

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA

PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Application of Gardner Moving Company For amendment to its common carrier certificate: A-00108945 SO AS TO PERMIT the transportation of household: F0001AMA goods in use, between points within an airline : radius of seventy-five (75) statute miles of the Allegheny County Courthouse, located in the: city of Pittsburgh, Allegheny County.

Docket No.

Initial Hearing.

Pages 1 through 102

State Office Building 300 Liberty Avenue Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Thursday, August 12, 1999

Met, pursuant to notice, at 10:00 a.m.

BEFORE:

JOHN H. CORBETT, JR., Administrative Law Judge

APPEARANCES:

MARK C. STEPHENSON, Esquire Cozen & O'Connor 1900 Market Street Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103 (For the Applicant)

WILLIAM A. GRAY, Esquire Vuono & Gray 2310 Grant Building Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219 (For Protestants)

1999 SEP 7

DOCUMENT

Commonwealt **C**ompany, Inc.

700 Lisburn Road Camp Hill, Pennsylvania 17011

(717) 761-7150

1-800-334-1063

6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

2

3

APPEARANCES (Continued):

JOHN A. PILLAR, Esquire 1106 Frick Building
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219
(For Protestants)

WITNESS INDEX

WITNESS	DIRECT	CROSS	REDIRECT	RECROSS
Joseph P. Gardner (By Mr. Stephenson) (By Mr. Pillar) (By Mr. Gray)	6 	28 50	 	
Joseph F. Gardner (By Mr. Stephenson) (By Mr. Gray)	69 	 76	 	
Gina Lison (By Mr. Stephenson) (By Mr. Pillar) (By Mr. Gray)	78 	 89 93		

EXHIBIT INDEX

- 1			EAR	TDII	INDEX	
2	NUMI	BERS	5	FOR	<u>IDENTIFICATION</u>	IN EVIDENCE
3	For_	<u>the</u>	<u>Applicant</u>			
4	No.	1	(Operating Authority	у)	10	68
5.	No.	2	(Application)		11	68
6	No.	3	(Assessment Report)		15	68
7	No.	4	(Financial Statement	t)	12	68
8						
9						
10						
11			Any reproduction	ı of	this transcript	is
12	prohibited without authorization by the certifying reporter.				tne	
13						
14						
15						
16	U.					
17	I					

a

PROCEEDINGS

10:35 a.m.

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE JOHN CORBETT: We will go on the record at this time. This is the time and place scheduled for a hearing on the application of Gardner Moving Company. This application was docketed with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission at A-00108945, Folder 1, Amendment A. I am Administrative Law Judge John Corbett and I have been assigned to hear this case and to render an initial decision.

We have in the hearing room this morning, Mark
Stephenson representing the applicant, Gardner Moving
Company. We also have counsel representing the
protestants, John Pillar and Bill Gray. I am going to
dispense with reading the names of the protestants because
by my count, there are 13 protestants and they appear on
the appearance sheet.

I should note that we are getting started at approximately 10:35 this morning. Prior to going on the record, the parties have had a discussion among themselves relating to mutual interests and the possibility of restrictive amendments that would satisfy the interest of the protestants, and to this point, those discussions have not been fruitful so we are going proceed.

Are there any other preliminary matters that need to

MR. STEPHENSON: No, Your Honor. 2 JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Stephenson, we will turn it over 3 to you. Will you call your first witness, please? MR. STEPHENSON: Thank you. My first witness will be 5 Joseph Gardner. 6 JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Gardner, would you raise your 7 right hand, please, and be sworn? 8 Whereupon, 9 JOSEPH P. GARDNER 10 having been duly sworn, testified as follows: 11 JUDGE CORBETT: Would you begin by giving us your 12 full name, please? 13 THE WITNESS: My name is Joseph P. Gardner. 14 JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Stephenson, you may continue. 15 MR. STEPHENSON: Thank you, Your Honor. 16 DIRECT EXAMINATION 17 BY MR. STEPHENSON: 18 By whom are you employed? Q 19 Α Gardner Moving. 20 What position do you hold with Gardner Moving? Q 21 Α I'm the president. 22 Q Are you a shareholder of the company? 23 Yes. Α 24 How many shares do you hold? Q 25

be addressed before we proceed to hear testimony?

3	A	Yes, my brother and father, Joseph F., and
4	Michael W	illiam.
5	Q	What shares do they hold?
6	A	My father holds a 15 percent share and my brother
7	a 35 perc	ent share.
8	Q	What is your home address?
9	A	My home address is 130 Pinewood Drive, South
10	Fayette,	Bridgeville, 15017.
11	Q	How long have you worked for Gardner Moving?
12	A	I've owned Gardner Moving with my father,
13	originall	y 23 years ago worked for him through high school.
14	Q	How old are you now?
15	A	Forty-seven.
16	Q	So, you started working there in high school. Is
17	it fair t	o say you have been working there
18	A	I answered the phones probably at 12, 13 years
19	old.	
20	Q	Is it fair to characterize Gardner Moving as a
21	family-ru	n business?
22	A	It doesn't get any more family than Gardner
23	Moving.	
24	Q	What, until two years ago, was the primary
25	business	address of Gardner Moving?

A Fifty percent.

Q Are there any other shareholders?

1

Gardner Moving was run out of the dining room. At this point, where does Gardner Moving maintain office space? We built a self-storage facility in South Fayette Township near Cecil, Pennsylvania. It's -- we opened it up, I believe, in March of 1997. Along with the selfstorage, we built a small office and we park our trucks and operate our business out there now. Does your father still conduct any of the business of Gardner Moving from his home? Yes, oh, yes. He does a lot of the paperwork and books at home. Cecil, Pennsylvania is in what county? Q Α Washington County. How long has Gardner Moving been in operation? Q Legend has back to the 1920's; 1921 is the oldest Α receipts we can find. I could have been longer than that. My grandfather started the business over in the south side. They used to move coal, very few homes, but they used to move buildings, pick them up and move them.

It was 3236 Beacon Hill Avenue in Dormont.

That's my father's home. More specifically,

What place is that?

Α

0

Α

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

They participated in moving the city morgue to its

present location. They moved a few of the buildings around

it. People may recognize out on West Liberty Avenue, there's the Congregational Home. They moved that up onto the hill. That's how we got our start.

Q If your grandfather formed Gardner Moving, did your father work there?

A Yes. My father worked for my grandfather, I guess is how you would put it. Then when my grandfather passed away, my father ran the company for his mother to support her. He was also a full-time steel worker, so it was kind of a part-time thing for my dad to help support my grandmother.

When she passed away, he got full authority over it and ran it, continued to run it part-time, weekends and an after work kind of thing until I came along and took it over in 1976. That's when we turned Gardner Moving to full-time again.

MR. STEPHENSON: Your Honor, I have taken the liberty of already providing copies of our exhibits to counsel. I would provide the three sets to you now in full rather than go through constantly handing them out.

JUDGE CORBETT: All right. You can hand two to the court reporter and one to myself.

MR. STEPHENSON: All right.

(Counsel distributing document.)

JUDGE CORBETT: Thank you.

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

I would ask you to take a look at what has been marked as Exhibit Number 1. Can you identify that document, please?

> (Whereupon, the document was marked as Applicant's Exhibit No. 1 for identification.)

- Α That's our operating authority.
- As it stands right now? Q
- As it stands right now. Α
- In summary, what does your current operating Q authority permit you to do?

It permits to move to and from, to all points in Allegheny County and to take people form Allegheny County to all points in Pennsylvania except for, I believe, part of Dauphin County, Harrisburg, Chester County and Bucks County, I think. Let me see.

(Witness reviewing document.)

Dauphin County and Montgomery County; it's not Bucks County, it's Montgomery. It's around Philadelphia somewhere.

- Q. You filed an application for additional authority; is that correct?
 - Α Yes.
 - Q I am showing you Exhibit Number 2. Is this a

Commission? 2 (Whereupon, the document was marked as Applicant's Exhibit No. 2 for 4 identification.) 5 Yes. Α 6 In there, I direct your attention specifically to 7 what is called Attachment A. Okay. Α 9 Can you identify Attachment A? 10 Α Yes. 11 Is this the additional authority you are asking 12 for in this application? 13 Yes. 14 Could you briefly summarize the additional Q. 15 authority you are asking for? 16 Well, the authority would give me -- we have 17 Allegheny County and points out and it covers all these 18 points within this 75 miles. What we would like to have is 19 the authority to go out to these points and move people 20 back or in between those points. I guess that's what... 21 Basically point to point within the 75 mile 22 radius? 23 Point to point within 75 miles, yes. Α 24 Q Before we leave this, I would like direct your 25

copy of the application that has been filed with the

attention to one other piece of Exhibit Number 2. In Exhibit Number 2, you have filed a statement of financial position as of 12-31-97; is that correct?

A Yes.

- Q At my request, have you made an attempt to update that information for purposes of this hearing?
 - A Yes.
 - Q Is Exhibit 4 that update?

(Whereupon, the document was marked as Applicant's Exhibit No. 4 for identification.)

A Yes.

Q What is currently the financial position of Gardner Moving Company?

A We are as strong as we have every been. We don't owe anyone anything other than a loan or two on a pickup truck and a car. We have no outstanding debts. We have very few receivables. We maintain a cash balance, roughly, month in and month out, and we support three families from it.

Q Does the statement submitted as part of the application in Exhibit 2 and Applicant's Exhibit 4 accurately reflect the current financial position of your company?

A Yes.

1

3

4

7

8

9 10

11

12

13 14

15

16

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24 25

Has Gardner Moving contemplated either Q liquidating itself or seeking the protection of the Bankruptcy Act?

No.

Is there any obligation to which Gardner Moving is subject that would cause you to be unable to continue to performing services?

Α No.

Let's turn to the questions of your ability to provide service.

> Yes, sir. Α

What equipment does Gardner Moving have that it 0 uses for the purposes of providing service?

Α We own three trucks, three moving vans, one pickup truck and a car. We provide -- I think I lost track of your question.

I appreciate your candor and I know you're nervous.

> Α Yes.

If you need to take a break for a moment, just say so, and I'm am sure the Judge will accommodate you.

> No, that's all right. Α

The question, in terms of your ability to provide service to the public, could you provide the kinds of equipment that you have that you use to perform the kind of transportation we are talking about here?

A Well, basically we own three vehicles to perform moving services, and we own a pickup truck. They are fully-equipped, modern, up to date.

- Q That's the three trucks?
- A Yes.

- Q How big are the trucks?
- A They are all one is a 28-foot cab-over configuration. Two are 26-foot conventional trucks. One is the extra wide, one is the regular. They are all capable of handling moves up to eight, nine rooms. They are among the largest you can put out on the highway without getting into a tractor trailer.
 - Q What is their current condition?
- A All the trucks are maintained to the highest standard. I mean we operate them ourselves, so we get everything taken they are not the newest trucks on the road, but they are certainly worthy.
 - Q Are they all currently inspected by the state?
- A They are inspected by the state twice a year. We do our own maintenance. Anything major, we farm out to qualified Mack Truck repair service or Freightliner, but minor repairs we do ourselves.
- Q Have you ever been stopped by Commission enforcement officers for the purposes of a safety check?

