

Hawke
 McKeon &
 Sniscak LLP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Steven K. Haas
(717) 236-1300 x244
skhaas@hmslegal.com

100 North Tenth Street, Harrisburg, PA 17101 Phone: 717.236.1300 Fax: 717.236.4841 www.hmslegal.com

July 31, 2012

Via Hand Delivery

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
400 North Street, Filing Room, 2 North
Harrisburg, PA 17120

Re: Gary L. Gaskins v. Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.; Docket No. C-2010-2195549;
**COMMENTS OF VERIZON PENNSYLVANIA INC. IN RESPONSE TO
COMMISSION'S TENTATIVE OPINION AND ORDER ENTERED JULY
11, 2012**

Dear Secretary Chiavetta:

Enclosed for filing with the Commission are the original and three (3) copies of the Comments of Verizon Pennsylvania Inc. ("Verizon PA") in response to the Commission's Tentative Opinion and Order that was entered in this proceeding on July 11, 2012. Included with this filing are (1) billing statements for the time period in question (June 2009 through March 2011), (2) an account background and summary sheet, and (3) Verizon PA's comments on the factors contained in the Commission's Policy Statement at 52 Pa. Code §69.1201. As indicated on the attached Certificate of Service, a copy of this filing has been sent to Mr. Gaskins on this date.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. If you should have any questions, please feel free to call me.

Sincerely,



Steven K. Haas

SKH/san
Enclosures

cc: Commissioner Robert F. Powelson, Chairman (via hand delivery)
Commissioner John F. Coleman, Jr., Vice Chairman (via hand delivery)
Commissioner Wayne E. Gardner (via hand delivery)
Commissioner James H. Cawley (via hand delivery)
Commissioner Pamela A. Witmer (via hand delivery)
Certificate of Service

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

2012 JUL 31 PM 1:4

RECEIVED

MAILING ADDRESS: P.O. BOX 1778 HARRISBURG, PA 17105

BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Gary L. Gaskins

v.

Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.

:
:
:
:
:

C-2010-2195549

SECRETARY'S BUREAU

2012 JUL 31 PM 1:42

RECEIVED

**Comments of
Verizon Pennsylvania Inc.
Filed in Response to the
Commission's Tentative Opinion and Order**

Verizon Pennsylvania Inc. ("Verizon PA") hereby submits the following comments pursuant to the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission's ("Commission") Tentative Opinion and Order ("Tentative Order"), entered July 11, 2012, in the above-captioned proceeding.

I. BACKGROUND

On August 23, 2010, the Complainant, Gary Gaskins, filed the above-captioned Formal Complaint with the Commission. As indicated in the Commission's Tentative Order, the complaint involved allegations concerning improper billing and a service issue. More specifically, Mr. Gaskins alleged that he had an agreement with Verizon PA whereby he would pay \$12.50 per month for phone service, including wire repair, as well as paying toward an outstanding bill. With respect to the service issue, Mr. Gaskins stated in his complaint, in the entirety, "my phone have been used and invaded by other people than myself."

On October 1, 2010, Verizon PA filed its Answer to the complaint. In its Answer, Verizon PA noted that Mr. Gaskins was, in fact, paying approximately \$12.00 per month during

the time he was receiving an \$11.00 per month Lifeline 100 credit. Verizon PA alleged that the Lifeline 100 credit was subsequently removed from his account when he failed to respond to letters from Verizon PA requesting that he verify his income status in order to continue receiving the credit. When he reapplied for the Lifeline discount in May of 2009, he did not qualify for the maximum Lifeline 100 credit, but he did qualify for and begin receiving the Lifeline 135 credit of \$7.64 per month on his new account, which was established on June 24, 2009.

Verizon PA also alleged that, since at least 2008, Mr. Gaskins had a history of either not paying his monthly bills or making only partial payments during certain months. This ultimately resulted in past due balances on his accounts, which, in turn, led to the denial of his non-basic service on December 28, 2009. This non-basic denial caused the removal of the wire maintenance plan from his account at that time.

The hearing in this proceeding was held on April 18, 2011, before Administrative Law Judge ("ALJ") Cynthia W. Fordham. On February 7, 2012, the proceeding was reassigned to ALJ Katrina L. Dunderdale. Ultimately, on April 9, 2012, an Initial Decision ("I.D.") was issued. In her I.D., ALJ Dunderdale, sustained the complaint on the billing and service issues. The ALJ did not order a civil penalty. Instead, she directed Verizon to do two things: (1) prepare and send to the Complainant a detailed billing statement; and (2) conduct an inspection of its facilities between the central office and the Complainant's Network Interface Device and complete whatever corrective actions may be necessary to provide the Complainant with reasonable and adequate service.

Neither Party filed Exceptions to the I.D. Verizon PA notes that, although it did not agree with certain portions of the I.D., it decided against filing Exceptions. It was willing to comply with the two directives set forth in the I.D. in an attempt to further satisfy the

Complainant, rather than having to incur the additional time and expense associated with continuing to litigate the matter.

By Its Tentative Order entered on July 11, 2012, the Commission directed the parties to submit comments on the various factors set forth in the Commission's Policy Statement at 52 Pa. Code §69.1201, and to provide additional information in order to fill in gaps in the evidentiary record.

In this document, Verizon PA provides its comments to the various factors set forth in the Commission's Policy Statement on the issue of whether a civil penalty is appropriate. In addition, attached to these comments are (1) detailed billing statements for each month during the time period from the initiation of service in June of 2009 (the July 7, 2009 bill was the first bill issued) through and including Mr. Gaskins' March 7, 2011 bill, and (2) a billing Background/Summary Sheet that provides additional information about the account, as well as information requested in the I.D. and the Tentative order.

For each of the factors set forth in the Commission's Policy Statement, Verizon PA has provided comments on both the billing issue and the service issue.

