



Whitney E. Snyder
(717) 236-1300 x260
wesnyder@hmslegal.com

Thomas J. Sniscak
(717) 236-1300 x224
tjsniscak@hmslegal.com

Phillip D. Demanchick Jr.
(717) 236-1300 x225
pddemanchick@hmslegal.com

100 North Tenth Street, Harrisburg, PA 17101 Phone: 717.236.1300 Fax: 717.236.4841 www.hmslegal.com

June 27, 2023

By Electronic Filing

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
Commonwealth Keystone Building
400 North Street, 2nd Floor (filing room)
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Re: Columbia Water Company; 2023 General Base Rate Increase Filing;
Docket No. R-2023-3040258; **MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF
COLUMBIA WATER COMPANY**

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

Enclosed please find Columbia Water Company's Motion for Protective Order in the above-captioned proceedings. Copies have been served in accordance with the attached Certificate of Service.

Should you have any questions regarding this filing, please contact me.

Very truly yours,

/s/ Whitney E. Snyder

Whitney E. Snyder
Thomas J. Sniscak
Phillip D. Demanchick Jr.

Counsel for Columbia Water Company

WES/das/jld
Enclosure

cc: Administrative Law Judge Mary D. Long (via electronic mail – malong@pa.gov)
Administrative Law Judge Charece Z. Collins via electronic mail – charcollin@pa.gov)
Per Certificate of Service

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

| | | |
|--|---|---------------------------|
| Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission | : | Docket No. R-2023-3040258 |
| Office of Small Business Advocate | : | Docket No. C-2023-3040567 |
| Office of Consumer Advocate | : | Docket No. C-2023-3040746 |
| Sandra E. Shaub | : | Docket No. C-2023-3041197 |
| Vincent E. Collier III | : | Docket No. C-2023-3041198 |
| | : | |
| v. | : | |
| | : | |
| Columbia Water Company | : | |

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER OF
COLUMBIA WATER COMPANY**

TO ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES MARY D. LONG AND CHARECE Z. COLLINS:

Columbia Water Company (“Columbia Water” or the “Company”), by and through its attorneys, Hawke McKeon & Sniscak LLP, hereby requests that the attached Protective Order be entered in the above-captioned proceeding pursuant to the provisions of 52 Pa. Code § 5.365(a). Columbia Water has corresponded with the active parties in this proceeding, the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission’s (“Commission”) Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”), the Office of Consumer Advocate (“OCA”) and the Office of Small Business Advocate (“OSBA”), and no active party has indicated that it opposes or objects to the attached Protective Order. In support thereof, Columbia Water represents as follows:

1. On or about April 28, 2023, Columbia Water filed Supplement No. 121 to Tariff Water – Pa. P.U.C. No. 7, to become effective June 30, 2023. This filing contained proposed changes in rates, rules, and regulations intended to produce \$999,900 in additional annual operating revenues. Both public and proprietary versions of the filing were submitted to the Commission. Subsequently, on May 17, 2023, Columbia Water filed an Errata to its rate increase

revising its supporting data and information. Both public and proprietary versions of the filing were submitted to the Commission.

2. By Order entered June 15, 2023, the Commission suspended Columbia Water's filing until January 27, 2024, and instituted an investigation to determine the lawfulness, justness, and reasonableness of the proposed rates, rules, and regulations.

3. The proceeding has been assigned to Administrative Law Judge Mary D. Long ("ALJ Long") and Administrative Law Judge Charece Z. Collins ("ALJ Collins") (collectively, Presiding Officers") for hearings and the issuance of a Recommended Decision. A telephonic prehearing conference has been scheduled for June 23, 2023.

4. On June 13, 2023, Columbia Water served written Direct Testimony as part of this proceeding. The Company's Direct Testimony contains confidential and proprietary information which requires the entry of a protective order in this proceeding. Specifically, testimony submitted by Columbia Water contains confidential and proprietary information regarding the Company's financials, expenses, and system operations. Treatment of such information as set forth in the attached proposed Protective Order is justified because unrestricted disclosure of this information would not be in the public interest. These considerations constitute cause for the restrictions specified in 52 Pa. Code § 5.365 and in Administrative Law Judge or Commission Orders granting relief pursuant to the regulation.

5. Under 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362(a)(7) and 5.365, the Office of Administrative Law Judge or the Commission may issue a Protective Order to limit or prohibit disclosure of proprietary information where the potential harm to a participant would be substantial and outweighs the public's interest in having access to the proprietary information. In applying this standard, relevant factors to be considered include: the extent to which disclosure would cause unfair economic or

competitive damage; the extent to which the information may already be known by others; and the potential value of such information to the participant and the participant's competitors and trade partners. 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.365(a)(1) - (3).