2	of state on we operate out of state on we lease
3	through South Hills Movers, and we have had several safety
4	checks at weigh stations and we have never failed a safety
5	check.
6	Q So, it's accurate to say that you have never been
7	cited for a safety violation on your equipment?
8	A Of any kind, no.
9	Q Have you ever been cited by the Commission for
10	any reason?
11	A No.
12	Q Is Gardner Moving up to date with all that its
13	required filings with the Commission?
14	A Yes, to the best of my knowledge. My father does
15	all that.
16	Q I show you the 1998 Assessment Report marked as
17	Exhibit Number 3. Has that been filed with the Commission?
18	(Whereupon, the document was marked
19	as Applicant's Exhibit No. 3 for
20	identification.)

Never Pennsylvania PUC; we have been stopped out

Yes. A

21

22

23

24

25

Α

In addition to the equipment, does Gardner Moving Q maintain any storage space that it uses in to assist in the transportation of these goods?

We lease space through our own -- we own Secure

q

Storage, which is a self-storage facility; not Gardner Moving, but my brother, father and I.

We lease space from Secure Storage for Gardner Moving for storage of cartons, moving equipment, dollys that type of things, pads. We rent space to customers for self-storage, for storage purposes. We don't have a warehouse facility to speak of.

Q But, your company has access to storage space?

A Oh, yes. We rent some storage space when people ask us to do that. We will arrange the storage for them.

Q Is this space adequate and safe for the purposes of maintaining customers' household goods?

A Yes.

Q At my request, have you gone back and examined your claims history to determine what claims for damages have been made against you by customers?

A I talked to our insurance agent yesterday, and we have a pretty good record for not having any problems. I had them check all the way back to 1993. We had no claims in 1999 so far. We had no claims in 1998, 1997 and 1996.

In 1995, we had one claim. Excuse me. In 1996, we had one claim. In 1995, we had no claims. In 1993, we had one small claim and in 1994, we had one small claims. All those claims total less than \$775 in six years.

Now, there are always small, little things we handle

in-house. There is going to be a here or there type of little thing that we handle, but anything of any significance we file it.

Q Have you ever had a complaint brought against you with the Commission --

A None.

Q --- by a customer of your move resulting from damage or the way movers handled it?

A None.

Q Now, sir, you have brought an application on behalf of Gardner Moving seeking additional authority in a 75-mile radius from the Allegheny County Court House. Is that correct?

A Yes.

Q What reason do you have to believe that there is a need for additional service within the area that you have requested?

A We spent a lifetime building a reputation for doing a good job for people at a fair price. Hopefully, I like to think that that is paying off to the point where we get a lot of calls from people, from friends of people we have moved, daughter, sons, whatever, and a lot of those folks we have moved out to these outlying areas.

Not just in recent years, but over the last eight, ten years, I have noticed that that number is increasing.

We get a lot of calls from not just friends and recommendations, but we also have people that we have moved out that now want to move back or relocate in these areas.

It's hard to explain to somebody that we can't do that for them. They call on the phone and they say, you know, my daughter wants to move a dining room set back to Squirrel Hill. I can't help them with that. You know, I want to give a piano to my niece or nephew. I can't help you with that.

We get quite a few of those calls. I can't give you a definite, definitive number, but we get a lot of those calls.

Q Let me direct your attention to the area of Washington County. Would that fall within the area that you are requesting additional authority for?

A Yes.

Q Do you receive any contact from people in Washington County seeking to use Gardner Moving?

A Yes, we get quite a few.

Q Could you explain why that happens?

A Well, not only have we built the reputation that I was just speaking of, that we have done a lot of moving out there, taking people from Allegheny County out to Washington County, but since we have moved to the storage facility, it is so close to Washington County now and we

are right along the four-lane highway, people see us. We are highly visible. We have our name out there.

Obviously, we put a sign out on the road. We are less than — as they are driving by, within the next 45 seconds, they are in Washington County and they are starting to call. They want our storage facility or they want just a local move. It's starting to generate calls, as you would hope in any business.

I have to tell those people that are literally less than a mile from where we are at that I can't help them. If they are moving from Bridgeville out there, I can help them, but I can't take them from Cecil to my storage facility or Cecil across the line into South Fayette. So, we are in that position where we need to be able to do a little more.

- Q Do you know a person by the name of Bob Rose?
- A Yes.
- Q Who is Bob Rose?

A Bob Rose is a gentleman that we have moved from Green Tree, Allegheny County, out to Washington County.

He's a real estate agent. I didn't do the job personally.

I think one of our men did. But, apparently he was quite happy with the job and he refers us a lot.

Q Is there anything unusual about Mr. Rose's move that you understand impressed him?

A Well, yes. I guess, it's a simple fact and I'm sure their clients do close to the same. He had all white carpeting, as everybody does now, and we did this job.

Apparently it was pouring down rain, and we did this job without leaving a foot print, as he says, on his carpeting.

- Q Getting back to the guestion...
- A We took a lot of care, I guess.
- Q Getting back to the question of your reputation, have you had circumstances to do a move that would give you a fair bit of other work, and I direct your attention to a Mr. Rogers?

A Mr. Rogers does a series of books for children, first trip to the doctor, first trip to the dentist, this that and the other thing.

One of the books they did was for children who are going to be moving since moving is traumatic to small children sometimes. We did that book with him.

We were asked to do that because we had done some work for QED. We had moved some antiques from the Museum of Fine Arts over to QED. This was years and years ago. When they were doing the filming for their renaissance, they were doing Shakespeare kind of things. I never saw the film, so I don't know, but we picked up certain pieces from that era for when they were doing this filming.

We did some work for QED and we also did some work

2

3

5

6

7

R

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

for Mr. Rogers and they asked us to participate in this book that was published.

- Q Have these different things helped to improve Gardner Moving's reputation in the community?
 - A Yes, I would hope so.
- Q Let's direct your attention up to the Butler County area. Have you had contact with any realtors in the Butler County area who service the Butler County area?
 - A Yes.
 - Q Who would that be?
- A You are referring to Madge Hamel. She refers us regularly for business. Her home is out Route 8, just about almost to the Butler County line. She works out there as a real estate agent. We moved here many years ago, and she refers us constantly.
- Q Do you have an understanding as to why the real estate agents are seeking out Gardner Moving?

MR. PILLAR: Objection, hearsay.

MR. GRAY: Objection.

JUDGE CORBETT: I will sustain that.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

- Q Does Gardner Moving provide any services that, to your understanding, may not be offered by other moving companies in the Washington County area, for example?
 - A Well, we all primarily have the same service or

else we wouldn't be full-service movers, but some movers charge differently than others. Our rates are competitive with most family operations within \$5 one way or another.

Some have restrictions that others don't. Some will charge minimums that we don't. Some charge a five-hour minimum. Some charge different on Saturdays. Some charge whatever they do.

We don't charge a minimum. We do a lot of small movings, and hopefully people get what they pay for.

Q Do you charge any minimum travel time?

A Yes. We charge an hour travel time no matter where we go in the county. That's in our tariff.

Q Is that typical?

A Yes, I think that's pretty much of an industry — I don't know of any that don't.

Q Would it be fair to say then that for people are looking to move, for example, a piece of furniture or a small amount of furniture, you provide an extra service of transporting that property for the time actually spent rather than a minimum?

A Yes.

Q Are you aware of anyone in Washington County who provides that same type of rate charge for that service?

A I believe the people in question in Washington County charge minimums.

Δ

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

What is your understanding of the minimum rate Q. being charged by other moving companies in Washington County?

I think some have as high as a four plus one, Α which is a five-hour minimum. I am not aware of what they all charge, but I have been told that's what some of them charge.

If you were granted this additional authority, what is your anticipation of the increased number of household moves that you moves that you would expected to service, let's say, on a weekly basis?

> А It's hard to...

MR. PILLAR: If I could interrupt for just a minute, are we confining this to Washington County or is this the entire area?

MR. STEPHENSON: I would be happy to clarify the question. Thank you, Mr. Pillar.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

If you take a look at the entire request for additional authority, what do you anticipate would be the additional work load that Gardner Moving would be accepting under this additional authority; how many additional moves do you think you would have to perform in a week on average?

Α Well, I would be happy -- I think one a week,

maybe two, and that's really hard to say. In the winter time when things are slow, there may be — a month could go by without doing anything in this area, but in the summer, people are searching for movers. Lots of movers are booked solid.

We have been turning down work. They've been turning down work, I'm sure, because they are booked, so people are desperate for a mover that can do the job that they want. In the summer, there is a need, a true need for service.

Q That leads me to the next question which is to what extent is Gardner Moving already occupied in its capacity on any given week during the general moving season in the summer?

A In the summer, we run pretty strong. We could always do a little more. Some weeks you can't do more. Some weeks you are looking for work. Mid-month is not as heavy as the end of the month, which is a problem in our business.

You try to keep good quality help. You can work them to death at the end of the month. You can be a little short of hours in the middle of the month. I'm hoping that this will even out my business a little bit, or help even it out.

Q Let me direct your attention -- we have talked about Washington County specifically and Butler County.

There are other geographic areas inside this radius. What needs you to believe that there is additional service in those areas?

- A Well, we occasionally get calls.
- Q With what frequency do you get those kinds of calls?

A That's really hard to say. My father answers most of the calls and a lot of them I don't hear about, but when I am in the office, I occasionally pick up a call. What frequency, that's kind of hard to say, but maybe a couple a week that I would answer

Q Generally what is the nature of the inquiries you are getting?

A Just somebody from Beaver, Butler, wherever, out in Westmoreland, will call, you know, somebody that we've moved out there, maybe even somebody that just heard of us. We will get a call and they'll say I've got this move or I'm moving back to Monroeville or I'm moving out to wherever, and we basically have to say we can't do that.

Q What reaction do you get from people when you tell them that?

A Well, we are all familiar with the PUC and how it works. Most people aren't. Most people don't understand. They see your name in the Yellow Pages under moving. They don't understand why you can't move them.

In fact, with older people, it's harder to explain. With younger people, you just kind of explain it, but older folks — we do a lot of that type of work. We do a lot of senior work. They don't understand, and sometimes I honestly get the feeling that they think you don't want to help them.

Q We have talked about the frequency of contacts you get from Washington County and Butler County, but if you were granted authority for this other area, how frequently would you be expecting to receive requests for service that you would be able fill from those area?

A I would hope there would be at least a few movings a week, a few jobs a week. You would get a lot of calls. That doesn't always mean that you could service every call or are going to get every job that calls in.

I would like to at least be able to -- you know, if somebody calls me from Westmoreland or wherever and says, you know, you moved a friend of mine and they said you did a great job, I would like to be able to say that I will try and do the same kind of great job for them.

Q If Gardner Moving were to be granted the additional authority that is requested in this application, do you believe that you have sufficient financial resources and equipment and man hours to provide service to the areas that you requested?

q

A Oh, yeah. We run a schedule. You book them first come, first serve, excluding people that you really try to help out, you know, that are stuck. Yes, I think we would be able to service the customer base that we build up.