II. COMMENTS

- 1. Whether the conduct at issue was of a serious nature. When conduct of a serious nature is involved, such as willful fraud or misrepresentation, the conduct may warrant a higher penalty. When the conduct is less egregious, such as administrative filing or technical errors, it may warrant a lower penalty.**

Billing Issue:

Mr. Gaskins alleges that he was informed by Verizon PA that his bill for service during a time period when he was enrolled in the Lifeline program would be \$12.50 per month. As shown on Verizon PA Exhibit No. 2, he was, in fact, billed less than \$12.00 per month for the

time period of January 2008 through July 2008, when he was enrolled in the Lifeline 100 plan. Under this plan, he received a monthly Lifeline credit of \$11.41. It wasn't until he was removed from the Lifeline plan that his monthly bill exceeded \$12.50. The discussion on pages 24-26 of the Hearing Transcript fully addresses the reasons Mr. Gaskins was removed from the Lifeline program.

When the current service that is at issue here was established in June of 2009, Verizon PA explained to Mr. Gaskins that his monthly basic charges, without the wire maintenance plan, would be between \$16.00 and \$17.00 (he was determined to be eligible for the lower Lifeline 135 credit). It further estimated that, with the wire maintenance plan, and including all applicable taxes, surcharges and fees, the monthly charge would be \$22.05. (Transcript, pp. 20-22; Verizon PA Exhibit No. 1). In fact, the actual amounts that Mr. Gaskins was billed for his basic calling plan, wire maintenance plan, and all applicable taxes, surcharges and fees, during the months he had wire maintenance (July 2009 through December 2009), was between \$23.00 and \$24.00.

As explained in the attached Background and Summary Sheet, the total difference in the actual amount billed for basic service and wire maintenance during these months, and the \$22.05 amount ordered by the Commission, is \$10.12. Additionally, as also noted on the Background and Summary Sheet, and as acknowledged on page 10 of the Initial Decision, Verizon PA issued credits on Mr. Gaskins' accounts in March of 2011, totaling \$184.69. These credits completely cleared the balances from both his live account and his non-basic final bill account. As explained by Verizon PA's witness, these credits were issued as a courtesy to allow him to start with a "clean slate" in the event that there was, in fact, any confusion as to the correct billing charges. (Transcript, p. 19).

The difference in the amount ordered by the Commission for basic service and wire maintenance and the amount actually billed to Mr. Gaskins is minimal. Further, Verizon PA issued credits totaling far in excess of any amount that may have been the legitimate subject of confusion in order to allow him to start clear. The correct billing was again explained to him at the time the balances on his live and non-basic final bill accounts were cleared. (Transcript, p. 19).

Accordingly, to the extent any confusion existed as to the rates that would apply to the services Mr. Gaskins received as a result of explanations provided by Verizon PA, such conduct certainly does not rise to anything close to willful or fraudulent, nor is it serious in nature. Verizon PA provided an explanation of the charges that would apply to Mr. Gaskins' service and estimated the monthly charges at \$22.05. The actual charges were slightly higher. All appropriate credits have been issued. This factor does not warrant the imposition of a civil penalty on the billing issue.

Service issue:

The service issue allegation raised by Mr. Gaskins in his complaint states, in its entirety, "my phone have been used and invaded by other people than myself." He explained during his testimony that at times he can hear people talking on his phone and he hears voices in the background. (See Transcript, pp. 8-9). This is the only problem raised in his complaint having to do with service quality.

Verizon PA's witness testified during the hearing that she reviewed all of Verizon PA's repair department and business office records on Mr. Gaskins' account to see if he ever called in to complain about this problem. She testified that she found no such records. (Transcript, pp. 14-15). She also testified that Verizon PA repair personnel performed inspections of the

facilities through which service is provided to Mr. Gaskins on February 22 and February 24, 2011, in response to his allegations. The Central Office facilities were checked on the 22nd and the outside facilities up to Mr. Gaskins' house were checked on the 24th. (Transcript, p. 15). No problems were found during these inspections.

On page 11 of the I.D., issue was taken with the fact that Verizon PA performed the inspections in February, despite its claim of having found no record of Mr. Gaskins ever calling in to complain about hearing voices on his line. In fact, management for Verizon PA initiated these inspections in order to attempt to identify and correct any problems that may have been found. As noted, no problems were found during those inspections. Verizon PA's witness testified that her review of all records on Mr. Gaskins' account revealed no indication of any problems or conditions that might cause him to hear other people on his line. (Transcript, p. 15).

Mr. Gaskins' also testified that Verizon PA repair personnel came to his house in 2009, during a big snowfall, and again in 2010, in addition to the February 2011 inspections. As explained, Verizon PA initiated the February 2011 inspection in response to the allegation in his complaint in an attempt to identify and correct any problems that may be found. No problems were, in fact, found.

With respect to Mr. Gaskins' testimony that Verizon PA repair personnel went to his house in 2009 and 2010, he did not describe the problems he was experiencing during those visits. There is no evidence in the record as to the specific problems he was experiencing at those times. It may very well be that the service problems occurring at those times were not problems involving hearing voices on his line. This would explain why, despite sending repair personnel to his house in 2009 and 2010, Verizon PA does not have any records of contacts from him at those times concerning a problem of hearing other voices on his line.

In fact, Verizon PA's witness accurately testified that there were no records on Mr. Gaskins' account reflecting complaints from him about hearing voices on his line or people "invading" his line. Accordingly, any suggestion that Verizon PA was unresponsive or unwilling to investigate or attempt to correct this complaint is simply incorrect.

Further, Verizon PA has again recently reviewed its repair records on Mr. Gaskins' account. There has been one contact from him, on May 5, 2011, in which he complained about hearing other voices on his line.¹ Repair personnel were dispatched to his house and found the line to be noisy. The problem was corrected when the technician switched Mr. Gaskins' service to a new cable pair. Mr. Gaskins has not called back since May of 2011 to complain about this problem. To the extent, if any, that he continues to experience hearing other voices on his line, he is not contacting Verizon PA to complain or to give the company an opportunity to correct the problem.

On a going forward basis, Verizon PA will perform, within the next twenty-five (25) days, a complete, 100% inspection of all of the facilities through which service to Mr. Gaskins is provided in another attempt to identify and correct any problems, including cross talk, that may exist. This inspection will include Central Office equipment, cables, junction boxes and the drop line that connects with his house. Any problems found will be promptly fixed and, as directed in Ordering Paragraph No. 7 of the Tentative Order, a full report of this inspection will be provided to the Bureau of Consumer Services ("BCS").

