

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Shantelle Thomas

v.

Philadelphia Gas Works

:
:
:
:
:

F-2017-2612646

ORDER

An Initial Hearing convened as scheduled for this proceeding on September 5, 2017.

The Respondent, Philadelphia Gas Works (PGW) moved to admit the following exhibits:

- (1) PGW Exhibit 1 – service agreement for service address;
- (2) PGW Exhibit 2 – Complainant payment arrangement history; and
- (3) PGW Exhibit 3 – BCS Case No. 358077 informal complaint.

Tr. 39. The Complainant, Shantelle Thomas, objected to notice to recertify for the PGW Customer Responsibility Program (CRP). This objection went to the testimony of the witness sponsoring the exhibits and not to any specific exhibits. The undersigned however, directed the Complainant to provide documents to verify and corroborate her testimony regarding the household income after the auto accident in August 2015. The undersigned also directed the Respondent to provide a customer contacts exhibit from June 30, 2014 to the present and a copy of the recertification letter that notified the Complainant she must recertify her income to participate in the Respondent's CRP program. The undersigned stated a further hearing would be scheduled to examine and possibly admit the documents that were directed to be produced by the litigants.

The undersigned failed to admit PGW Exhibits 1-3, which are attached to this Order.

52 Pa.Code § 5.571(d)(1) states,

(d) The record may be reopened upon notification to the parties in a proceeding for the reception of further evidence if there is a reason to believe that conditions of fact or of law have so changes as to require, or that the public interest requires, the reopening of the proceeding.

(1) The presiding officer may reopen the record if the presiding office has not issued a decision or has not certified the record to the Commission.

The further hearing was scheduled by Hearing Notice dated September 6, 2017, for Wednesday, October 25, 2017.

The further hearing convened as scheduled. The attorney for the Respondent, Graciela Christlieb, Esquire, was present accompanied by one witness. The Complainant, failed to appear and participate in the further hearing.

Any objection to PGW Exhibits 1-3, by the Complainant is waived as not timely. The Complainant has failed to timely object to PGW Exhibits 1-3. It is in the public interest to admit PGW Exhibits 1-3 as there are no timely objections made against them and the motion to admit them was inadvertently not addressed at the initial hearing. The record is opened solely for the purpose to admit PGW Exhibits 1-3.

THEREFORE;


IT IS ORDERED:

1. That the record for the formal complaint of Shantelle Thomas v. Philadelphia Gas Works at Docket No. F-2017-2612646 is opened to address the admission of exhibits.
2. That the Motion by Graciela Christlieb, Esquire, to admit PGW Exhibits 1-3 is granted.

3. That PGW Exhibits 1-3 are admitted into the record.

4. The record at Docket No. F-2017-2612646 for the formal complaint of Shantelle Thomas v. Philadelphia Gas Works is closed.

Date: December 6, 2017


Angela T. Jones
Administrative Law Judge

ATTACHED EXHIBITS

Specific Service Agreement Statement of Account SA- 8958485692

Customer Name	From Date	To Date		
SHANTELE THOMAS	6/30/2014	9/5/2017		
Service Address	Account Number	S A Number	Meter	Rate/Class
1930 E ALBERT ST PHIL, PA 191251104	420506143	8958485692	1819159	GS

STATEMENT

Transaction Date	Transaction Type	Reading	Code	Read	# of Days	CCF Usage	Average CCF/Day	Heating DDDs	Payment Type	Due Date	Transaction Amount	Current Balance	Actual Balance
7/23/2014	BILL	2630	R		32	16	0.5	0		8/15/2014	\$37.27	\$123.92	\$123.92
8/22/2014	LPC										\$1.85	\$125.77	\$125.77
8/22/2014	BILL	2644	R		29	14	0.48	0		9/17/2014	\$34.35	\$160.12	\$160.12
9/23/2014	LPC										\$2.37	\$162.49	\$162.49
9/23/2014	BILL	2658	R		30	14	0.47	6		10/16/2014	\$33.29	\$195.78	\$195.78
10/7/2014	NEWCRP										\$2,993.08	\$3,188.86	\$3,188.86
10/7/2014	CRPFRZ										(\$3,188.86)	\$0.00	\$0.00
10/21/2014	BILL	2674	R		31	16	0.52	102		11/14/2014	\$149.73	\$149.73	\$149.73
11/20/2014	BILL	2761	R		30	87	2.9	460		12/16/2014	\$149.73	\$299.46	\$299.46
12/8/2014	PAY								Debit Card		(\$149.73)	\$149.73	\$149.73
12/23/2014	BILL	2880	R		30	119	3.97	783		1/21/2015	\$149.73	\$299.46	\$299.46
1/23/2015	BILL	3032	R		34	152	4.47	1051		2/18/2015	\$149.73	\$449.19	\$449.19
2/23/2015	PAY								Debit Card		(\$449.19)	\$0.00	\$0.00
2/24/2015	BILL	3213	R		29	181	6.24	1198		3/19/2015	\$149.73	\$149.73	\$149.73
3/24/2015	BILL	3378	R		28	165	5.89	918		4/17/2015	\$149.73	\$299.46	\$299.46
4/22/2015	BILL	3450	R		32	72	2.25	467		5/15/2015	\$149.73	\$449.19	\$449.19
5/21/2015	BILL	3471	R		29	21	0.72	114		6/16/2015	\$149.73	\$598.92	\$598.92
6/22/2015	BILL	3485	R		30	14	0.47	26		7/16/2015	\$149.73	\$748.65	\$748.65
7/22/2015	BILL	3497	R		32	12	0.38	0		8/14/2015	\$149.73	\$898.38	\$898.38
8/21/2015	BILL	3508	R		30	11	0.37	0		9/16/2015	\$149.73	\$1,048.11	\$1,048.11
9/21/2015	PAY								Debit Card		(\$898.38)	\$149.73	\$149.73
9/22/2015	BILL	3519	R		32	11	0.34	0		10/15/2015	\$149.73	\$299.46	\$299.46
10/21/2015	BILL	3541	R		29	22	0.76	129		11/16/2015	\$149.73	\$449.19	\$449.19
11/4/2015	CRPFRZ										\$2,958.86	\$3,408.05	\$3,408.05
11/5/2015	PAY								Cash		(\$150.00)	\$3,258.05	\$3,258.05
11/20/2015	LPC										\$4.63	\$3,262.68	\$3,262.68
11/20/2015	BILL	3588	R		30	47	1.57	238		12/16/2015	\$87.40	\$3,350.08	\$3,350.08