Q Have you kept yourself familiar with, for example, residential building and sales and that sort of thing in the area?

A I think all the outlying areas are growing and I think maybe that is why this is becoming an issue with me. Allegheny County people are spreading out. We're moving them out. I think we need to be able to go out and make their next move wherever that might be. I mean, you build that reputation and you do a good job not hoping for just a one-time shot.

Q Is it your understanding that there is sufficient increase in residences in, for example, Washington County and Butler County to warrant additional need?

A Absolutely. All the counties are building up surrounding the area. People are leaving Allegheny County. I like Allegheny County, but the taxes are little high, and you hear that frequently.

People are moving out to Washington or out to Butler, Beaver, wherever, because you can buy the same house and pay half the taxes, so there is a lot of movement out. If

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q

Α

you check the demographics, I think Allegheny County has lost some serious amount of folks to the other outlying counties. No further questions. MR. STEPHENSON: JUDGE CORBETT: Who wants to go first? MR. PILLAR: I'm ready. JUDGE CORBETT: All right, Mr. Pillar. CROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. PILLAR: Mr. Gardner, who is Patricia? Q That's my mother. Α That's your mother; is she still living? Q. Α Yes. And, your Attachment B to your application shows Q that Patricia actually owns 15 shares; is that correct? Yes. That's my father and mother. That's their portion of it. They own 15 shares together? Α Yes. Aside from you, your brother and your father, Q what other employees do you have? We have -- my son joined us recently. He works Α for us.

What is his name?

Michael.

O How old is he?

A He's 23.

q

Q Is he full-time?

A Yes, and we have, I would say, counting the three of us, we probably have a total of 11 people working.

Q Full-time, part-time?

A Full and part; as I said, the moving business fluctuates up and down. Sometimes they are fuller than they want to be. Sometimes they are parter (sic) than they want to be, but it does go up and down.

Q So, these people are people who would be there either on a regular basis or who would be on call when you needed them?

A Yes.

Q So, when you don't need their services, you are not paying them; they are just sort of on temporary layoff?

A Yes, but they average — we try to make work when it's slow, you know, a little bit of truck cleaning and that kind of thing. We try to generate some time for them in slow times, but sometimes in the winter, you can't do that.

Q The PUC rights that you have now authorize service, the household goods rights that is, between points in Allegheny County and from points in Allegheny County to virtually all points in Pennsylvania?

A Yes.

g

- Q With a few exceptions?
- A With a few exceptions, yes.
- Q How did you obtain that authority?

A We got that, I am just going to guess, ten years ago, 12 years ago, something like that. We applied for it and we were granted it. We had a 15-mile radius of the city, which encompassed all but -- because Allegheny County is more square than it is round, it took us into Washington County, actually, but it lopped off part of the northern part of Allegheny County, so what we did was we just tried to make it more reasonable.

Q At the time you acquired that authority, you, your brother and father were all active in the business?

A Yes.

Q So, you were operating under that 15-mile radius authority up until about ten years ago?

A Yes, approximately.

Q For the past ten years, you have had state-wide authority as well as county-wide authority in Allegheny County?

A Yes.

Q Did you prepare, for this hearing, any type of study, a map, anything showing what service area would be encompassed by the 75-mile radius?

A Well, did I prepare it to hand out?

Q Did you prepare one at all?

A Yeah, well, I did the same thing that you have in front of you. I swung the 75-mile radius from the center of the city. That's what I did.

Q Do you have that with you?

A No.

Q Did you actually do a type of map that would actually show accurately where the court house is and what the 75-mile radius reaches?

A From the exact court house, no. I took a map, the same as what you have, and I took a center point and a radius and I — actually, what I did was I tried to figure out what would encompass Hidden Valley and Seven Springs. That's how I based it.

That's because we have moved a lot of folks out there and we have had a lot of people that buy summer homes and, for one reason or another, the kids don't want to go up and ski anymore or this or that. They want to move back and we cannot do that.

Q Are Seven Springs and Hidden Valley the extremity of 75 miles?

A Yes, I believe so.

Q When you did the financial statement, you attached to your application, the 12-31-97 balance sheet of

the corporation. There is no income statement attached.

Am I correct on that?

- A I don't see one.
- Q You did what you characterized, or what your counsel characterized, as sort of a follow-up balance sheet, this Exhibit 4?
 - A Yes.

- Q As of what date is this balance sheet?
- A As of yesterday.
- Q As of yesterday?
- A Yeah, I called my accountant. He gave me the numbers and I filled it in.
- Q Now, I take it that since the 1997, which would be about two years ago, it looks like motor vehicle equipment...
- A I think it was on the wrong line on the one that's in the application because we have no buildings or structures and it shows buildings and structures, and it was just...
 - Q So that's a...
- A Yes, that's a typo. I'm sorry. It's listed under building and structures. He advised me yesterday that that was on the wrong line, so we moved it up one.
- There's been a little bit of a change of equipment.

 I'm not sure if it's the pickup truck that we purchased or

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

the car or whatever that changed that number a little bit upward, but that's what the difference on that line is.

Q Okay. You have something called Other Current Assets, \$17,460. That's considerable more than you had in 1997. What is that number?

A Oh, well, we are keeping a higher cash -- cash in our checking account, I think is what most of it is.

Q I'm sorry, that's the total. I'm looking at the wrong line. I see it. You have answered it.

A Okay.

Q These vehicles that you operate, the 28-foot cabover, what year and make is that?

A That's a Mack mid-liner, 1985 or 1986. The other conventional is a 1985 or 1986 Mack also. The Freight Liner is a 1993. That's a conventional, 26-foot also. We own a 1997 pickup truck and a car.

Q Are you the person that would go out and do estimates and things like that?

A Fortunately, my brother does a lot of that, but yes, my brother and I do that. He does most of it.

MR. STEPHENSON: For the record, give his name.

THE WITNESS: Michael William Gardner.

BY MR. PILLAR:

Q. You indicated you work for South Hills Movers; is that correct?

A No. What we do is we have a lease, I think it's called a lease agreement, with them. This is another example of people will call us and say we are moving to Florida, we're moving wherever, can you do this for us. For the longest time, we didn't. We didn't even think about doing any long distance until we got into these new types of trucks, these diesels.

We spoke with South Hills and they said we could sign this. I didn't want to go with a national van line to do these things. I didn't want to lose Gardner Moving in the shuffle. I signed with them and all I do is pay them a percentage of the line haul.

Q So, you don't have an agency agreement with a national van line?

A No, I do not.

Q As I understand it — when did you establish this relationship with South Hills Movers?

A I am just going to guess in the early 1980s, somewhere like that.

Q On your annual report, your assessment report, you do not report any interstate revenue?

A No, I don't think we do. We would have to ask my dad about that, but I don't think so.

Q I am looking at your 1998 assessment report and it shows \$280,794 in total intrastate revenues and no

interstate revenues.

A Yeah. I think we list that -- I could be wrong. I'm just trying to tell you what I think. I think we list that as other income and it's not on the PUC report. I don't know. You would have to...

- Q If you don't know, I don't want you to guess.
- A I'm not sure.
- Q But, what I am asking, though, is you do have interstate revenues that you earn for moves you make under the operating rights of South Hills Movers?

A Yes. I think last year — I counted those yesterday when I was going over it to try to get an idea of how many moves we do a year. I think we did less than, and last year was the most we ever did — I think we did 11 actual out of state moving. Years prior to that, it would be less than five.

- Q What was your revenue from those 11 moves; do you know that?
 - A I didn't total them, sir. I don't know.
- Q When you handle these moves with South Hills Movers, do I understand that you bill the customer after you make the move?
- A We don't do any billing. They usually give us a check at the end of the job.
 - Q In other words, --

1

2

3

4

12

13

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I just... Α

-- the bill of lading shows Gardner Moving as the carrier?

- No, it shows South Hills Movers as the carrier. Α
- If that's the case, then does South Hills Movers 0 collect the money from the customer?
 - No, we give them the money and they pay us. Α
 - You give whom the money? Q.
 - Α South Hills Movers.
 - How do you get the money? Q.
 - Α They pay.
 - The customer pays you? Q
- The customer pays us and sometimes they make the check out to Gardner Moving and sometimes they make it out to South Hill, whichever case. Then we pay them or they pay us back whatever our share of it is.
- So, there's no consistency here. It's not always Q made out to South Hills Movers and sometimes it's made out to Gardner Moving?
- Yes, because it's confusing. Because the bill of lading says South Hills Movers on it, a lot of times they will make the check out to South Hills Movers. Sometimes the people don't look at the top of the bill of lading and they make it out to Gardner Moving, whichever.
 - Do you enter into a lease arrangement every time Q

you make one of these moves for South Hills Movers?

- A No, it's an ongoing.
- Q So you sort of have a master lease where the trucks are leased to South Hills Movers?
 - A Two of them are, only two.
- Q And, they are leased continuously. In other words, the lease doesn't terminate in each...
- A I believe the way it is written is that at any time, they can terminate it, at any time, we can terminate, but it's an ongoing thing.
- Q In fact, the leases are not terminated. Every time you make a move for South Hills Movers, you don't then terminate the lease --
 - A No.
 - Q -- and redo the lease the next time?
 - A Yes, correct.
- Q So, the lease that you have entered into is a lease where the trucks are really under lease to South Hills Movers at all times even though you may be using them in service for Gardner Moving?
- A I can't answer that yes or no. I'm not sure how that works.
- Q I wanted to ask you a little bit about this storage space. You indicated that you established this facility when?

- About two years ago. Α
- In Cecil?
- No, it's in South Fayette.
- Is it in Allegheny County?
- Yes, it is.
- Where exactly is that?
- It is right on the border. As you go out 79, if you want directions if you want to come out and store something, you take the Bridgeville exit, but instead of heading in to Bridgeville, you would head out towards
 - Take Route 50?
- And, right before it turns into Cecil, where the farmers' market is, you turn the opposite way of the farmers' market. We are along Millers Run Road in Allegheny County.
- Okay. Do I understand that you lease space in that building?
 - Yes. We...
 - You are a renter?
 - Yes.
 - And, it's owned by Secured Storage?
 - Secure Storage.
 - What do you rent there?
 - We rent a locker to a large space. A

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q How large?

A It's ten by thirty, and that's sufficient to keep our boxes, our dollys, grinders and everything that we use to maintain the trucks, the oil and all that stuff. It's my dad's little heaven.

- Q You park your trucks there?
- A We park our trucks there.
- Q And, you have an office there?
- A And, we have an office there.
- Q What else do you rent there, anything else at this time?
 - A No.
- Q If somebody wants to move something and put it in storage, you indicated that you also provide the facilities for that two; is that in that same building?
- A Yes. It is a self-storage facility. Our customers are explained that we do not do the storage. It's not like going to Gardner Moving's warehouse. It is going to a self-storage facility.
- Q So, when somebody wants to store something, you make arrangements for them to self store it?
 - A Yes.
- Q You do not take possession and store it in a warehouse?
 - A No, we do not. There's no overlapping in -- you

know, that we are charging them, as Gardner Moving, a storage fee. No, it's not done that way. It's just done on a per move basis.