Verizon PA has not only responded to complaints received from Mr. Gaskins when he did call in, it initiated the February 2011 inspection to try to find and correct any problems. Verizon PA has been responsive. If Mr. Gaskins is experiencing continuing cross talk problems,

¹ Mr. Gaskins called Verizon on January 27, 2012 to complain about having no dial tone. Verizon corrected this problem by making a repair to an aerial conductor. Mr. Gaskins has not called Verizon with any repair issues since the January 27, 2012 contact.

he is not contacting the company to complain. Verizon PA must be given notice of a problem in order to be able to attempt to make any necessary repairs. Finally, as noted, the company will perform another 100% inspection within 25 days and report its findings to the BCS. It is Verizon PA's position that its conduct in this matter has been responsible and responsive. Accordingly, Verizon PA believes that a civil penalty is not warranted based on this factor.

- 2. Whether the resulting consequences of the conduct at issue were of a serious nature. When consequences of a serious nature are involved, such as personal injury or property damage, the consequences may warrant a higher penalty.**

Billing issue:

As discussed in the billing issue response above, as well as in the attached Background and Summary sheet, the consequences of any confusion that may have been caused by explanations provided by Verizon PA about the monthly fees associated with Mr. Gaskins' service are minimal, if any. The difference between the \$22.05 figure provided to Mr. Gaskins when service was set up in June of 2009, and the amount he was actually charged for basic service, wire maintenance and associated taxes, surcharges and fees, averages to approximately \$1.69 per month, for a total "overage" of \$10.12.

Further, as described above, Verizon PA issued credits to Mr. Gaskins in March of 2011 totaling \$184.69. In addition, the specific disputed amount of \$10.12 has again been credited to his account. He has received credits for far more than any amount that may reasonably be in question. Any consequences at issue here are minimal, have been corrected in any event, and certainly do not warrant a civil penalty.

Service issue:

As discussed in the service issue response above, Mr. Gaskins' service complaint involves hearing other voices on his line. He did not complain about service outages, nor did he

allege that he was unable to use his phone at any time. He has always had the use of his phone. While Verizon PA acknowledges that hearing noise or voices in the background during a call may be annoying, it does not render a phone useless. He at all times was able to use his phone.

As noted, Verizon PA will be performing another 100% inspection of the facilities that service Mr. Gaskins within the next few weeks in an attempt to find any problems that may exist. It will also promptly respond to service complaints, if any, it receives from him. However, the consequences at issue here do not warrant the imposition of a civil penalty.

- 3. Whether the conduct at issue was deemed intentional or negligent. This Factor may only be considered in evaluating litigated cases. When conduct has been deemed intentional, the conduct may result in a higher penalty.**

Billing issue:

As explained, Verizon PA provided estimates of the various costs associated with the service requested by Mr. Gaskins at the time the service was initiated in June of 2009. (Transcript, p. 19; Verizon PA Exhibit No. 1). The end result of the discussion was that the company provided a monthly figure for basic service, wire maintenance and applicable taxes, surcharges and fees of \$22.05. (Transcript, p. 21; Verizon PA Exhibit No. 1). The actual amount billed to Mr. Gaskins averaged to approximately \$1.69 per month higher than the \$22.05 figure. The difference is not significant. The conduct that resulted in the difference certainly cannot be considered intentional. Under the most negative evaluation of the conduct at issue, a completely unintentional mistake may have been made, resulting in a minimal difference between the amount quoted and the actual amounts billed. Verizon PA does not believe that a civil penalty is warranted under this factor or, if the Commission determines otherwise, a minimal penalty should be imposed.

Service issue:

As noted above, the company responded to the instances when it received service complaint contacts from Mr. Gaskins and made necessary repairs. Other than the Formal Complaint, Verizon received only one contact from him in which he complained about his phone being invaded or hearing other people on his line. The company responded to this contact and repaired the problem. It also dispatched repair personnel in February of 2011 to fully inspect all of the facilities that serve Mr. Gaskins. No problems were found during that inspection.

Verizon received a contact from Mr. Gaskins on May 5, 2011 during which he described hearing cross talk on his line. Repair personnel corrected the problem by switching his service to a new cable pair. The company has not received any further contacts from Mr. Gaskins since that time where he complained about hearing other voices on his line. In addition, there have been no further contacts from him about any service issues since the contact noted in footnote 1 above. The company has and will respond promptly to any service complaint contacts it receives from Mr. Gaskins.

There certainly has been no intentional conduct on the part of Verizon PA to avoid its service obligations to Mr. Gaskins. If he is having ongoing issues with cross talk, he must contact the company so that it can respond and correct any problems found. There is no evidence in the record as to the nature of the complaints from Mr. Gaskins that prompted the service visits in 2009 and 2010. Accordingly, it may not be presumed that they involved complaints about cross talk or hearing other voices on the line. Mr. Gaskins' testimony did not indicate that those problems involved cross talk or hearing voices on his line. To the extent that Mr. Gaskins has experienced ongoing issues with this problem, the record does not support, nor is it true, that he has repeatedly complained about the problem or that the company has not

promptly responded to those complaints. The record does not support a finding that there was either intentional or negligent conduct on the part of Verizon PA. This factor does not warrant imposition of a civil penalty.

- 4. Whether the regulated entity made efforts to modify internal practices and procedures to address the conduct at issue and prevent similar conduct in the future. These modifications may include activities such as training and improving company techniques and supervision. The amount of time it took the utility to correct the conduct once it was discovered and the involvement of top-level management in correcting the conduct may be considered.**

Billing issue:

As explained above, the billing issue resulted in a minor difference between the amount the company quoted Mr. Gaskins for the services he was receiving and the amounts he was actually billed. The company, on its own initiative, issued credits to his account that more than account for these differences. The company's management made this decision in order to clear his live and final bill accounts so he could start with a clean slate in the event there was legitimate confusion about the billing totals. The correct charges have been fully explained to Mr. Gaskins. (Transcript, p. 19; Verizon PA Exhibit No. 1). There have been no billing issues or complaints since the hearing was held. Verizon PA believes that it reacted promptly and appropriately to the billing issue. Accordingly, this factor does not warrant imposition of a civil penalty.

