb

and Exhibits NJDK-1R through NJDK-7R and 2nd revised

Exhibit 104

Columbia Statement No. 10, the Direct Testimony of Jennifer Harding

Columbia Statement No. 11, the Direct Testimony of Chad Notestone

and Exhibits CEN-1 through CEN-4

Columbia Statement No. 11-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Chad Notestone

Columbia Statement No. 12, the Direct Testimony of Shirley Bardes Hasson

Columbia Statement No. 12-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Shirley Bardes Hasson

and Exhibits SBH-1R and SBH-2R

Columbia Statement No. 13, the Direct Testimony of Deborah Davis

Columbia Statement No. 13-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Deborah Davis

and Exhibits DAD-1R and DAD-2R

Columbia Statement No. 13-SR, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Deborah Davis

Columbia Statement No. 14, the Direct Testimony of Robert Kitchell

Columbia Statement No. 14-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Robert Kitchell

Columbia Statement No. 15-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Kimberly Cartella

Columbia Statement No. 16-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of James Cawley

and Exhibits JHC-1 and JHC-2

Columbia Statement No. 16-RJ, the Rejoinder Testimony of James Cawley

and Exhibits JHC-3 and JHC-4

Columbia Statement No. 17-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Toby Bishop

and Exhibit TB-1

Columbia Exhibit NJDK-1RJ, as provided for in the stipulation between

Columbia and the Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement,

dated September 21, 2020

Also, Columbia Gas "GAS-RR-026-Rev," filed August 26, 2020, which revises GAS-RR-026 included with the Company’s initial filing

**Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement**

I&E Statement No. 1: the Direct Testimony of John Zalesky

I&E Exhibit No. 1: the Exhibit to accompany the Direct Testimony

of John Zalesky (**Proprietary**)

I&E Exhibit No. 1: the Exhibit to accompany the Direct Testimony

of John Zalesky (**Non-Proprietary**)

I&E Statement No. 1-SR: the Surrebuttal Testimony of John Zalesky with the

Verification Statement of John Zalesky

I&E Statement No. 2: the Direct Testimony of Christopher Keller and

I&E Exhibit No. 2

I&E Statement No. 2-SR: the Surrebuttal Testimony of Christopher Keller with

the Verification Statement of Christopher Keller

I&E Statement No. 3: the Direct Testimony of Ethan H. Cline

I&E Statement No. 3-SR: the Surrebuttal Testimony of Ethan H. Cline

with the Verification Statement of Ethan H. Cline

I&E Statement No. 4: the Direct Testimony of Lassine Niambele and

I&E Exhibit No. 4

I&E Statement No. 4-SR: the Surrebuttal Testimony of Lassine Niambele with

the Verification Statement of Lassine Niambele\

I&E Statement No. 5: the Direct Testimony of Kokou M. Apetoh and I&E

Exhibit No. 5

I&E Statement No. 5-SR: the Surrebuttal Testimony of Kokou M. Apetoh with

the Verification Statement of Kokou M. Apetoh

**The Coalition for Affordable Utility Services and Energy Efficiency in Pennsylvania**

CAUSE-PA Statement 1, the Direct Testimony of Mitchell Miller with

Appendix A: Resume of Mitchell Miller

Appendix B: Cited Responses to Interrogatories

Appendix C: Energy Assistance Summary Report, May 9, 2020

p. 68 of 136

CAUSE-PA Statement 1-SR, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Mitchell Miller

**Office of Consumer Advocate**

OCA Statement No. 1, the Direct Testimony of Mr. Scott J. Rubin, with

Appendix A and Exhibits SJR-1 through SJR-5

OCA Statement No. 1-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Scott J. Rubin, and

Exhibit SJR-6S.

OCA Statement No. 2, the Direct Testimony of Mr. David J. Effron, and

Appendix 1

OCA Statement No. 2-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony of David J. Effron, and

Tables I and II, Schedules A, B, B-1, C, C-1, C-1.1, C-2, C-3, C-4, and D

OCA Statement No. 3, the Direct Testimony of Mr. Kevin W. O’Donnell, and

Appendix A and Exhibits KWO-1 through KWO-5.