Q Have you actually done that; have you actually arranged for a customer to put his or her household goods into storage at that facility in self storage?

A Well, I guess the answer to that is yes. When somebody calls us and needs storage, they have three options. They can find a place, they can store it in somebody's basement or garage, they can find a self-storage facility or they can go with a moving company that has storage.

We have, for years, been taking people to various warehouse, various self-storage units around the city, and as anybody else, we saw the need for self-storage, so we built our own facility.

Now, when people call, many of our customers have already made arrangements with self-storage facilities near where they are at in the county. Some of them ask us if we have storage, and we do, so we service people to and from their own facilities. Some go to our facility. Some go a warehouse type of storage, and we will take them to whoever they want to make arrangements with.

Q Does your family, or you, or someone in your family have — do you own Secure Storage?

A Yes. That's what I stated. The family owns Secure Storage, yes.

- Q Is that a separate corporation?
- A Yes, it is.
- Q With the same stockholders as Gardner Moving?
- A Yes, and we did that basically for purposes of liability. We didn't want Gardner Moving to own this and we felt the need for it.
- Q So, Secure Storage then, if I wanted to store my household goods, if I wanted you move them, but the house is not ready to move into, you would then arrange for me to store my goods in Secure Storage. I would enter into a contract with Secure Storage
 - A Yes, it's a separate...
 - Q -- and pay them a storage fee?
- A Yes. Gardner Moving has nothing to do with the storage.
- Q You indicated that Madge Hamel is a potential witness for you?
 - A Yes.
 - Q And, she is employed by Howard Hanna Real Estate?
 - A Yes, I think.
 - Q I think you said you moved her once?
- A Yes, my brother moved her locally a long time ago.

- Q Within Allegheny County?
- A Yes.
- Q So, she lives in Allegheny County?
- A Yes, she does. It's similar to our situation. She lives right near the border, so a lot of the moves she refers to us are within Allegheny County.
- Q She does make referrals to you, but they are referrals, for the most part, they are referrals in fact, they are referrals you can handle now?
 - A No, I wouldn't go that far.
 - Q Why can't you handle them?
- A Because of her area, because of where she's at, they sell home that are in Butler County.
- Q Let me just ask you this, if Madge referred the first client to you from Butler County and you said, "Madge, we can't serve Butler County," are you telling me that Madge then keeps referring people from Butler County knowing that you can't serve it?
- A What I am telling you is, yes, we do get calls. I really don't...
 - Q I'm talking about Madge now, not others.
 - A Yeah.
- Q You told Madge you can't serve Butler County, and if Madge were here to testify, she would know that, right?
 - A Yes.

Q Are you saying that nevertheless, she keeps referring people from Butler County to you saying to call Gardner Moving?

A Yes, she does occasionally. I don't know why, but yes, we get calls from people say, "Madge told us to call you," and we can't do them. I think they don't keep track of our business. Somebody just says they need a mover kind of thing.

Q And, Bob Rose is someone you moved to Washington County; is that right?

- A Yes.
- Q And, he's also a realtor?
- A Yes.
- Q You testified that you have occasions when you move people to another county and then they may call you, or their sister may call you, or their brother may call you to say they want you to move a piano back or two rooms of furniture, or they may want to move, and one of your reasons that you have indicated for filing this application is you want to be able to service those customers?
 - A Yes.
- Q You recognize, by the same token, there are many moving companies located in the outlying counties who move people into Allegheny County and then get calls from those customers to move them and they can't serve them because

they can't serve Allegheny County. You know it's a two-way street, don't you?

A Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- O You recognize that?
- A I recognize that.
- Q You recognize that there may be moving companies like Gardner Moving in other counties that serve those counties, as you serve Allegheny County, who want to be able to serve customers that they transport to other areas, but because of Commission regulations, they can't do so?
 - A Yes.
 - Q Do you have a copy of your tariff?
 - A No, I didn't bring one with me. I'm sorry.
- Q You testified somewhat about your minimums. I'm not sure it's clear to me about that. You indicated that you do have a one-hour minimum?
 - A No, I...
 - Q You testified that you have a one-hour minimum?
- A No, I testified that we have a one-hour travel time.
 - Q One-hour travel time?
 - A Yes.
- Q I'm sorry. I mis-spoke. It's a one-hour charge over and about the actual working...
 - A Yeah, the actual working time. It's a charge

COMMONWEALTH REPORTING COMPANY (717) 761-7150

Both before and after the move?

25

ì

A No, that encompasses to and from. If you book a moving with me, no matter how small, no matter to and from, you are going to pay for the time that it takes to do that moving plus one hour.

Q Do you happen to know, Mr. Gardner, of the revenues that you had in 1998, of the \$280,794 in gross revenues intrastate, how many moves, independent moves, that represented.

- A Yes. I counted them yesterday.
- Q How many?
- A For 1998, I am equipped with that, 425 movings.
- Q When you counted those, you counted each separate move; for example, that would include a move of a whole household or it could have involved --
 - A Yes.
- Q -- a movement of a single item, an object, a refrigerator?
- A Yes, that was all the movings. They could have ranged in anything from a piano to a two or three day moving encompassing two or three trucks, but those are just per customer.
- Q On top of that 425 moves, you had 11 interstate moves?
 - A I believe that's what the number was, yes.
 - Q You indicated that you do get calls from outlying

areas. Do you get calls where people ask you to quote them a rate for a move?

A Yes.

Δ

Q Would you say that the majority of the calls you get, what the people are looking for is a rate; they are looking for — they are comparison shopping?

A No. No, I — it's hard to say majority.

Everybody you talk to, whether they are an old customer or not, always wants to know what the rates are that year.

Most of them, we haven't moved in a year or two or whatever, but to say that they are only calling for the rates, many people call when you have done work for them time after time. They call to say to do it, and oh, by the way, what's your hourly rate now.

Q You testified about that, but my question has to do with the fact that would you agree with me that many of the calls you get from customers outside — from customers you may not have served before, they are always asking you for a rate?

- A Surely, yes, I will agree with that.
- Q You have indicated that there has been a migration of population from Allegheny County to some of the surrounding counties?
 - A Yes.
 - Q Particularly, you have indicated Washington

County and Butler County. To the extent that there has been this migration from Allegheny County to those counties, Gardner Moving has benefitted from that because you have been able to make those moves?

A Yes.

Q

Q To the extent that there will continue to be this migration of moves from Allegheny County to Butler and Washington Counties, Gardner Moving should benefit from that because you have authority to make those moves, correct?

A Yes.

Q Do you handle any moves going to Philadelphia, to Harrisburg — well, I guess you can't say Harrisburg, but to other points in Pennsylvania; for example, of the 425 moves you made last year, how many of them involved moves beyond the 75-mile radius; did you do a study on that?

A Did I do a study on it.

Q Or, can you give me an idea?

A Can I give you an idea? I can give you a guess. I think we do Pennsylvania moves, a handful, ten, maybe a dozen. It depends on the year. I just did one up to Danville recently, but so far this summer, outside that area — for some reason, last year I was traveling all the time. This year, I'm all local. I don't know why, but it changes up and down.

2	Allegheny County?
3	A With just Allegheny County?
4	Q Or
5	A I didn't the only ones that were required to -
6	- I can tell you a definite within the city of
7	Pittsburgh is the only ones that we are required to say
8	that this one started in Pittsburgh and this ended in
9	Pittsburgh because of some tax that they have, so we have
10	to keep those separate.
11	Q How many of those were there?
12	A Probably around I am just going to have to
13	give you a guess.
14	Q I'd rather you
15	A Maybe a fourth of what we do
16	Q Don't guess.
17	A Okay. I don't know.
18	MR. PILLAR: Thanks. That's all.
19	THE WITNESS: Okay.
0	JUDGE CORBETT: Let's take a five-minute break at
21	this point
22	(Whereupon, a recess was taken.)
23	JUDGE CORBETT: We are back on the record.
4	Mr. Gray, you may proceed
5	MR. GRAY: Thank you, Your Honor.

Q How many of the 425 moves you handled were within

CROSS EXAMINATION

BY MR. GRAY:

Q I just have a few questions, additional questions, I should say. Mr. Gardner, as I look at the scope of your application requests, I note that, by my calculation, this application seeks authority in all or part of 17 different counties.

A I didn't count them.

Q I am going to go down the counties, and you tell me if there's any of them that you think this application does not request service in. I will just go down them.

A Do you have a copy of that because I don't know the counties by name, so I wouldn't know.

Q Do you want to look at a map?

A If that's okay. I really don't...

MR. STEPHENSON: Your Honor, I could move over while Mr. Gray asks his questions and he could sit here.

MR. GRAY: That's okay.

BY MR. GRAY:

Q This is just my drawing of the 75 miles. Would you agree with me that the 75 miles would include all or part of Mercer, Venango, Clarion, Jefferson, Lawrence, Butler, Armstrong, Indiana, Clearfield, Beaver, Allegheny, Westmoreland, Cambria, Washington, Greene, Fayette and Somerset counties?

l

 A Do you want me to...

Q Do you know any of those counties that your map of the 75 miles didn't include?

A No.

Q You do not intend to establish facilities in any of the other 16 counties besides Allegheny County, correct?

A No. No, I don't.

Q You do not intend to advertise your service in any of the other 16 counties besides Allegheny County, do you?

A How would I — that was — I don't intend to, but that was something that I offered as something that might acceptable to the other movers.

Q I understand that. My question is simply, do you intend to do that?

A No, I have no intentions at this time to do any advertising in those counties.

Q As I look at your operating authority in Exhibit

1, Applicant's Exhibit 1, do I understand that paragraphs

1 and 2 were authorities that have been in existence for many years?

A Yes.

Q Paragraph 3, do I understand replaced a paragraph that had been in existence for many years that authorized the transportation of household goods?

A I'm going to answer that, yes, because I am assuming that that was the paragraph that said we had household goods authority within 15 miles of the normal traveled routes, and that would have been similar to paragraph 1, --

Q Right.

A -- and that was our authority, yes, as I understood it.

Q Then was it in 1989 that you said that you got this authority?

A Something like that, yes. I'm not sure exactly when.

Q Have you provided service from Allegheny County to Chester County or Montgomery County; have you ever provided any service from Allegheny County to Chester County or Montgomery County?

A Nothing that...

MR. STEPHENSON: Objection as to when, prior to the...

MR. GRAY: Obviously, 15 miles...

THE WITNESS: No, I haven't.

MR. STEPHENSON: That's okay. I withdraw the objection.