Service issue:

As explained above, to the extent the cross talk condition has been an ongoing issue for Mr. Gaskins, he has not reported it to Verizon on an ongoing basis. As noted, at the time of the hearing, a review of Verizon's records revealed that he had not contacted the company to complain about that problem. The company's management made the decision to fully inspect its

facilities, at both the central office and outside all the way to his house, in order to find any problems. None were found. There was a cross talk complaint from Mr. Gaskins on May 5, 2011. This problem was corrected when company repair personnel put his service on a new cable pair. There have been no subsequent service complaints about cross talk or hearing other voices on the line.

The company, in accordance with the Tentative Order, is also arranging to perform another complete, 100% inspection of its facilities to try to find any problems. In the event this inspection does not reveal any problems with the company's facilities, the company's management has approved an inspection inside of Mr. Gaskins house, with his approval, at no charge to him, in a further effort to find the source of any problems that may exist. The results of this inspection will be presented to Mr. Gaskins as well as the BCS. The company will also explain to Mr. Gaskins the current fees associated with the wire maintenance plan and what actions, if any, need be taken by him to subscribe to the plan, if he so desires. Further, Mr. Gaskins will be provided with the direct number for a repair supervisor for his use in the event of any future service problems. The company will also instruct Mr. Gaskins about the importance of calling the company any time he experiences a problem so that it can promptly investigate the issue. It will be emphasized to him that he must report problems in order to have them corrected.

For these reasons, Verizon believes that a civil penalty is not warranted under this factor.

5. The number of customers affected and the duration of the violation.

Billing issue:

Mr. Gaskins was the only customer affected by the billing question at issue here. The duration of the violation arguably lasted the length of time Mr. Gaskins had the wire maintenance plan on his account, which was six months. However, as noted above, the price

difference was minimal and it was not the result of egregious conduct by Verizon. Further, all disputed charges, and a great deal more, were credited back to his account, resulting in the clearance of all outstanding balances on his accounts at that time. From that point forward, applicable charges were again explained to Mr. Gaskins. Verizon does not believe that a civil penalty is warranted under this factor.

Service issue:

Mr. Gaskins was the only customer affected by the service question at issue here. Further, to the extent it is determined that his service issues have, in fact, been ongoing for some period of time, Mr. Gaskins must bear responsibility for that condition since, as explained above, he has not reported the problem to Verizon on an ongoing basis. Rather, other than the Formal Complaint itself, the only other time Verizon's records indicate having received a complaint from him on this issue was May 5, 2011. The issue was investigated in February of 2011, and again upon receipt of his complaint on May 5, 2011. In February, no problems were found with Verizon's facilities. In May, the problem was resolved when the company changed his service to a new cable pair. He has not contacted Verizon since May of 2011 to complain about the cross talk/voices on the line problem.

Verizon does not believe a civil penalty is warranted based on this factor. To the extent the Commission determines that the problem has been ongoing for some time and that Verizon is in part at fault, however, any civil penalty based on this factor should be minimal.

- 6. The compliance history of the regulated entity which committed the violation. An isolated incident from an otherwise compliant utility may result in a lower penalty, whereas frequent, recurrent violations by a utility may result in a higher penalty.**

Billing issue:

There is no record evidence on which to perform an evaluation based on this factor. Verizon believes it has a good compliance history with the Commission's regulations. Accordingly, the company does not believe a civil penalty based on this factor is warranted.

Service issue:

There is no record evidence on which to perform an evaluation based on this factor. Verizon believes it has a good compliance history with the Commission's regulations. Accordingly, the company does not believe a civil penalty based on this factor is warranted.

- 7. Whether the regulated utility cooperated with the Commission's investigation. Facts establishing bad faith, active concealment of violation, or attempts to interfere with commission investigations may result in a higher penalty.**

Billing issue:

Verizon is and will continue to fully cooperate with the Commission and the directives set forth in its Tentative Order. There are no facts establishing bad faith, concealment or attempts to interfere with the Commission. Verizon will comply with the actions directed by the Commission, in addition to the additional actions described herein. Accordingly, a civil penalty based on this factor is not warranted.

Service issue:

Verizon is and will continue to fully cooperate with the Commission and the directives set forth in its Tentative Order. There are no facts establishing bad faith, concealment or attempts to interfere with the Commission. Verizon will comply with the actions directed by the Commission, as well as the additional actions described herein. Accordingly, a civil penalty based on this factor is not warranted.

8. The amount of the civil penalty or fine necessary to deter future violations. The size of the utility may be considered to determine an appropriate penalty amount.

Billing issue:

As explained, it is Verizon's position that, at worst, its conduct in connection with the billing issue was inadvertent and harmless. It issued credits far in excess of the amount necessary to address the concerns and disputed charges raised by Mr. Gaskins. There was no intentional, willful or egregious conduct on the part of the company associated with the billing issue. Accordingly, Verizon does not believe a civil penalty is warranted under this factor.

Service issue:

As explained, it is Verizon's position that it has been responsive to all service complaints received from Mr. Gaskins. To the extent the issue has been ongoing, Mr. Gaskins must contact the company to report the problem in order to have it addressed. There was no intentional, willful or egregious conduct on the part of the company associated with this issue. Accordingly, Verizon does not believe a civil penalty is warranted under this factor. However, if the Commission determines that a penalty is appropriate, Verizon believes, for all of the reasons set forth herein, the penalty should be minimal.

9. Past Commission decisions in similar situations.

Billing issue:

Based on all of the information and reasons set forth herein and in the attached billing information, Verizon does not believe that a civil penalty is warranted here. If the Commission determines that a penalty is warranted and appropriate, such penalty should be minimal.