6. The attached proposed Protective Order defines "Confidential" information in Paragraph 3 as "those materials which customarily are treated by that Party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that Party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury." The proposed Protective Order defines "Highly Confidential" information as "materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature among the parties or of such a private, personal nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials." The proposed Protective Order collectively defines Confidential and Highly Confidential information as "Proprietary Information." Clearly, protecting this type of information from disclosure is appropriate.

7. Limitation on the disclosure of Proprietary Information will not prejudice the rights of the participants, nor will such limitation frustrate the prompt and fair resolution of this proceeding. The proposed Protective Order balances the interests of the Parties, the public, and the Commission.

8. As noted previously, the Company has corresponded with I&E, the OCA, and OSBA. Those parties do not oppose the Motion or attached proposed Protective Order.

9. The attached proposed Protective Order will protect the Proprietary Information while allowing the Parties to use such information for purposes of the instant litigation.

WHEREFORE, for all the foregoing reasons, Columbia Water Company requests that the Presiding Officers grant this Motion and issue the attached Protective Order.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Whitney E. Snyder

Thomas J. Sniscak, Esquire, I.D. #33891
Whitney E. Snyder, Esquire, I.D. #316625
Phillip D. Demanchick Jr., I.D. #324761
Hawke McKeon & Sniscak LLP
100 North Tenth Street
Harrisburg, PA 17101
Phone: 717-236-1300
Fax: 717-236-4841
tjsniscak@hmslegal.com
wesnyder@hmslegal.com

Counsel for Columbia Water Company

Date: June 27, 2023

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

| | | |
|--|---|---------------------------|
| Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission | : | Docket No. R-2023-3040258 |
| Office of Small Business Advocate | : | Docket No. C-2023-3040567 |
| Office of Consumer Advocate | : | Docket No. C-2023-3040746 |
| Sandra E. Shaub | : | Docket No. C-2023-3041197 |
| Vincent E. Collier III | : | Docket No. C-2023-3041198 |
| | : | |
| v. | : | |
| | : | |
| Columbia Water Company | : | |

PROPOSED PROTECTIVE ORDER

An Order has been requested to grant the Unopposed Motion of Columbia Water Company (“Columbia Water” or the “Company”) for a Protective Order, which was submitted to the Administrative Law Judge via electronic filing on June 27, 2023 pursuant to the provisions of 52 Pa. Code § 5.36(a).

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. That a Protective order is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2, 3 and 4 below, which have been or will be filed with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (“Commission”), produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during the above-captioned proceeding and all proceedings consolidated therewith. All persons previously or hereafter granted access to the materials and information identified in Ordering Paragraphs 2, 3 and 4 of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Protective Order.

2. That the materials or information subject to this Protective Order includes testimony and exhibits filed by various witnesses and parties that contains Proprietary information. To the extent any additional Proprietary Information is filed with the Commission or presented in this proceeding, such information shall also be subject to this Protective Order.

3. That “Confidential” materials are those material which customarily are treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury. “Highly Confidential” materials are those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature among the parties or of such a private, personal nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. Together, these materials will be referred to as “Proprietary Information” for the purposes of this Protective Order.

4. That the information subject to this Protective Order is all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, furnished in this proceeding, which are proprietary or confidential in nature and which are so designated by being marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” “Requesting Party” shall mean a Party that either requests or receives Proprietary Information, and “Producing Party” shall mean the Party that produces or otherwise supplies Proprietary Information to another Party.

5. That Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for Requesting Parties subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of participating in this proceeding. Counsel for Requesting Parties shall not disclose Proprietary Information to anyone other than counsel for the Parties, except that, to the extent required for participation in this proceeding, counsel for a

Requesting Party may disclose Proprietary Information to the Requesting Party's independent expert(s) subject to the terms of this Protective Order and provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the in-house analysts, paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney's instruction, supervision or control need not do so but shall be made aware that such information is not for public disclosure except under the terms in the Protective Order. Additionally, counsel for the Bureau of Investigation & Enforcement, Office of Consumer Advocate and the Office of Small Business Advocate may share Proprietary Information with the I&E Director, the Consumer Advocate, the Deputy Consumer Advocate, and the Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure Certificate from these individuals, provided, however, that these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of this Protective Order. Nothing in this Protective Order shall be deemed to restrict the right of the original Producing Party to disclose or use its own Proprietary Information.