THE WITNESS: I haven't. I'm not even sure -- I think Chester County is west of Philadelphia. Montgomery

ì

BY MR. GRAY: 2 The city of Philadelphia is Philadelphia County. 3 Where's Montgomery? There's a couple of them 4 their. I'm not -- I haven't... 5 When you get a call for service to the 6 Philadelphia area, do you bother to check to see whether --7 Yes, I would. Α 8 -- it's one of these counties? 9 I'm just confused at where that Montgomery County Α 10 I know it's like part of that, and the Harrisburg 11 thing is a definite -- you know, we're not allowed near Harrisburg. 13 JUDGE CORBETT: Please wait for Mr. Gray's question. 14 THE WITNESS: Okay. 15 BY MR. GRAY: 16 Have you ever provided service from Allegheny 17 County to Harrisburg or points within ten miles of 18 Harrisburg? 19 Α No. 20 You indicated that you have a lease with South 21 Hills Movers for interstate trips. 22 Uh-huh. Α 23 Do you ever lease your equipment to South Hills 24 Movers for intrastate trips? 25

County, I think is the city of Philadelphia proper.

moving company --3 No. 4 -- for... MR. STEPHENSON: Just wait for the question, okay. 6 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. 7 For intrastate trips? 8 To any other company for trips within the state 9 of Pennsylvania, no. 10 Where do you park the three vehicles when they 11 are not in use? 12 In South Fayette at the Secure Storage site. 13 You agree with me, do you not, that there are a 14 number of very qualified household goods movers in 15 Washington County? 16 Α I agree that I know of several that I feel are 17 quality companies. 18 And, they are physically located in Washington 19 County, correct? 20 Yes. Α 21 Q You indicated that Bob Rose has referred 22 customers to you. If, in fact, Bob Rose or anyone else who 23 is a realtor would refer a customer to you, they, the 24

Do you ever lease your equipment to any other

No.

Α

1

2

25

realtor, be it Bob Rose or any other realtor, would not pay

1

2

3

4

5

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

your for the service that you provide? I don't pay anyone for referrals. Α have. They wouldn't pay you and you wouldn't pay them, Q correct? I don't, yes. A In other words, you just deal directly with any Q customer that wants their household goods moved, correct? Α Yes. And, certainly the fact that Bob Rose or anybody Q. else might give your name to somebody doesn't mean that that party is going to use your service, correct? No, it does not. It just gives me a chance. It's correct, is it not, that it is sort of

> Ά Yes.

companies?

Q. And, you find that out all the time, that...

standard in the industry for someone who is having their

household goods moved to get estimates from a number of

Α Yes, more so than I wish, yes.

Q You are competing against somebody else for the business, correct?

> Α Yes.

You indicated that some companies, and I believe Q you were referring to Washington County, may charge

2

4

5

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

minimums. Are you prepared to state unequivocally what any minimums of any other companies are, or is this just your sense that they... I will be honest with you. All movers check other movers' prices. We checked who is doing what. my opinion that the last time that I checked, several of the movers in Washington County, and other movers, that they were charging minimums. 0 When was the last time that you checked? Yesterday. Α Q. Who did you check on yesterday? Yesterday I checked on Fife, Barber's company,

Anderson and All Ways Moving.

Q Did you call those companies directly yourself?

I had an employee call. Α

Surreptitiously? Q

I didn't think they would want to hear from Joe А Gardner.

> Q So, the answer is, yes, surreptitiously?

I think they probably gave their name. No, I mean...

> 0 You didn't tell this is Gardner Moving?

That I was checking on their rates? No, I did I'm sorry. I did not, but I'm sure that in my conversation with Barbara a week or so ago, she would have ı

told me her rates if I had asked.

Q Have you done a study, Mr. Gardner, of your own moves as to what percentage or what number of your own moves involve five hours or more of service?

A No, I have not. I have not done a study. We do -- a large number of our movings are under the \$450, \$500 range, which would tell me that a large percentage of our movings are, as with everybody, apartments that run three and four hours of work.

Q And, those generally are movements within Allegheny County?

A Well, yes, but they have apartments in other counties also.

Q But, you can't go to other counties to pick up, correct?

A Yes, but I mean I move people from Allegheny County to apartments in other counties. That's what I am referring to.

Q If you were to pick someone up in Pittsburgh and take them to Butler to move them to an apartment, that certainly is going to take you longer than five hours, is it not?

A Not necessarily; it would depend. They could move from Cranberry -- I mean Wexford into Butler and it could be -- it's the same move. Because of the hour travel

time, it doesn't really matter where the origin is. You could move somebody from Bethel Park to Butler, yes, it's going to be — obviously, it's going to be a longer move than somebody from Wexford to Butler County.

- Q Your hour travel time is at the same rate as your work time?
 - A Yes.

3

5

6

7

8

q

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- Q So that I understand that, if I live in Cecil and I want to move to another location in Cecil and it takes you two minutes to get from your garage to my house in Cecil to move me and two minutes to get back, you are going to charge me an hour
 - A Yes, I am.
 - Q -- even though you didn't...
- A But, I'm not going to do the move because that's Washington County.
 - Q But, if you get this authority, that's the case?
 - A Yeah.
 - Q I'll move my location inside Allegheny County.
 - A I thought you were trying to trip me up on that.
 - Q No, I wouldn't do that.
- A I was going to say to call Barbara Anderson and you will pay a five-hour minimum whether you like it or not.
 - Q It's going to take you two minutes to get to --

23

24

25

Q

--- my place in Allegheny County. You are going 2 0 to charge me an hour, right? 3 Yes. 4 Α 5 Q Α 6 -- the moving time is? Q. 7 Α Yes. 8 At the same rate? 0 9 10 11 12 understanding that hour travel time. 13 14 15 16 17 you an hour. 18 19 20 21 Α Yes. 22

And, then you are going to charge me whatever --Whatever the moving time is. Yes, and when I get a customer -- we will talk Allegheny/Allegheny now. When I get a customer and they ask us to explain our rates, many people will have trouble I explain to them in the best way I can that we are registered with an hour travel time. I cannot deviate from my tariff. Whether you live across the street from where I park my trucks and move half-way down the block, I charge Well, the same thing would apply to anybody that has a tariff that provides for a minimum, correct; they've got to say the same thing, we have a tariff and ---- and we have to live by our tariff, so... Q That we all have to abide... Α

Yeah, I understand your question.

Let me finish my question.

Α

1

25

Yes.

The same rationale applies, correct? 0 2 Yes, you have to abide by your tariff; yes, the Α 3 same rationale. 4 And, you have chosen to file that tariff that provides for a one-hour travel time even if it takes two 6 minutes? 7 Α Yes. 8 You have chosen to do that; no one made you do 9 it, did they? 10 Well, I am going to ask you this... 11 No, no, I ask the questions. Q 12 Maybe I'm wrong... Α 13 MR. STEPHENSON: Mr. Gardner... 14 THE WITNESS: I am under -- okay -- yes, I chose the 15 tariff, but I am under the understanding that we are 16 required to charge an hour travel time on a local moving 17 basis. 18 BY MR. GRAY: 19 Where did you get that information? 20 Well, maybe that's just an understanding that 21 I've had for as long as I have been in the business. 22 thought that was a requirement that every mover charged one 23 hour, that it was just standard in our industry. 24

I will be honest with you; I never checked to see if

that was required or not, but it is my understanding that every mover charges and hour travel time, and I am assuming that every mover abides by their tariff, so therefore, that's what we do.

- Q Let's go to a different subject.
- A Okay. I'm sorry.
- Q That's all right. You indicated that you have to turn down work sometimes because you are fully booked.

 Have you done any sort of a study as to how many occasions there were in 1998 when you were fully booked?
 - A No, I have not done a study.
- Q You would have the ability to make that determination, wouldn't you; your records would show if all three of your trucks were busy on any given day?
- A Yes. We were -- 1998 was the best year we have ever had. All movers, I think, will testify to that. It was a great year. We were booked in advance further than we had ever been booked.

We managed to squeeze, you know -- it's like -- I like to think we are kind of like doctors, you know. They make a schedule, but if somebody is really sick, they try to squeeze them in. We try to do that same thing.

We fill out the schedule. It's maybe not totally full. We have three trucks going out, but maybe one truck has a lighter day. We get a call, can you really help us

out? Now all of a sudden that truck has a heavier day.

Sure, there were points, I think if I look back on my records, last year that we were very busy. This year, we aren't that busy.

- Q This year, 1999?
- A This year in 1999, for some reason, and I don't know what it is, we are not as busy as last year.
 - Q Do you have any records to support that?
 - A With me?
 - Q With you?
- A No, I didn't -- I wasn't told to bring any of that, but this year our this week alone, we ran two trucks instead of three. A lot of the days were short days. Last year it wasn't that way.
- Q By the way, you indicated that as to what your existing situation was with the travel time and the minimum, you understand that if this application is granted, you will have to publish a new tariff, a tariff for this territory, correct?
 - A Yes.
- Q Now, have you given any thought as to whether you are going to change your travel time provisions in that tariff?
- A Well, I can't say that I gave any thought to it because I really, truly was under the impression that one

hour, when charging as an hourly rate, was the standard, so something that would be — we are also required, you know, if somebody from out there past a 40-mile radius, wanted to move to somewhere more than 40 miles, that falls under a different tariff.

I just assumed the same laws would apply, the same rules. You know, if it were an hourly basis type of job, you would charge one hour travel time.

Q So, if you get a call from somebody in Sharon, Pennsylvania, located about an hour and a half from here and they want to move to Grove City, Pennsylvania, both located in Mercer County, is it your intention to charge them no minimum and to charge them one hour travel, and would you handle a move under those circumstances? That move, we will say, will take two hours.

Q Well, sir, if I am doing nothing, if my schedule is open, I probably would. You are asking me things, and I am going to be honest with you. I hadn't given that a lot of thought because, as I stated earlier, this was motivated by existing customers calling. I have gone out of my way to do work for existing customers before. I would probably do that.

Q You said it was motivated by the Seven Springs - Hidden Valley situation that...

A That kind of brought it to light, but we move a

lot of folks around and they call us back, and that's what motivated this thing. Some of what they call us back to do, we cannot do.

As I stated — you asked me I intend to advertise in Sharon, Pennsylvania, so I don't anticipate getting a call from someone in a call in Sharon who wants to move to an apartment in Clarion. I didn't anticipate that, so I am just trying to be as honest with you as I can.

- Q But, you said that you could have prior customers who would call you, so you might have hauled somebody --
 - A Well, I guess what I am --
 - Q -- to Sharon and they would call you.
- A --- saying is if an old customer called me and said, hey, my daughter needs to move or I need to move from here to there and I had the time, I probably would. I don't know what that -- I hadn't given a thought to the tariff or to the charges. I really hadn't.
- Q Isn't it true that now that you are giving it a little bit of thought, you may indeed put a minimum to guard against having to go to Sharon to haul a movement to Grove City that is going to take two hours and lose your shirt?
- A To guard against helping an existing client or someone that we have a relationship with, I don't know if I want to do that.

Q An existing client that you have a relationship with, does that mean somebody that you just move one time five years ago?

A Well, you would be surprised, yeah. I am going to answer yes to that. We -- yeah, I think I probably would, yeah. If I had the time and if I had nothing else going on, yeah, I probably would.

Q It is true, is it not, that many of the calls that you get involve rate quotes where you never end up getting the move; a large number of calls you get?