Service issue:

Based on all of the information and reasons set forth herein and in the attached billing information, Verizon does not believe that a civil penalty is warranted here. If the Commission determines that a penalty is warranted and appropriate, such penalty should be minimal.

10. Other relevant factors.

Billing issue:

Based on all of the information and reasons set forth herein and in the attached billing information, Verizon does not believe that a civil penalty is warranted here. If the Commission determines that a penalty is warranted and appropriate, such penalty should be minimal.

Service issue:

Based on all of the information and reasons set forth herein, Verizon does not believe that a civil penalty is warranted here. If the Commission determines that a penalty is warranted and appropriate, such penalty should be minimal.

REC'D
2012 JUL 31 PM 1:42
SECRETARY'S BUREAU

Gary L. Gaskins
(215) 468-2157
Account Established June 24, 2009

**Monthly Billing Itemization
June 2009 - March 2011**

Background and Summary Sheet

RECEIVED
2012 JUL 31 PM 1:54
SECRETARY'S OFFICE

1. **Initiation of Service:** The Complainant's account that is at issue here (number 215-468-2157) was established with Verizon PA on June 24, 2009. Accordingly, his first bill for this service was dated July 7, 2009. This bill contained prorated charges for the period of time from June 25, 2009 to July 6, 2009, as well as normal advance billing for the time period of July 7, 2009 to August 6, 2009.
2. **Basic service charges:** The calling plan to which Mr. Gaskins subscribes is the Flat Rate Unlimited Service plan. The fixed monthly fee for this plan, exclusive of applicable taxes, surcharges, fees and any additional charges for the use of services not included in the plan, is \$8.87.
3. **Lifeline Credits:** The Complainant received the Lifeline 135 credit on every bill during this time period. He did not receive the Lifeline 100 credit during this time period. The Lifeline 135 credits are shown on the attached itemized bills. This was the Lifeline plan he was eligible for when he initiated service in June of 2009. (Transcript, pp. 24-26).

The total amount of Lifeline credits received by Mr. Gaskins on his July 7, 2009 through March 7, 2011 bills is \$162.81.

4. **Taxes, surcharges and fees:** The monthly taxes, surcharges and fees applicable to Mr. Gaskins' basic service, excluding any additional charges for the use of services not included in his calling plan, include: (1) Dial Tone Line Charge; (2) Federal Subscriber Line Charge; (3) Federal Excise Tax; (4) PA Gross Receipts Tax; (5) Pa Relay Surcharge; and (6) E911 Fee. Charges for the use of services not include in his calling plan, such as calls to Directory Assistance, pay-per-use services such as Call Trace, or calls beyond his free calling area, would be extra.
5. **Total monthly charge:** The total monthly charge for Mr. Gaskins' basic calling plan, including applicable taxes, surcharges and fees, at the time he initiated service in June of 2009, was approximately \$16.40. (Transcript, p. 19). This did not include the fee or associated taxes for the wire maintenance plan. The rate for the wire maintenance plan during the months Mr. Gaskins received the service was \$6.99 plus tax (on page 21 of the transcript, the rate is identified as \$5.99. The \$22.05 amount ordered by the Commission was calculated using the \$5.99 figure). The actual total monthly charge for Mr. Gaskins' basic calling plan, including applicable taxes, surcharges and fees, and including the fee

and taxes for the wire maintenance plan during the months he received the service, averaged approximately \$23.70.

The figures shown on the attached bills are consistent with the figures provided in Verizon PA Exhibit No. 2, with the exception of the current charge figure of \$15.85 shown on Exhibit No. 2 for the January 7, 2010 bill. The correct amount, as reflected on the attached bill for January 7, 2010, is \$16.00.

Verizon has identified on the attached bills for the time period Mr. Gaskins had the wire maintenance plan (June 24, 2009 through December 29, 2009), the difference, if any, between the actual charges billed for basic service and wire maintenance and the \$22.05 figure ordered by the Commission. As indicated on the attached statements for July 7, 2009 through December 7, 2009, the total credit due is \$10.12. This credit has been applied to Mr. Gaskins' account.

- 6. Total charges billed/total payments received:** The total amount billed to Mr. Gaskins on his July 7, 2009 through March 7, 2011 bills was \$520.95. This included all charges associated with basic service and wire maintenance discussed above, as well as additional charges, with related taxes and fees, for the use of services or calls that were not included in his basic calling plan. Any such additional charges and fees are identified on the attached bills. As noted above, services and calls for which additional charges were incurred include calls beyond his free calling area, use of pay-per-use services such as Call Trace and Directory Assistance, and late payment fees applied to past due balances.

The total of all the payments received from Mr. Gaskins, as reflected on his July 7, 2009 through March 7, 2011 bills, was \$294.86. The difference between total charges billed and total amount of payments received is \$226.09.

Verizon PA notes that if Mr. Gaskins had only been billed \$22.05 for each of the 21 months at issue here (July 2009 through March 2011), excluding all other additional charges and associated taxes and fees, the total amount he would have been billed is \$463.05. Accordingly, the total amount of the payments he actually made (\$226.09) was still \$168.19 less than the \$463.05 total.

- 7. Courtesy Credits:** As noted on page 10 of the Initial Decision, Verizon PA issued two courtesy credits to Mr. Gaskins on March 7, 2011. The first credit was in the amount of \$79.47. This credit was applied to Mr. Gaskins' live account and completely cleared the past due balance that was on the account at that time. The second credit was in the amount of \$105.22. This credit was applied to his non-basic final bill and completely cleared the balance on the final bill account at that time.

Verizon PA's witness at the hearing explained that the credits were applied in order to clear his accounts, so he could start with a "clean slate." The credits, which were for a great deal more than the difference between \$22.05 per month for basic, wire maintenance and all associated taxes, surcharges and fees and the actual amounts Mr. Gaskins was billed for those services, were intended to clear his accounts and allow him

to start from zero, in the event there was, in fact, legitimate confusion over the actual costs for basic service and wire maintenance. As Verizon PA's witness explained, the correct charges were fully explained to him at that point, so he was aware of the correct charges going forward. (Transcript, p. 19).

