**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Petition of Duquesne Light Companyfor Approval to Modify its Smart Meter Procurement and Installation Plan | **:::** | Docket No. P-2015-2497267 |

**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Upon consideration of the Motion for a Protective Order that was filed by Duquesne Light Company on January 21, 2016;

IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. The Protective Order is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 and 3 below, which have been or will be filed with the Commission, produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during the above-captioned proceeding and all proceedings consolidated therewith. All persons previously or hereafter granted access to the materials and information identified in Ordering Paragraphs 2 and 3 of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Protective Order.
2. The materials or information subject to this Protective Order are all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials which are believed by the producing Party to be of a proprietary or confidential nature, and which are so designated by being stamped “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter collectively referred to as “Proprietary Information”). When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be appropriately designated as such for the record.
3. This Protective Order applies to the following materials:

(a) The producing Party may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” those materials which customarily are treated by that Party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that Party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury;

(b) The producing Party may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature or of such a private, personal nature that the producing Party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. Each of the Parties shall endeavor to limit its designation of information as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.”

1. Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for the non-producing Party, subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination or argument in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, counsel for a Party may afford access to Proprietary Information subject to the conditions set forth in this Protective Order.
2. Proprietary Information produced in this proceeding shall be made available to the Commission and its Staff. For purposes of filing, to the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s report folders, such information shall be handled in accordance with routine Commission procedures inasmuch as the report folders are not subject to public disclosure. To the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s testimony or document folders, such information shall be separately bound, conspicuously marked, and accompanied by a copy of this Protective Order. Public inspection of Protected Information shall be permitted only in accordance with this Protective Order.
3. Proprietary Information shall be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” in this proceeding pursuant to the following procedures:
4. Information deemed as “CONFIDENTIAL”, shall be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who is a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and who is:

(i) an attorney who has made an appearance in this proceeding for a Party;

(ii) attorneys, paralegals, and other employees associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph 6(a)(i);

(iii) an expert or an employee of an expert retained by a Party for the purpose of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding;

(iv) employees or other representatives of a Party appearing in this proceeding with significant responsibility for the docket.

(v) a person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of Confidential information pursuant to Paragraph 11.

1. Information deemed as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL,” may be provided to a “Reviewing Representative” who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and who is:

(i) an attorney for a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code §1.8 or an outside counsel who has made an appearance in this proceeding for a Party;

(ii) an attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph 6(b)(i);

(iii) an outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a Party for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding;

(iv) a person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of Highly Confidential Information pursuant to Paragraph 11.

Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission’s rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§5.362, 5.365(e), the producing Party may, by subsequent objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL material, including but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular Parties.

1. Proprietary Information shall not be made available to a “Restricted Person” to the extent reasonably known by the non-producing Party. For the purpose of this Protective Order, “Restricted Person” shall mean: (a) an officer, director, stockholder, partner or owner of any competitor of the Parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s primary duties involve the development, marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services; (b) an officer, director, stockholder, partner or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the Parties (including any association of competitors of a Party) or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s primary duties involve the development, marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services; (c) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of a competitor of a customer of the Parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the Parties; and (d) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the Parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the Parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert’s interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other direct ownership interests (excluding ownership in mutual funds) valued at more than $10,000 or constituting more than 1% interest in a business establishes a significant motive for violation.
2. If an expert for a Party, another member of the expert’s firm or the expert’s firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person (to the extent reasonably known by the non-producing Party), said expert must: (1) identify for the Parties each Restricted Person and each expert or consultant; (2) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert’s participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (3) if segregation of such personnel is impractical the expert shall give to the producing Party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize the interests of the Parties or their customers. The producing Party retains the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the non-producing Party or its customers’ interests will not be jeopardized. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission.
3. A qualified “Reviewing Representative” for “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” material may review and discuss “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” material with their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a “Restricted Person”, but may not share with or permit the client or entity to review the “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” material, provided, however, that counsel for the Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”), Office of Consumer Advocate and Office of Small Business Advocate may share Proprietary Information with the I&E Director, Consumer Advocate and Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure certificate from these individuals, provided, however, that these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of the Protective Order.
4. Proprietary Information shall be treated by the non-producing Party and by the Reviewing Representative in accordance with the certificate executed pursuant to Paragraph 12(a). Information deemed Proprietary Information shall not be used except as necessary for the conduct of this proceeding, nor shall it be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person’s responsibilities in this proceeding.
5. Reviewing Representatives may not use information contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through this proceeding to give any Party or any competitor of any Party a commercial advantage. In the event that the non-producing Party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraph 6 above, that Party shall seek agreement from the Party producing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative pursuant to Paragraph 6 above with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the non-producing Party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.
6. (a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate set forth in Appendix A hereto, provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney’s instruction, supervision or control need not do so. A copy of each Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel for the Party asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

 (b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with this Protective Order.

1. A producing Party shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by stamping the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the producing Party, insofar as it is reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information. Upon request from another party, the producing party shall produce a redacted (public) version of any such partially confidential compilation or multi-page document within a reasonable period of time. The Proprietary Information shall be served upon the non-producing Party hereto only in an envelope separate from the non-proprietary materials, and the envelope shall be conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.”
2. The non-producing Party will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in the Pennsylvania Right to Know Law as set forth at 65 P.S. §§ 67.101 *et seq.* until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary. In the event that any person or entity seeks to compel the disclosure of Proprietary Information, the non-producing Party shall promptly notify the producing Party in order to provide the producing Party an opportunity to oppose or limit such disclosure.
3. Any public reference to Proprietary Information by a Party or its Reviewing Representative shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to fully understand the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.
4. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument and responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 15 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the Parties or pursuant to order of the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission or appellate court.
5. The non-producing Party shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information. If a non-producing Party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the Party providing the information retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.

 18. Each Party shall retain the right to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information; to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground; to refuse to produce Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection; and to seek additional measures of protection of Proprietary Information beyond those provided in this Protective Order.

1. Within 30 days after a Commission final order is entered in the above-captioned proceeding, or in the event of appeals, within thirty days after appeals are finally decided, the non-producing Party, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the producing Party all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. In the event that the non-producing Party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information to the producing

Party, the non-producing Party shall certify in writing to the producing Party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed.

Date: January 22, 2016 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Katrina L. Dunderdale

 Administrative Law Judge

**APPENDIX A**

**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Petition of Duquesne Light Companyfor Approval to Modify its Smart Meter Procurement and Installation Plan | **:::** | Docket No. P-2015-2497267 |

NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

 The undersigned is a Reviewing Representative of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ a Party to this proceeding (“Party”), and is not, or has no knowledge or basis for believing that he/she is a “Restricted Person” based upon reasonable knowledge and efforts as that term is defined in Paragraph No. 7, page 4 of the Protective Order executed on behalf of the Party with regard to the above-referenced proceeding. The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order in the above-referenced proceeding, which Protective Order deals with the treatment of Proprietary Information. The undersigned agrees to be bound by, and comply with, the terms and conditions of said Protective Order.

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 SIGNATURE

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 PRINT NAME

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 ADDRESS

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 EMPLOYER

 DATE: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_