A A large number, yes. We do get a lot of what we actually go out and bid on, though. We get a great deal of that.

Q If you went out and tried to move everybody that you got a call from, you would have to go buy more equipment, right; you just couldn't do it?

A At this time, in the summer, we get a lot of calls that we cannot deal with, but come October, November and December, I would be happy to try to get all that would call.

Q But, people tend to price shop, right?

A Yes, they do, sure.

MR. GRAY: That's all, thanks.

JUDGE CORBETT: Any redirect?

MR. STEPHENSON: No, thank you.

JUDGE CORBETT: Thank you, Mr. Gardner. You are excused, sir. You may stay in the hearing room.

(Witness excused.)

I think what we will do is — this is a little earlier than I had anticipated, but let's take a lunch break. We will come back at 1:15. We will take our next witness then. After that, if you want to take you public need witness, or however you want to do that, we will do that.

MR. STEPHENSON: That's fine.

JUDGE CORBETT: We will take our lunch recess at this point and we will reconvene at 1:15.

(Whereupon, at 12:10 p.m., the hearing was adjourned, to reconvene at 1:15 p.m. this same day.)

AFTERNOON SESSION

1:15 p.m.

JUDGE CORBETT: We are back on the record. It is now approximately 1:15, and we are ready to proceed.

Mr. Stephenson, would you call your next witness, please.

MR. STEPHENSON: Sure

MR. GRAY: Your Honor, may I interject something?

JUDGE CORBETT: Sure.

MR. STEPHENSON: Mr. Stephenson has not yet moved the admission of his exhibits. Should we deal with that now?

MR. STEPHENSON: I was going to do it at the end of the day, but I am happy to do it now. I would move Exhibit 1 through 4.

JUDGE CORBETT: Objection?

MR. GRAY: Yes, Your Honor, I have an objection to Exhibit 2 only to the extent that it includes verified statements of certain parties. I have no objection to the verified to the extent that the witnesses appear and testify, but to the extent that the witnesses do not appear and testify, then I would have a hearsay objection to their verified statements.

MR. PILLAR: And, I join in that objection.

JUDGE CORBETT: Any response?

MR. STEPHENSON: Gina Lison will be testifying this

afternoon. She is one of those persons. Madge Hamel will be testifying at the next hearing. Mr. Grimm I am trying to work out a schedule for him. He has been identified as a witness in this case. I think the objection is cured when those people testify. If Mr. Grimm is unavailable to testify, I will withdraw that verified statement and that would solve that objection.

JUDGE CORBETT: Okay. We will admit Applicant's Exhibits 1 through 4, and Exhibit Number 2 will be admitted conditioned upon representation of counsel that any verified statement of any witness not appearing will be withdrawn prior to the close of the record in this case.

(Whereupon, the documents marked as Applicant's Exhibit Nos. 1 through 4 were received in evidence.)

MR. STEPHENSON: Fine.

JUDGE CORBETT: Any other matters that we need to take care of?

MR. STEPHENSON: I have one short housekeeping matter just in terms of the arrival of people.

JUDGE CORBETT: Sure.

MR. STEPHENSON: Your Honor, I assumed we would break at 12:30 and return roughly at 2:00. Ms. Lison will be here roughly at 1:00. Mr. Rose is due here at about 2:00 to 2:15. We may have a short break after Mr. Gardner

2

to the Court.

JUDGE CORBETT: We will take it under advisement and 3 see how things develop. 4 MR. STEPHENSON: Okay. We would call Mr. Gardner. 5 JUDGE CORBETT: Would you come up here, sir, and 6 raise your right hand and be sworn? 7 Whereupon, 8 JOSEPH F. GARDNER 9 having been duly sworn, testified as follows: 10 JUDGE CORBETT: Please have a seat, and try to keep 11 your voice up for the court reporter. 12 THE WITNESS: I can't hear too good. 13 JUDGE CORBETT: We will try to speak up for you. 14 Would you begin, sir, by giving us your full name? 15 THE WITNESS: Joseph F. Gardner. 16 JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Stephenson, you may continue. 17 Thank you, Your Honor. MR. STEPHENSON: 18 DIRECT EXAMINATION 19 BY MR. STEPHENSON: 20 Mr. Gardner, I understand you are the real Joseph 21 Gardner, is that correct? 22 (Nodding affirmative.) A 23 You have to answer with words. Q. 24 Α Yes. 25

waiting for Ms. Lison to arrive if that's not inconvenient

Q

Α

expenses, payroll, stuff like that.

24

25

Gardner Moving 2 Α I am going to give you another reminder. 3 0 it's a nervous thing to do, but if you put your hand in 4 front of your mouth, it's harder for people to hear. 5 best thing you can do with your hands is to drop them, and 6 we will get this pretty efficiently. Okay? 7 Okay. Α 8 How long have you worked for Gardner Moving? 9 Q. Α All my life. 10 How old are you? Q. 11 Seventy-six. A 12 You look good. What kind of duties do you Q. 13 perform now for Gardner Moving; what kind of work do you 14 do? 15 Α Well, I go down the office and take care of the 16 office, phone calls, the books, treasurer. 17 You are treasurer of the company? Q. 18 Yes. Α 19 Q. Do you own any shares in the company? 20 Fifteen. A 21 When you say the books, what kind of books of the 22 Q company are we talking about here? 23

By whom are you employed?

Well, I take down the estimates, movings,

2	A	Yes.	
3	Q	Now, do you keep the records of the company?	
4	A	Yes, sir.	
5	Q	Up until two years ago, where did Gardner Moving	
6	keep its	office?	
7	A	At my home at 3236 Beacon Hill Avenue, Dormont.	
8	Q	Is that the office that was in the dining room?	
9	A	That's correct.	
10	Q	Where do you go to work now?	
11	A	Down to South Fayette at 757 Millers Run Road.	
12	Q	Would that be the Secure Storage site we have	
13	talked about?		
14	A	Yes.	
15	Q	Now, in terms of answering the telephone, and I	
16	am going	to direct your attention to the telephone calls	
17	from peop	le looking for moving services	
18	A	Correct.	
19	Q	How often do you get those kinds of calls?	
20	A	Some day you can get ten, 20, sometimes 3. It	
21	all depends on the phone.		
22	Q	Is there any difference between the time of the	
23	year when	you are more or less calls?	
24	А	Oh, yes, there is.	
25	Q	What parts of the year to do you get more calls?	

Q Do you keep track of the finances of the company?

- A During the summer when school is out.
- Q Would that mean you get less calls in the winter?
- A Yes, yes.

- Q During the summer time, usually how many calls are you getting during a day, what would you expect?
 - A You can get 50, at least 40.
- Q When a person calls you and you are answering the phone at Gardner Moving and they are talking about a move, what information do you ask them give you and what information do you provide?

The first thing they as for is what are your rates, and I give it to them. Then we talk about how big their job is. Is it a home or an apartment, and if they want an estimate, I will write them up and set them up for an estimate, and there's a lot of times I can ask them what day they wish. Most of the time, I have to say I'm sorry, I don't have the spot, it's all filled up.

Q Do you ask them where their move begins and where it ends?

A Oh, yes, I do that. They will say Mount Lebanon and they are going to Mount Lebanon also, or to Dormont.

Q Let's say a person would call and say they wanted to go from a point in Washington County to another place in Washington County, what would tell them?

A I tell them I can't handle it.

Q Why would that be?

A Because I am not permitted to go there. Then they ask me why, and I say, "That's the rules. That's all I can tell you." They don't accept that.

Q Let's pay attention to that kind of a phone call.

Do you understand that Gardner Moving is making an application for additional authority?

A Yes.

Q What is your understanding of the additional authority that Gardner Moving is asking for?

A For a 75-mile radius.

Q Let's talk about that additional authority, and specifically I would direct your attention to Washington County. Of the calls that are coming in from people looking for Gardner Moving to provide them service, do you keep any track of —

A No, no.

Q -- people who are giving you locations in Washington County?

A Yeah, but sometimes you don't get hardly any and then sometimes you may get one or two. It all depends, and you can't remember every call.

Q Do you have any clear recollection of what the frequency is of calls coming from people from that area?

MR. GRAY: Objection, asked and answered. He said

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

sometimes none, sometimes one or two.

JUDGE CORBETT: I will overrule the objection. We will see where this goes. I may reconsider, but we will see where we go.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

- Q Mr. Gardner, do you remember the question?
- A Yes. Well, I don't know how many, you know.
- Q Do you keep any kind of actual count?
- A No. You get so many calls, you forget about the last one and you're talking with the one you are now.
- Q With regard to the financial statements that were moved into the record today, you keep the financial information of the company, right?
 - A Yes.
 - Q Do you keep it accurately?
 - A Yes, I try to.
- $\,$ Q $\,$ So, the statements that we provided the Commission today, do you understand them to --
 - A Yes.
 - Q -- accurately reflect the company's position?
 - A Oh, yes.
- Q One of the questions that came up today was with regard to Exhibit Number 4. In Exhibit Number 4 -- I take that back. In Exhibit Number 3, which is the assessment report, there is a question of whether or not that included

	revenues	that were earned for trips going outside of	
2	Pennsylvania.		
3	A	No.	
4	Q	My question is does it include that revenue?	
5	A	No.	
6	Q	But, there is additional revenue that was not	
7	reflected?		
8	A	Oh, yes.	
9	Q	Do you have a sense of how much that additional	
10	revenue w	ould be?	
11	A	About \$25,000 to \$30,000 more.	
12	Q	Do you know Bob Rose?	
13	A	Yes.	
14	Q	Who is he?	
15	A	He's a customer.	
16	Q	Do you know what he does for a living?	
17	A	Yes, he's real estate agent.	
18	Q	From time to time, do you get contacted by people	
19	from		
20	A	That say he referred us.	
21	Q	Does that happen?	
22	A	Oh, yeah.	
23	Q	Do you know who Marge Hamel is?	
24	A	Yes. She's a real estate agent also.	
25	Q	From time to time, do you receive telephone calls	
[

from people who say that she has referred them?

A Yes. They say, "Madge told me to call you."

MR. STEPHENSON: No further questions.

JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Pillar.

MR. PILLAR: I have no questions.

JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Gray.

CROSS EXAMINATION

BY MR. GRAY:

Q Just so we understand, Mr. Gardner, about how an estimate works, when you get a call, do you dispatch then some employee of Gardner Moving out to the person's facility to make an estimate?

A Yes. What I do is ask when it would be convenient for them to have an estimate done, and then I take their name, their phone number, the address. Then when the boys come home, I say they have to call these people to set up an estimate when they can do it.

- Q Most customers get more than one estimate, correct?
 - A Oh, yeah, I think they're shopping around.
- Q And, just because you get a call and do an estimate, that by no means would indicate that you are going to the move?
- A That's right. No, no, it's, you know, whoever they choose. Sometimes we get them, sometime we don't.