OCA Statement No. 3-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Kevin W. O’Donnell

OCA Statement No. 3-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Kevin W. O’Donnell and

Exhibits KWO-1S through KWO-4S

OCA Statement No. 4, the Direct Testimony of Mr. Jerome D. Mierzwa and

Exhibits JDM-1 through JDM-3

OCA Statement No. 4-R, the Rebuttal Testimony of Jerome D. Mierzwa

OCA Statement No. 4-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Jerome D. Mierzwa

OCA Statement No. 5, the Direct Testimony of Mr. Roger D. Colton, with

Appendix A and Exhibits RDC-1 through RDC-6

OCA Statement No. 5-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony of Roger D. Colton

**Office of Small Business Advocate**

OSBA Statement No. 1, theDirect Testimony and Exhibits of Robert D. Knecht,

**Public Version**, with Exhibits IEc-1 through IEc-2

OSBA Statement No. 1, the Direct Testimony and Exhibits of Robert D. Knecht,

**Highly Confidential Version** with Exhibits IEc-1 through IEc-2

OSBA Statement No. 1-R, theRebuttal Testimony and Exhibit of

Robert D. Knecht with Exhibit IEc-R1

OSBA Statement No. 1-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony and Exhibit of

Robert D. Knecht, **Public Version** with Exhibit IEc-S1

OSBA Statement No.1-S, the Surrebuttal Testimony and Exhibit of

Robert D. Knecht, **Highly Confidential Version** with Exhibit IEc-S1

**Columbia Industrial Intervenors (CII)**

CII Statement No. 1 – Direct Testimony of Frank Plank

CII Statement No. 1-R – Rebuttal Testimony of Frank Plank

Verification of CII Witness Frank Plank

**Community Action Association of Pennsylvania**

CAAP Statement No. 1 – the Direct Testimony of Susan A. Moore

CAAP Statement No. 1-R – the Rebuttal Testimony of Susan A. Moore

Verification of Susan A. Moore

**Pennsylvania State University**

PSU St. No. 1 – the Direct Testimony of James Crist with PSU Exhibit No. D-1

and the *Curriculum Vitae* of James Crist

PSU St. No. 1-R – Rebuttal Testimony of James Crist

PSU St. No. 1-SR – Surrebuttal Testimony of James Crist

Appendix B

Special Instructions for Briefs and Exceptions

in Major General Rate Increase Proceedings

1. Each brief shall follow the general organization shown in the attached standardized format.

2. Each brief shall contain a table of contents with page references to a summary of argument and to each topic addressed in the argument.

3. Adjustments contained in each brief shall:

a. be based on a specific test year, to be selected before the close of the record;

b. be complete and self-contained, include accurate reference to the appropriate record sources, be on a before-income-tax basis (never on a net income or revenue requirement basis) and be on a consistent jurisdictional basis (if record support cannot be located, the adjustment may/will be rejected);

c. be detailed to demonstrate the step-by-step calculation of that adjustment together with appropriate accurate record references (once again, if the record support cannot be located for the necessary steps, the adjustment may/will be rejected);

d. include concomitant rate base, revenue, expense, depreciation expense, and tax (i.e., taxes other, State Income, and federal Income) adjustments set forth, together with the details of their calculation;

e. include within the brief calculations which are the basis for proposed adjustments, but which are incomplete in the record.

4. Tables showing all proposed rate base and income adjustments, organized as shown in the attached Table I and Table II, shall be submitted with each brief which includes such adjustments.

a. The starting point of Table I “Income Summary” shall be the utility’s final pro forma showing at present rates. The ALJ shall specify the starting point to be the most recent update admitted into evidence. The update, admission, and ALJ ruling shall be cited on the table.

b. The effect of deferred or accrued taxes on the various tax adjustments presented in Table II “Summary of Adjustments” shall be indicated by a footnote.