8. **Communication with Mr. Gaskins:** Copies of the attached billing statements and this summary have been sent to Mr. Gaskins for his review. In addition, a Verizon representative will contact him in the near future and offer to review the statements with him and to answer any other billing questions or concerns he may have. Verizon will also offer to discuss with him any concerns or questions he may have about the company's various calling plans and services, as well as the fees, taxes and surcharges associated with those services.

July 7, 2009 Bill (due 8/3/09)

I. Total of current charges: \$32.65

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (7/7/09 – 8/6/09)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
TOTAL:	\$14.31

A. Monthly calling plan (prorated 6/25/09 – 7/6/09)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$3.55
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$3.06)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$2.88
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$2.36</u>
TOTAL PRORATED CHARGES:	\$5.73

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.62
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.43
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL:	\$2.13

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES: \$22.17

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Inside Wire Maintenance Plan (7/7/09 – 8/6/09)	\$6.99
<u>Inside Wire Maintenance Plan (6/25/09 – 7/6/09)</u>	<u>\$2.80</u>
TOTAL:	\$9.79

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. State Sales Tax	\$0.59
--------------------	--------

2. <u>Local Tax</u>	\$0.10
TOTAL:	\$0.69

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES: \$10.48

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$32.65

PAYMENTS RECEIVED 0

GRAND TOTAL DUE 32.65

Total due, at \$22.05/month, for basic and wire maintenance (total 43 days): \$30.57

Actual amount billed for the 43 days included on this bill: \$32.65

Amount of credit due: \$2.08

August 7, 2009 Bill (due 9/2/09)

I. Total of current charges: \$23.78

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (8/7/09 – 9/6/09)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>5.89</u>
TOTAL:	\$14.31

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.44
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL:	\$1.82

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. <u>Late payment fee</u>	<u>\$0.03</u>
TOTAL:	\$0.03

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES: \$16.16

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Inside Wire Maintenance Plan \$6.99

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. State sales tax	\$0.43
2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>\$0.07</u>
TOTAL:	\$0.50

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Late payment fee	\$0.13
---------------------	--------

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES: \$7.62

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$23.78
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 8/4/90	\$20.00
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$12.65
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$36.43

Total due, at \$22.05/month, for basic and wire maintenance:	\$22.05
Actual amount billed:	\$23.62
Amount of credit due:	\$1.57

September 7, 2009 Bill (due 10/5/09)

I. Total of current charges	\$28.84
-----------------------------	---------

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
TOTAL:	\$14.31

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.49
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL:	\$1.87

C. Miscellaneous Charges

1. Late payment fee	\$0.23
2. <u>Directory Assistance calls (1)</u>	<u>\$1.50</u>
TOTAL:	\$1.73

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES:	\$17.91
-------------------------	---------

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Inside Wire Maintenance	\$6.99
----------------------------	--------

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. State sales tax	\$0.62
2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>\$0.10</u>
TOTAL:	\$0.72

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Pay-per-use service: Call Trace (1)	\$3.00
2. <u>Late payment fee</u>	<u>\$0.22</u>
TOTAL:	\$3.22

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES:	\$10.93	
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$28.84	
PAYMENTS RECEIVED	0	
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$36.43	
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$65.27	
Total due, at \$22.05/month, for basic and wire maintenance:		\$22.05
Actual amount billed:		\$23.67
Amount of credit due:		\$1.62
October 7, 2009 Bill (due 11/3/09)		
I. Total of current charges	\$30.18	
II. Breakdown of basic charges		
A. Monthly calling plan (10/7/09 – 11/6/09)		
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87	
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)	
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19	
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>	
TOTAL	\$14.31	
B. Taxes and surcharges		
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.44	
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30	
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08	
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>	
TOTAL	\$1.82	
TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$16.13	
III. Breakdown of non-basic charges		
A. Inside Wire Maintenance	\$6.99	
B. Taxes and surcharges		
1. State sales tax	\$0.79	
2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>\$0.13</u>	
TOTAL	\$0.92	
C. Miscellaneous charges		
1. Late payment fee	\$0.14	
2. <u>Pay-per-use service: Call Trace (2)</u>	<u>\$6.00</u>	
TOTAL	\$6.14	
TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	\$14.05	
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$30.18	
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 9/16/09	\$25.00	
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$40.27	

GRAND TOTAL DUE \$70.45

Total due, at \$22.05/month, for basic and wire maintenance: \$22.05
Actual amount billed: \$23.62
Amount of credit due: \$1.57

November 7, 2009 Bill (due 12/7/09)

I. Total of current charges \$83.62

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (11/7/09 – 12/16/09)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
TOTAL	\$14.31

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.58
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.96

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Late payment fee	\$0.20
2. <u>Directory Assistance calls (3)</u>	<u>\$4.50</u>
TOTAL	\$4.70

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$20.97

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Inside Wire Maintenance \$6.99

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. State sales tax	\$3.51
2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>\$0.58</u>
TOTAL	\$4.09

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Late payment fee	\$0.42
2. Pay-per-use service: Call Trace (17)	\$51.00
3. <u>Long distance call</u>	<u>\$0.15</u>
TOTAL	\$51.57

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES 62.65

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$83.62

PAYMENTS RECEIVED 11/6/09	\$20.00
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$50.45
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$134.07

November 7, 2009 Bill, con't.