0

```
2
   referred to you and that Ms. Hamel has referred to you are
3
   people that you have never moved, correct?
4
         Α
             No, no.
5
         Q
             Am I correct?
             Yes. I'm sorry. Yes.
6
         MR. GRAY: That's all.
7
         JUDGE CORBETT: Any redirect, Mr. Stephenson?
8
         MR. STEPHENSON: I have no redirect.
9
10
         JUDGE CORBETT: Thank you very much, Mr. Gardner.
   You are excused.
11
                                          (Witness excused.)
12
         MR. STEPHENSON: We need to take a short break, and
13
   as soon as these people show up, we will get them done.
14
15
         JUDGE CORBETT: All right. We will take a short
   recess. When you are ready for me, let me know.
16
         MR. STEPHENSON: All right.
17
         JUDGE CORBETT: We are in recess at this point.
                                                            It
18
   is 1:30 p.m.
19
         (Whereupon, a 20 minute recess was taken.)
20
         JUDGE CORBETT:
                         We are back on the record now at
21
   approximately 1:50. Mr. Stephenson, would you call your
22
   next witness, please?
23
         MR. STEPHENSON: Yes. Our next witness will be Gina
24
   Lison.
25
```

And, some of the people that Mr. Rose has

JUDGE CORBETT: Would you raise your right hand, please, and be sworn? Whereupon,

GINA LISON

having been duly sworn, testified as follows:

JUDGE CORBETT: Please begin by giving us your full name.

THE WITNESS: Gina, G-i-n-a, Lison, L-i-s-o-n.

JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Stephenson, you may continue.

DIRECT EXAMINATION

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

Q Ms. Lison, where do you live?

A At 104 Meadow View Court, Venetia in Washington County.

Q Prior to coming to this hearing today, and thank you for that, have you signed a verified statement in support of Gardner Moving's application for additional authority?

A Yes.

Q I will show you a signature that appears in that statement on page 4. Is that your signature?

A Yes.

Q And, then you will see another page of a verification with a notary seal on it. Is that your signature?

3	A	Yes.
2	Q	Did you, in fact, have this document notarized at
3	the time?	
4	A	Yes.
5	Q	When did you first come into contact with Gardner
6	Moving Company?	
7	A	Four years ago.
8	Q	And, why did you contact them?
9	A	We were moving into Washington County from
10	Allegheny	County and we needed a mover.
11	Q	How did you come to contact them?
12	A	My uncle used to cut their hair and he gave me
13	their name.	
14	Q	So, is it fair to say word of mouth?
15	A	Word of mouth.
1,6	Q	Okay. Now, how big or small of a movement was
17	this?	
18	A	Very big.
19	Q	Why do you say that?
20	А	Two big trucks and about 12 hours.
21	Q	Was this a household move or more than a house?
22	А	Household.
23	Q	What, if anything, did you conclude about Gardner
24	Moving's s	service as a result of them moving your goods?

They were wonderful.

25

21

22

23

24

25

1

2

3

Why do you say that? 0

They were very courteous, they were on time, Α their workers were very, very nice. They were young boys. They were very nice.

They also packed for us a couple days before, and nothing was broken. They did not bang one wall moving out or moving or moving in, the furniture was in perfect condition and they were just very, very nice people to work with.

- Q Have you used them since?
- Α Yes.
- Was it another household move or a less than Q household move?
 - Α My mother-in-law.
- Q Okay, your mother-in-law, and was she in Allegheny County?
 - Α Yes.
- What kind of a move did you have Gardner Moving Q do for your mother-in-law.
- They moved -- well, two different times. they just moved a living room set, and another time they moved a dining room.
 - Do you recall what you paid for these moves?
- I should have looked in my check book, but I would say it was minimal.

Q How long was it your understanding that these moves took?

MR. PILLAR: Are we referring to the mother-in-law's moves?

MR. STEPHENSON: The mother-in-law's moves, yes.

THE WITNESS: Less than an hour.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

Q How far was the trips, from where to where?

A It was about, at the most, 20 minutes, 25 minutes with traffic.

Q What was your understanding of Gardner Moving's rates at the time that they did these moves?

MR. PILLAR: I am going to object on the grounds of relevance. I don't really see the relevance of what their rates were on moves that they are authorized to perform now in Allegheny County, and even if they involve moves outside of Allegheny County, I still don't see the relevance as to the issues of public convenience and necessity.

MR. STEPHENSON: One of the questions of public convenience and necessity is whether a service is being provided by Gardner Moving that is not being offered otherwise.

One of the — the evidence here is a substantial part of their business is for moves that take less than five hours in total time, and therefore, they provide a benefit

to the public that the public can obtain the amount of service it needs rather than paying, in effect, a five-hour minimum for possibly an hour or two of work.

MR. PILLAR: There is no evidence, though, to substantiate that other than Mr. Gardner's belief or understanding. There's no real evidence that what Gardner proposes — in fact, there's not even any evidence that Gardner proposes to provide that type of service in the application area.

As I recall, Mr. Gardner's testimony was that he hadn't really thought about his tariff. This is all very speculative, and I don't see how it could support any finding of public convenience or necessity based on testimony from Mr. Gardner in relationship to what this witness is being asked now.

JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Gardner, this morning, did testify as to his understanding of the charges offered by other carriers. There is some evidence in the record to support it. Therefore, I am going to overrule the objection.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

- Q Do you remember the question?
- A About the hour moving and the five hours, yes.
- MR. GRAY: Your Honor, may I just add one thing to that? The movements that she is talking about are within

Allegheny County, not within Washington County, so even if there was testimony as to what rates are in Washington County, it would have no relevance to this testimony which involves two movements in Allegheny County.

MR. STEPHENSON: May I respond?

JUDGE CORBETT: Sure.

MR. STEPHENSON: Mr. Gardner's testimony was, in fact, that he would probably just leave that provision in his tariff alone because his customer base has developed loyalty because he provides that kind of service such that it becomes relevant, and obviously, the only examples that are going to exist are the examples that occur in his present area.

Any witness we can ever provide is only going to be able to say that where Gardner was certificated to perform service, his service was valuable and it was important to me in purchasing this kind of a service, and that is exactly what public need is about.

If there is a protestant who is willing to say they are going to come in and change their tariff to match, that's something else, or if we have misread their tariffs and they have the ability to do this, that's something else, but we are still in our case yet and I think we should be allowed to show that the public values this type of additional service.

MR. PILLAR: Just in response, I would — I don't want to be beating a dead horse, but certainly I don't agree with Mr. Stephenson's assessment that the only testimony they can present is testimony in the existing area as to a need for service because that certainly is a problem here.

However, beyond all that, if an applicant comes in and says that we are going to do this, we are going to provide some sort of new minimum service and bases the case on that without any real evidence as to how they would do this, certainly no guarantee exists that they are going to do it.

If the application were granted on that basis, there would be no requirement that the applicant would do it.

The applicant could come in and put in a minimum just like everybody else, assuming everybody else has a minimum, and I don't know that to be the case.

I am troubled a little bit by the boot strap being argument, but you have ruled on it, so I don't want to...

JUDGE CORBETT: Yes, I think -- I don't mean to cut you off, Mr. Pillar, but I think it's a matter first of all relevance. I think the testimony is relevant.

Secondly, I think your argument goes to the weight of the evidence to be given. Certainly you have made an argument that you can make later in your brief as to how

2

25

MR. GRAY: May I make another objection? 3 JUDGE CORBETT: All right. MR. GRAY: A totally different objection. 5 JUDGE CORBETT: All right. We will listen to this 6 7 one. Your Honor, there has been no foundation MR. GRAY: 8 laid that this witness arranged for an paid for the 9 movements of her mother-in-law. Until that foundation is 10 laid, the mother-in-law is the proper witness for this 11 case. 12 No, wait, time out. THE WITNESS: 13 JUDGE CORBETT: No, you need to wait just a minute. 14 THE WITNESS: I have a hard time with that. I'm 15 sorry. 16 JUDGE CORBETT: That may be a legitimate objection, 17 and we will sustain it. 18 If you want to lay some foundation, we will let you 19 do that. 20 MR. STEPHENSON: Thank you. 21 BY MR. STEPHENSON: 22 I have to ask you some preliminary questions to 23 show that you have some knowledge of certain things, and 24

I am going to overrule the objection again, Mr. Gray.

that evidence should be weighed.

that's what we are being asked to do.

A Okay.

A

Q With regard to the two moves of your mother-inlaw, the two short moves that you testified about before, did you make the arrangements for the moves or did someone else make the arrangements?

A I made the arrangements.

Q What did you do in terms of making arrangements for these two moves?

A I called Gardner Moving. I asked them if they could move her — the living room and the dining room. I set everything up, told my mother—in—law what time they were coming and paid for it.

Q When you made these arrangements, one of the things you did not mention, and I am going to ask you specifically, did you discuss what it would cost for the move?

- A With my mother-in-law?
- Q No, with Gardner Moving?
- A Yes.

Q Okay, and what did Gardner Moving tell you would be the basis for getting charge for these moves?

A An hour of travelling time, and that was -- you know, like how long it would take from here to there, which is was 20 minutes one way, 20 minutes the other. That was their rate. I can't remember honestly. I would have to go

back to my check book to see what I paid, but I know it was
-- if had known, I would have brought it with me.

Q Let me ask you a different question, which is did they tell you if they had a minimum working time?

A I honestly can't remember.

JUDGE CORBETT: Please keep your voice, Ms. Lison. I can't hear you.

THE WITNESS: I honestly can't remember if they told me. All I know is that I was not going to be charged for a whole day, because if that would have been the case, I would have — like I told you, I would have had — if they would have told me, look, we have a five-hour, eight-hour, whatever, I would have found another way to move her furniture.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

- Q Did you find it to be a valuable service --
- A Yes.
- Q -- that you could move this small amount of goods for a short distance for one hour travel time plus whatever the additional actual work time was?

A Yes, it was worth it because I would not have paid for a five-hour or eight-hour. That would have had to involve my husband, my father to move these pieces of furniture.

Q Is that because you weren't going to pay it; you

were going to get your father to do it?

- A Well, I wouldn't have paid them to do it.
- Q Let me ask you a different question then. Did you make any attempt to call around to other movers?
 - A No.
 - Q Why not?

A Because I would only use Gardner Moving, and I have referred them to many of my friends and family, and I wouldn't use anyone else.

MR. STEPHENSON: No further questions.

THE WITNESS: That's where I am having — We are finishing our basement and we have a lot of furniture that needs to be moved out, probably going to a relative. I don't know who I am going to get if they are not in Washington County.

BY MR. STEPHENSON:

- Q You would have to go to someone else?
- A Yeah, I would. It's not going to be a big move, but...
 - Q How far would it have to go?
- A A half an hour, 40 minutes. I'm just thinking about that coming up.
 - MR. STEPHENSON: No more question.
- JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Pillar or Mr. Gray, whichever one.