5. The following schedules shall be submitted with each brief.

a. A schedule showing the precise derivation of any adjustment to proposed cash working capital allowance.

i. The schedule describing an adjustment to a Utility’s claim for Cash Working Capital shall separately list (1) adjustments originating from Table II “Summary of Adjustments” and (2) adjustments resulting from the proposed revenue increase. Any effect on deferred and/or accrued taxes shall be shown in a separate column or footnote.

ii. Net Revenue and Expense Lag Days for all Cash Working Capital Adjustments shall be calculated to at least one decimal place.

b. A schedule showing all tax and jurisdictional allocation factors utilized (any deviations from standard or obvious factors should be explained on the schedule on in the brief).

c. A schedule listing, for the party or parties filing the brief, each exhibit or other document admitted into the record, along with the date the document was identified and the date the document was admitted.

6. Rate structure proposals shall be reasonably specific and explicit, shall, as appropriate, refer accurately to record support and shall be summarized at the end of the “Rate Structure” topic heading of each brief.

7. Parties shall, as feasible and appropriate, discuss alternative rate design proposals for overall rate increases at and below the requested increase.

8. The Commission requires, in all electric utility rate proceedings, subsequent to its Order at Docket No. I-900005, entered December 1, 1993, that issues of demand-side management and integrated resource planning be addressed.

9. Regarding the filing of exceptions, the following instructions are provided:

a. Each exception shall be separately identified and, as necessary, discussed.

b. Each exception shall include, before any discussion is provided, the following elements (see examples attached):

i. a reference to the relevant part of the Recommended Decision, at least to the relevant pages;

ii. a reference to related discussions in the excepting party’s brief and, as appropriate, to other briefs; and

iii. a concise statement of the exception.

c. The exceptions shall follow the order of presentation provided in the table of contents to the Recommended Decision.

d. If a party takes exception concerning a topic not included within the Recommended Decision or the table of contents thereto, the appropriate exception shall be included at the end of the appropriate major topic heading (such as “Rate Base” or “Expenses”).

e. If a party seeks to correct computations associated with the Recommended Decision, replacement computations, with source references to briefs or the record, shall be provided.

Standardized Brief Format for

General Rate Increase Proceedings

I. Introduction

II. Summary of Argument

III. Rate Base

A. Fair Value

B. Plant in Service

C. Depreciation Reserve

D. Additions to Rate Base

E. Deductions from Rate Base

F. Conclusion

IV. Revenues

V. Expenses

VI. Taxes

VII. Rate of Return

VIII. Miscellaneous Issue

IX. Rate Structure

A. Cost of Service

B. Revenue Allocation

C. Tariff Structure

D. Summary and Alternatives

X. Conclusion

Note: Appropriate modifications may be made. For instance, a party might add “Affiliated Interest Expenses” as a major topic heading or might brief only rate structure and not use other topic headings. A summary and alternatives should be provided under “Rate Structure” but the “Rate Base” and “Rate Structure” formats shown may be modified, as appropriate. Additional subheadings should be used, as appropriate.

TABLE I

Income Summary

($000)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | Pro Forma  Present  Rates | Recommended  Adjustments | Adjusted  Present  Rates | Revenue  Adjustment | Total  Allowable  Revenues |
|  | $ | $ | $ | $ | $ |

Operating Revenues

Deductions:

O&M Expenses

Depreciation

Taxes:

State

Federal

Other

Total Deductions

Net Income Available for Return

Rate Base

Recommended Rate of Return

TABLE II

Summary of Adjustments

($000)

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Recommended  Adjustments | Exhibit  Reference | Rate  Base  Effect | Revenue  Effect | Expense  Effect | Depreciation  Effect | Effect  Upon  Taxes -  Other | State  Tax  Effect | Federal  Tax  Effect |
|  |  | $ | $ | $ | $ | $ | $ | $ |