Total due, at \$22.05/month, for basic and wire maintenance:	\$22.05
Actual amount billed:	\$23.76
Amount of credit due:	\$1.71

December 7, 2009 Bill (due 1/4/10)

I. Total of current charges	\$49.74
-----------------------------	---------

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (12/7/09 – 1/6/10)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19
4. <u>Federal Line Subscriber Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
TOTAL	\$14.31

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.44
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.82

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$16.13
------------------------	---------

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Inside Wire Maintenance	\$6.99
----------------------------	--------

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. State sales tax	\$1.89
2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>\$0.31</u>
TOTAL	\$2.20

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Late payment fee	\$0.42
2. <u>Pay-per-use service: Call Trace (8)</u>	<u>\$24.00</u>
TOTAL	\$24.42

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	\$33.61
----------------------------	---------

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$49.74
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 12/7/09	\$25.00
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$109.07

GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$158.81	
Total due, at \$22.05/month, for basic and wire maintenance:		\$22.05
Actual amount billed:		\$23.62
Amount of credit due:		\$1.57
January 7, 2010 Bill (duc 2/3/10)		
I. Total of current charges	\$16.00	
II. Breakdown of basic charges		
A. Monthly calling plan (1/7/10 – 2/6/10)		
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87	
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)	
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.19	
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>	
TOTAL	\$14.31	
B. Taxes and surcharges		
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.45	
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30	
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08	
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>	
TOTAL	\$1.83	
C. Miscellaneous charges		
1. Calls beyond free calling area	\$0.18	
2. <u>Late payment fee</u>	<u>\$0.04</u>	
TOTAL	\$0.22	
TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$16.36	
III. Breakdown of non-basic charges		
A. Inside Wire Maintenance (removed 12/29/09) – Credit	(\$2.10)	
B. Taxes and surcharges		
1. State sales tax – credit	(\$0.03)	
2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>0</u>	
TOTAL - credit	(\$0.03)	
C. Miscellaneous charges		
1. Late payment fee	\$1.62	
TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES – credit	(\$0.51)	
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$16.00	
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 1/8/10	\$25.00	
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$133.81	
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$149.81	

February 7, 2010 Bill (due 3/4/10)

I.	Total of current charges	\$13.48
II.	Breakdown of basic charges	
	A. Monthly calling plan (2/7/10 – 3/6/10)	
	1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
	2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
	3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
	4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
	TOTAL	\$14.57
	B. Taxes and surcharges	
	1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.36
	2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
	3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
	4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
	TOTAL	\$1.74
	C. Miscellaneous charges and credits	
	1. Late payment fee	\$0.24
	2. Rate increase adjustment charge (1/1/10 – 2/6/10)	\$0.31
	3. <u>Adjustment credit</u>	<u>(\$3.38)</u>
	TOTAL – credit	(\$2.83)
	TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$13.48
III.	Breakdown of non-basic charges -	0
	Non-basic services denied January 2010 due to non-payment	
	Non-basic final balance moved to final bill	\$130.22
	GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$13.48
	PAYMENTS RECEIVED	0
	PAST DUE BALANCE	\$19.59
	GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$33.07

March 7, 2010 Bill (due 4/1/10)

I.	Total of current charges	\$20.21
II.	Breakdown of basic charges	
	A. Monthly Service plan (3/7/10 – 4/6/10)	
	1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
	2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
	3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
	4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
	TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and Surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.54
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.92

C. Miscellaneous charges	
1. Late payment fee	\$0.41
2. Calls beyond fee calling area (2)	\$3.00
3. <u>Back billing local sales tax</u>	<u>\$0.31</u>
TOTAL	\$3.72

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$20.21

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges - none

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES 0

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$20.21

PAYMENTS RECEIVED 0

PAST DUE BALANCE \$33.02

GRAND TOTAL DUE \$53.28

April 7, 2010 Bill (due 5/4/10)

I. Total of current charges \$16.40

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (4/7/10 – 5/6/10)	
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.45
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.83

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$16.40

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges – none

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES 0

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$16.40
PAYMENTS RECEIVED	\$60.00
PAST DUE BALANCE – credit	(\$6.72)
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$9.68

May 7, 2010 Bill (due 6/2/10)

I.	Total of current charges	\$16.40
II.	Breakdown of basic charges	
	A. Monthly calling plan (5/7/10 – 6/6/10)	
	1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
	2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
	3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
	4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
	TOTAL	\$14.57
	B. Taxes and surcharges	
	1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.45
	2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
	3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
	4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
	TOTAL	\$1.83
	TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$16.40

III.	Breakdown of non-basic charges – none	
	TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	0
	GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$16.40
	PAYMENTS RECEIVED 5/3/10	\$9.68
	PAST DUE BALANCE	0
	GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$16.40

June 7, 2010 bill (due 7/6/10)

I.	Total of current charges	\$16.85
II.	Breakdown of basic charges	
	A. Monthly calling plan (6/7/10 – 7/6/10)	
	1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
	2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.64)
	3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
	4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.89</u>
	TOTAL	\$14.57
	B. Taxes and Surcharges	

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.46
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.84

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$16.85

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges – none

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES 0

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$16.85

PAYMENTS RECEIVED 6/3/10 \$9.68

PAST DUE BALANCE \$6.72

GRAND TOTAL DUE \$23.57

July 7, 2010 Bill (due 8/3/10)

I. Total of current charges \$24.98

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (7/7/10 – 8/6/10)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.59)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.84</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and Surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.51
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.89

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Calls beyond free calling area (3)	\$0.54
2. <u>Directory Assistance calls</u>	<u>\$1.50</u>
TOTAL	\$2.04

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES 18.50

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Miscellaneous charges

1. Pay-per-use service: Call Trace (2)	\$6.00
--	--------

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. State sales tax	\$0.36
--------------------	--------

2. <u>Local tax</u>	\$0.12
TOTAL	\$0.48
TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	\$6.48
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$24.98
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 7/2/10	\$12.50
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$11.07
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$36.05

August 7, 2010 Bill (due 9/2/100)

I.	Total of current charges	\$26.78
II.	Breakdown of basic charges	
	A. Monthly calling plan (8/7/10 – 9/6/10)	
	1. Flat Rate unlimited Service	\$8.87
	2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.59)
	3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
	4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.84</u>
	TOTAL	\$14.57
	B. Taxes and surcharges	
	1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.46
	2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
	3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
	4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
	TOTAL	\$1.84
	C. Miscellaneous charges	
	1. Late payment fee	\$0.21
	2. <u>Calls beyond free calling area (3)</u>	<u>\$0.36</u>
	TOTAL	\$0.57
	TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$16.98
III.	Breakdown of non-basic charges	
	A. Miscellaneous charges	
	1. Late payment fee	\$0.08
	2. <u>Pay-per-use services: Call Trace (3)</u>	<u>\$9.00</u>
	TOTAL	\$9.08
	B. Taxes and surcharges	
	1. State sales tax	\$0.54
	2. <u>Local tax</u>	<u>\$0.18</u>
	TOTAL	\$0.72
	TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	\$9.80