6. That, prior to disclosing Proprietary Information to an independent expert as provided in paragraph 5, a Requesting Party shall deliver a copy of this Protective Order to the expert and obtain from the expert a written acknowledgment of the terms of the Protective Order in the form of Appendix A attached hereto. Each party shall promptly notify the other parties of the identity of all persons provided access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this paragraph and paragraph 5.

7. That the Producing Party shall designate information or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by marking the documents "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL." Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the Producing Party, insofar as reasonably practicable, shall designate as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" only the

specific data, passages or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information. One permissible means of designating portions of a document to be Proprietary Information shall be to mark the first page of the document and on each page thereof containing Proprietary Information with the word “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” in bold, capital letters.

8. The Parties will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in the Right to Know Law, Act of February 14, 2008, P.L. 6, 65 P.S. §§ 67.101-67.3104, until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary.

9. That any public reference to Proprietary Information by a Party or its independent expert(s) shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

10. That the part of any record in this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, direct testimony, cross-examination, argument and responses to discovery, including any reference thereto as mentioned in paragraph 9 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the Parties or pursuant to an order of the Administrative Law Judge or the Commission.

11. The parties retain the right to require additional protection for Proprietary Information that it deems to be “Highly Confidential.” To the extent that a Producing Party identifies any information or materials to be of a highly confidential nature, said Party will contact

the Requesting Party to negotiate specific treatment for such materials. However, such additional requirements shall not preclude counsel for a party from viewing any materials so designated.

12. Each Party shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information. Nothing herein shall be construed to remove the right of a Party to present such question or challenge to the Administrative Law Judge or the Commission. If a Party challenges the designation of a document or information as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL,” the Producing Party retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.

13. That Proprietary Information produced in this proceeding shall be made available to the Commission and its Staff. For purposes of filing, to the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s report folders, such information shall be handled in accordance with routine Commission procedures inasmuch as the report folders are not subject to public disclosure. To the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s testimony or document folders, such information shall be separately bound, conspicuously marked, and accompanied by a copy of this Protective Order. Public inspection of Proprietary Information shall be permitted only in accordance with this Protective Order.

14. That within 30 days after a request by a Producing Party, the other party shall either destroy or return to the Producing Party all copies of all documents and other materials which contain any Proprietary Information. In the event that the Requesting Party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information to the Producing

Party, the Requesting Party shall certify in writing to the Producing Party that the documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information have been destroyed.

Date: _____

Mary D. Long
Administrative Law Judge

Charece Z. Collins
Administrative Law Judge

APPENDIX A

| | | |
|--|---|---------------------------|
| Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission | : | Docket No. R-2023-3040258 |
| Office of Small Business Advocate | : | Docket No. C-2023-3040567 |
| Office of Consumer Advocate | : | Docket No. C-2023-3040746 |
| Sandra E. Shaub | : | Docket No. C-2023-3041197 |
| Vincent E. Collier III | : | Docket No. C-2023-3041198 |
| | : | |
| v. | : | |
| | : | |
| Columbia Water Company | : | |

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____. The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order, which deals with the treatment of Proprietary Information. The undersigned agrees to be bound by, and comply with, the terms and conditions of said Protective Order.

NAME

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

DATED: _____

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document upon the parties, listed below, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a party).

BY ELECTRONIC MAIL ONLY:

Barrett C. Sheridan, Esquire
Erin L. Gannon, Esquire
Office of Consumer Advocate
555 Walnut Street
5th Floor Forum Place
Harrisburg, PA 17101
OCAColumbiaWater2023@paoca.org

Carrie B. Wright, Esquire
Pennsylvania Public Utility
Commission
Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement
Commonwealth Keystone Building
400 North Street
Harrisburg, PA 17120
carwright@pa.gov

Steven C. Gray, Esquire
Small Business Advocate
Pennsylvania Office of Small Business Advocate
555 Walnut Street, 1st Floor
Forum Place
Harrisburg, PA 17101
sgray@pa.gov

Sandra E. Shaub
3282 Horizon Drive
Lancaster, PA 17601
sandishaub@comcast.net

Vincent E. Collier III
3287 Horizon Drive
Lancaster, PA 17601
vecollierIII@gmail.com

/s/ Whitney E. Snyder

Whitney E. Snyder
Thomas J. Sniscak
Phillip D. Demanchick Jr.

Dated this 27th day of June, 2023