MR. PILLAR: I just have a few questions and then I 2 will let Mr. Gray finish. 3 JUDGE CORBETT: All right. 4 CROSS EXAMINATION 5 BY MR. PILLAR: 6 Can you tell me, first of all, where Meadow View 7 Court is; where is that? 8 In Peters Township. 9 Give me some directions on how you get to your Q 10 home from Route 19, let's say. 11 A Do you know where McMurry Road is? 12 Q Yes. 13 Do know where Al's Cafe is? 14 Q Okay, so you are located... 15 We are located right where the Bethel border is. 16 Here's Bethel. We are about a half a mile. 17 And, you are off of McMurry Road? Q 18 Α Right off McMurry Road, yes. 19 Are you in Washington County there? Q 20 Α Yes. 21 Q You are in Peters Township? 22 Α Yes. 23 Q. You pay your taxes to Peters Township? 24 Α Uh-huh. 25

MR. GRAY: Go ahead.

25

the court reporter. 2 THE WITNESS: Yes. 3 BY MR. PILLAR: 4 Secondly, you moved to this home four years ago? 5 Α Yes. 6 From where? 0 7 West Mifflin. Α 8 And, that was 1995, 1994? Q 9 Yes, 1994. Α 10 Okay, 1994. Q 11 No, 1994. I'm sorry, it was 1995. This August Α 12 it's four years. 13 Okay, and that move, you indicated, involved 12 14 hours and two trucks? 15 Uh-huh. 16 JUDGE CORBETT: You have to say yes or no. 17 THE WITNESS: Yes. 18 BY MR. PILLAR: 19 When you had Gardner make that move, did they 20 give you an estimate of what the cost would be? 21 Α Yes. 22 Did you get estimates from any other mover at 23 that time? 24 Α South Hills Movers.

JUDGE CORBETT: You will have to say yes or no for

```
1
          Q
              When your mother-in-law -- when you had the
    arrangements to move your mother-in-law's furniture, the
 2
    living room set, when was that?
 3
               I have to -- it's within the last year, I would
 4
 5
    say.
              Within the last 12 months?
 6
          Q
          Α
              Right.
 7
              Where did the move originate?
          Q
 8
          Α
              At 515 Lisa Drive.
 9
              Where is that?
          Q
10
          Α
              In West Mifflin.
11
          Q
              Where was it moving to?
12
          Α
              It was moving to Frich Drive.
13
              I'm sorry?
          Q
14
              Frich Drive.
          Α
15
          Q
              How do you spell that?
16
          Α
              F-r-i-c-h.
17
              Who lives there?
          Q
18
          Α
              My parents.
19
              So, your mother-in-law's living room set was
          Q
20
   moving to your parent's home?
21
              Right.
          A
22
              How far is it?
          Q
23
```

No -- what; I'm sorry?

Did I say that correctly?

A

Q

24

25

A Yes.

Q Your mother-in-law's living room set was being moved from her home to your parents' home?

- A Yes.
- Q How far is that?
- A About 15 minutes with traffic.
- Q Where do your parents live?
- A In Whitehall.
- Q When did the dining room set get moved?
- A That's what's confusing because we were getting it's a couple months span, but I honestly remember the
 month. I would have to look in my check book.
- Q Did it move from the same place to the same place; that is from your mother-in-law's house to your parents' house?
 - A Yes.
 - Q And, that's a distance of five miles?
 - A Yes, probably around there.
- Q Just with respect to this statement that has been identified and marked as part of Exhibit 2, would you agree with me that this statement was prepared for you by somebody; in other words, it was typed and prepared by somebody else?
 - A That was?
 - Q It wasn't prepared by you, was it?

3

4

5

7

8

10

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

A No.

Q Okay, and so the information that was put down here was typed and put on this statement by someone else and then you signed it?

A Yes.

Q Did somebody ask you these questions specifically and did you answer them, or how did they prepare it; do you know that?

A They asked me the questions. I think was Mike or Joe. They had told me what this was all about and asked if was willing to — if I had a problem with it. I said, no, I would gladly sign it.

MR. PILLAR: That's all I have. Thank you.

JUDGE CORBETT: Mr. Gray?

MR. GRAY: Thank you, Your Honor.

CROSS EXAMINATION

BY MR. GRAY:

Q Ms. Lison, what does your husband do?

A He is managing partner for KPMG Pete Marwick.

Q Do you have children?

A Yes, three.

Q The affidavit or verification, affidavit actually, that you signed was signed in August of 1998, August 31st. Had the movements of your mother-in-law's living and dining room occurred before this statement?

Do you

Had -- I don't understand the question. Α Had Gardner Moving transported the living room 0 set and then the dining room set of your mother-in-law --Before August 31st or after? Α -- before August 31st? Q Α It was after. It was after this time? Q. Α Yes. You said it was in the last 12 months. Q remember what specifically what month? I don't. Α Do you remember what season it was? Q Α With three kids, I have a really bad memory. should have brought my check book. Let me -- the dining room set was probably September or October. The living room was after that. I can't say. It could be December, January, but if you need the information, I can definitely get it to you. Have you ever made, in the last for years since 1995, since you moved to Washington County, have you made any inquires of any moving company located in Washington County concerning service that they provide?

22

1

2

3

4

5

б

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

No. Α

24

25

23

Have you ever made any inquiries into rates that O any moving company charges?

Movers four years ago. 2 And, that was for a movement from Allegheny 3 County? 4 Uh-huh. Α 5 Was, did you say, a movement from West Mifflin? Q. 6 Right. Α 7 Are you or any member of your family employed by 0 8 Gardner Moving Company? 9 No. Α 10 Do you socialize with any employee of Gardner Q 11 Moving and Storage? 12 Α No. 13 Q Have you ever? 14 No. Α 15 How did you find out about this application? Q. 16 They asked me if I would sign, or they discussed Α 17 with me what was going on, they were applying for a license 18 in Washington County and if I would sign the affidavit, if 19 I believed in it, and I said, "Sure." 20 Did they call you? 21 Actually, I think we had discussed it on one of Α 22 the last moves that I had talked to them about. 23 I thought you said those moves were after you Q. 24 signed it?

Α

1

25

No, just when I had the estimate from South Hills

A You're right. That was after. Wait a minute.

You know what -- don't quote me on the dates, because I could be totally wrong. It could have been in July that we moved.

I will bring my check book and show you. I should have. I wish I would have known and I would have brought my check book. Maybe they didn't call me after. I can't honestly remember, but I have it written down. I wrote checks for it, so you can — I would be glad to give those to you.

- Q You have not called Gardner about any other movement that you have other than the ones you have mentioned in your testimony, correct?
 - A The three -- no.
 - Q Am I correct?
 - A Yes, you are correct.
- Q How far are you located from Gardner's office; do you know, first of all, where there offices are?
- A I don't know where their offices are. They used to be on Industrial Boulevard in Bethel?
 - MR. GARDNER: (Inaudible.)
 - THE WITNESS: I don't know where they...
- MR. GRAY: I'm sorry, there can't be any interchange between...
 - THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.

BY MR. GRAY:

- Q Do you know where their offices are now?
- A No, I don't.
- Q Do you know county they are in?
- A Allegheny County, I think they are in Bridgeville.

Q You have no present intention of moving your household from the address that it is now, 104 Meadow View Court in Venetia, to any other location, correct?

A Well, I plan on moving our basement furniture when we finish our basement. That consists of an entertainment center, a sectional couch with a pull-out bed, two end tables, a kitchen table with four chairs.

Q My question is, do you intend -- you don't have any intention --

- A Yes, we intend on that.
- Q -- of moving your --
- A No.
- Q -- whole household?

A My whole household, no, but we intend on moving that furniture in the near future, probably in the next six months.

JUDGE CORBETT: Just we get back to some order here, let's let one party at a time speak. The court reporter has a difficult time trying to get both parties at once.

THE WITNESS: I'm sorry.

BY MR. GRAY:

Q If Gardner Moving is unavailable to handle that movement, what are you going to do?

A Well, I don't know because I don't know who I would call.

Q Have you ever made any inquiry as to movers actually located in Washington County that can provide the service within Washington County?

A No, I couldn't tell you one mover in Washington County. South Hills Movers, which I don't know if they move within Washington County, that's really the only movers that I know of.

Q How do you know of South Hills Movers?

A Well, their trucks are all over the place, and I had called them when we were going to move four years ago.

Q You don't have any reason to believe, do you, that the movers actually located in Washington County are anything but perfectly good movers that provide very satisfactory service; you don't have any reason to not believe that, do you?

MR. STEPHENSON: Objection as to the competence of the witness who said she doesn't know anything about...

JUDGE CORBETT: Excuse me. We are having trouble hearing you.

MR. STEPHENSON: I'm sorry. I object to the question. The witness has testified she has no personal knowledge as to other movers, so as it is phrased, the question, in effect, becomes an endorsement.

JUDGE CORBETT: Sustained.

MR. GRAY: That's all the questions I have.

JUDGE CORBETT: Any redirect?

MR. STEPHENSON: No, thank you.

JUDGE CORBETT: Thank you, Ms. Lison.

(Witness excused.)

MR. STEPHENSON: I will see if my next witness has arrived.

JUDGE CORBETT: We will take a short recess.

(Whereupon, a recess was taken.)

JUDGE CORBETT: Back on the record. It is now approximately five minutes after 3:00. We have waited for the arrival of the witness. Counsel has attempted to call to locate the witness. The last word was that the witness was on his way, but at this point he has not made it and we are not sure that this witness is going to appear today.

The parties have agreed that it would be best, since we don't have any further witnesses to take today, that we recess today and reconvene for two days of hearings preferably September 21 and 22 here in Pittsburgh. I will check those days with the scheduler in Harrisburg.

Is there anything else that the parties would like to place on the record before we adjourn?

MR. PILLAR: Just that our understanding, based on what we have discussed, is that we are scheduling it for two days for the purpose of hearing two witnesses from the applicant and then beginning the protestants' case, that we would be prepared to go forward on those days due to the fact that the applicant only has two other witnesses.

JUDGE CORBETT: Right.

MR. GRAY: The only other thing, Your Honor, that I would say is it's seems to me that it is definitely physically impossible to run through ten protestant witnesses in one day.

With your permission, perhaps John and I can sort of talk among ourselves and try to line up maybe five and five, since we are going to have two days, instead of having ten people sit here and only three of them get on, let's say. Maybe we could do a balancing act to try to use both days.

MR. STEPHENSON: I certainly have no objection to that.

JUDGE CORBETT: Maybe you could even coordinate with counsel for the applicant if need be about the witnesses, how much cross he might need to engage in, so you can determine how many witnesses you will need the first day

and how many witnesses you will need the second day. $\label{eq:mr.gray} {\tt MR.\ GRAY:\ Right.}$

JUDGE CORBETT: I think we should be able to handle that. I will talk the to the scheduler and see when we can book the two days of hearings. We are trying to get September 21 and 22, but we will see if that's available.

Anything else before we adjourn?

MR. STEPHENSON: No, sir.

JUDGE CORBETT: Thank you very much. The hearing is now in recess until the next hearing.

(Whereupon, at 3:10 p.m., the hearing was adjourned.)

CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify, as the stenographic reporter, that the foregoing proceedings were reported by me and thereafter reduced to typewriting by me or under my direction; and that this transcript is a true and accurate record to the best of my ability.

COMMONWEALTH REPORTING COMPANY, INC.

BY: Danielle M. Scrimizzi)