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$26.78
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 8/2/10	\$12.50
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$23.55
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$50.33

September 7, 2010 Bill (due 10/4/10)

I. Total of current charges \$17.33

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (9/7/210 – 10/6/10)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.59)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.84</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.46
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.84

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Calls beyond free calling area (5)	\$0.45
2. <u>Late payment charge</u>	<u>\$0.27</u>
TOTAL	\$0.72

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$17.03

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Late payment fee \$0.20

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES \$0.20

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$17.33
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 9/1/10	\$12.50
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$37.83
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$55.16

October 7, 2010 (due 11/2/10)

I. Total of current charges \$18.38

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly service plan (10/7/10 – 11/6/10)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service \$8.87

2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.55)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.80</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.50
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.88

C. Miscellaneous charges	
1. Late payment fee	\$0.11
2. Calls beyond free calling area (1)	\$0.12
3. <u>Directory Assistance calls (1)</u>	<u>\$1.50</u>
TOTAL	\$1.73

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$18.18

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Late payment fee \$0.20

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES \$0.20

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$18.38
 PAYMENTS RECEIVED 10/1/10 \$12.50
 PAST DUE BALANCE \$42.66
 GRAND TOTAL DUE \$61.04

November 7, 2010 (due 12/6/10)

I. Total of current charges \$18.70

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (11/7/10 – 12/6/10)	
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.55)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.80</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.50
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.88

C. Miscellaneous charges	
1. Calls beyond free calling area (1)	\$0.16
2. Late payment charge	\$0.39
3. <u>Directory Assistance calls (1)</u>	<u>\$1.50</u>
TOTAL	\$2.05

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$18.50

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Late payment fee \$0.20

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES \$0.20

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$18.70

PAYMENTS RECEIVED 11/1/10 \$12.50

PAST DUE BALANCE \$48.54

GRAND TOTAL DUE \$67.24

December 7, 2010 Bill (due 1/3/11)

I. Total of current charges \$17.04

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (12/7/10 – 1/6/11)	
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.55)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.80</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.45
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.83

C. Miscellaneous charges	
1. Calls beyond free calling area (2)	\$0.31
2. <u>Late payment fee</u>	<u>\$0.23</u>
TOTAL	\$0.44

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$16.84

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Late payment fee \$0.20

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	\$0.20
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$17.04
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 11/29/10	\$13.00
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$54.24
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$71.28

January 7, 2011 (due 2/2/11)

I. Total of current charges \$15.20

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (1/7/11 -- 2/6/11)

1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.55)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.80</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57

B. Taxes and surcharges

1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.39
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.77

C. Miscellaneous charges

1. Late payment fee	\$0.66
2. Calls beyond free calling area (1)	\$0.09
3. <u>Rate change adjustment -- credit</u>	<u>(\$2.09)</u>
TOTAL - credit	(\$1.34)

TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES \$15.00

III. Breakdown of non-basic charges

A. Late payment fee \$0.20

TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES \$0.20

GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES \$15.20

PAYMENTS RECEIVED 0

PAST DUE BALANCE \$71.28

GRAND TOTAL DUE \$86.48

February 7, 2011 Bill (due 3/7/11)

I. Total of current charges \$17.99

II. Breakdown of basic charges

A. Monthly calling plan (2/7/11 – 3/6/11)	
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.55)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.80</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57
B. Taxes and surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.46
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>
TOTAL	\$1.84
C. Miscellaneous charges	
1. Calls beyond free calling area (2)	\$0.54
2. <u>Late payment fees</u>	<u>\$0.84</u>
TOTAL	\$1.38
TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$17.79
III. Breakdown of non-basic charges	
A. Late payment fee	\$0.20
TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	\$0.20
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$17.99
PAYMENTS RECEIVED	0
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$86.48
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$104.47

March 7, 2011 (due 4/4/11)

I. Total of current charges	\$16.40
II. Breakdown of basic charges	
A. Monthly calling plan	
1. Flat Rate Unlimited Service	\$8.87
2. Lifeline 135 credit	(\$7.55)
3. Dial Tone Line Charge	\$7.45
4. <u>Federal Subscriber Line Charge</u>	<u>\$5.80</u>
TOTAL	\$14.57
B. Taxes and surcharges	
1. Federal Excise Tax	\$0.45
2. PA Gross Receipts Tax	\$0.30
3. PA Relay Surcharge	\$0.08
4. <u>E911 Fee</u>	<u>\$1.00</u>

TOTAL	\$1.83
TOTAL OF BASIC CHARGES	\$16.40
III. Breakdown of non-basic charges – none	
TOTAL OF NON-BASIC CHARGES	0
GRAND TOTAL OF CURRENT CHARGES	\$16.40
PAYMENTS RECEIVED 3/3/11	\$25.00
PAST DUE BALANCE	\$0
GRAND TOTAL DUE	\$16.40

- Verizon issued a courtesy credit on March 7, 2011 in the amount of \$79.47
This credit cleared the past due balance on the live account.
- Verizon issued a 2nd courtesy credit on March 7, 2011 in the amount of \$105.22.
This credit was applied to the Complainant's non-basic final bill and cleared the balance on the non-basic final bill account.

RECEIVED
2012 JUL 31 PM 1:42
MA: JF
SECRETARY S BUREAU

BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION


GARY GASKINS, :
 :
 Complainant :
 :
 v. : Docket No. C-2010-2195549
 :
 VERIZON PENNSYLVANIA INC. :
 Respondent :

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have this day served a true copy of the foregoing document upon the parties, listed below, in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a party).

VIA FIRST CLASS MAIL

Gary Gaskins
2122 Sigel Street
Philadelphia, PA 19145



Steven K. Haas

Dated this 31st day of July, 2012

RECEIVED
2012 JUL 31 PM 1:42
SECRETARY'S BUREAU