Total Adjustments

Company Rate Base

Recommended Rate Base

**R-2020-3018835 et al - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. COLUMBIA GAS OF PENNSYLVANIA INC***Revised 9/14/20*

MICHAEL W HASSELL ESQUIRELINDSAY A BERKSTRESSER ESQUIRE

POST & SCHELL PC17 NORTH SECOND STREET 12TH FLOORHARRISBURG PA 17101-1601**717-612-6029717-612-6021**

**Accepts eService**

*Representing Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc.*

MEAGAN B MOORE ESQUIRENISOURCE CORPORATE SERVICES CO

121 CHAMPION WAYSUITE 100CANONSBURG PA 15317**724-416-6347Accepts eService**

*Representing Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc.*

AMY E HIRAKIS ESQUIRENISOURCE CORPORATE SERVICES CO

800 NORTH 3RD STREET STE 204HARRISBURG PA 17102 PA 18101**717-233-1351Accepts eService**

*Representing Columbia Gas of Pennsylvania, Inc.*

ERIKA MCLAIN ESQUIREPA PUC BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION AND ENFORCEMENT   
400 NORTH STREET  
HARRISBURG PA 17120  
**717-783-6170Accepts eService**

STEVEN GRAY ESQUIREOFFICE SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE300 NORTH SECOND ST SUITE 202HARRISBURG PA 17101**717-783-2525**

[sgray@pa.gov](mailto:sgray@pa.gov)

*Complainant C-2020-3019702*

\*LAURA ANTINUCCI ESQUIRE\*BARRETT SHERIDAN ESQUIRE\*CHRISTY APPLEBY

DARRYL LAWRENCE ESQUIREOFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATEFORUM PLACE 5TH FLOOR 555 WALNUT STREETHARRISBURG PA 17101-1923**717-783-5048**

\***Accepts eService**

[DLawrence@paoca.org](mailto:DLawrence@paoca.org)

*Complainant C-2020-3019714*CHARIS MINCAVAGE ESQUIRE

KENNETH R STARK ESQUIRE

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK

100 PINE STREET

PO BOX 1166

HARRISBURG PA 17108-1166

**717-232-8000**

**717-237-5300**

**Accepts eService**

*Representing Columbia Industrial Intervenors*

*Complainant C-2020-3020105*

DR RICHARD COLLINS

440 MONMOUTH DRIVE

CRANBERRY TOWNSHIP PA 16066-5756

**724-742-0414**

**Accepts eService**

*Complainant C-2020-3020207*

IONUT R ILIE

255 MCBATH STREET

STATE COLLEGE PA 16801

**814-409-9305**

**Accepts eService**

*Complainant C-2020-3020498*

THOMAS J SNISCAK, ESQUIRE

WHITNEY E SNYDER ESQUIRE

HAWKE MCKEON & SNISCAK LLP

100 NORTH TENTH STREET

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717- 236-1300**

**Accepts eService**

*Complainant C-2020-3020666*

*Representing the Pennsylvania State University*

ELIZABETH R MARX ESQUIRERIA M PEREIRA ESQUIRE

JOHN W SWEET ESQUIRE

PENNSYLVANIA UTILITY LAW PROJECT

118 LOCUST STREET

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717-236-9486**

**Accepts eService**

*Representing CAUSE-PA*

*Intervenor*

JOSEPH L VULLO ESQUIREBURKE VULLO REILLY ROBERTS1460 WYOMING AVENUEFORTY FORT PA 18704**570-288-6441Accepts eService**

*Representing Community Action Association of Pennsylvania*

*Intervenor*

1. On March 16, 2020, the Commission’s offices closed by Order of Governor Tom Wolf due to the COVID19 pandemic. The offices remain closed through the date of this Post-Hearing Order and Commission staff continue to telework. Commission staff are unable to receive and process items sent through the mail, including evidence admitted into the hearing record. Business is conducted electronically and remotely. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)