Transaction Date	Transaction Type	Reading	Read Code	# of Days	CCF Usage	Average CCF/Day	Heating DDDs	Payment Type	Due Date	Transaction Amount	Current Balance	Actual Balance
12/21/2015	LPC									\$50.18	\$3,400.26	\$3,400.26
12/21/2015	BILL	3676	R	29	88	3.03	443		1/19/2016	\$141.33	\$3,541.59	\$3,541.59
1/25/2016	LPC									\$52.30	\$3,593.89	\$3,593.89
1/25/2016	BILL	3828	R	35	152	4.34	841		2/18/2016	\$212.77	\$3,806.66	\$3,806.66
2/23/2016	LPC									\$55.49	\$3,862.15	\$3,862.15
2/23/2016	BILL	4008	R	31	180	5.81	903		3/17/2016	\$229.88	\$4,092.03	\$4,092.03
3/16/2016	PAY							Credit Card		(\$200.00)	\$3,892.03	\$3,892.03
3/22/2016	LPC									\$58.38	\$3,950.41	\$3,950.41
3/22/2016	BILL	4099	R	28	91	3.25	466		4/15/2016	\$144.13	\$4,094.54	\$4,094.54
4/6/2016	PAY							Check		(\$162.00)	\$3,932.54	\$3,932.54
4/6/2016	PAY							Check		(\$70.00)	\$3,862.54	\$3,862.54
4/21/2016	LPC									\$57.93	\$3,920.47	\$3,920.47
4/21/2016	BILL	4169	R	30	70	2.33	355		5/16/2016	\$104.43	\$4,024.90	\$4,024.90
5/21/2016	LPC									\$59.50	\$4,084.40	\$4,084.40
5/21/2016	BILL	4207	R	29	38	1.31	201		6/15/2016	\$55.23	\$4,139.63	\$4,139.63
6/21/2016	LPC									\$60.33	\$4,199.96	\$4,199.96
6/21/2016	BILL	4223	R	32	16	0.5	13		7/15/2016	\$32.67	\$4,232.63	\$4,232.63
7/6/2016	PAY							Check		(\$65.00)	\$4,167.63	\$4,167.63
7/21/2016	LPC									\$60.82	\$4,228.45	\$4,228.45
7/21/2016	BILL	4237	R	30	14	0.47	0		8/15/2016	\$29.45	\$4,257.90	\$4,257.90
8/16/2016	PAY							Credit Card		(\$200.00)	\$4,057.90	\$4,057.90
8/19/2016	LPC									\$60.86	\$4,118.76	\$4,118.76
8/19/2016	BILL	4249	R	29	12	0.41	0		9/14/2016	\$27.10	\$4,145.86	\$4,145.86
9/21/2016	LPC									\$61.27	\$4,207.13	\$4,207.13
9/21/2016	BILL	4263	R	33	14	0.42	0		10/14/2016	\$30.41	\$4,237.54	\$4,237.54
10/20/2016	LPC									\$61.73	\$4,299.27	\$4,299.27
10/20/2016	BILL	4276	R	29	13	0.45	76		11/15/2016	\$29.99	\$4,329.26	\$4,329.26
11/21/2016	LPC									\$62.18	\$4,391.44	\$4,391.44
11/21/2016	BILL	4344	R	30	68	2.27	337		12/15/2016	\$109.40	\$4,500.84	\$4,500.84
12/21/2016	LPC									\$63.82	\$4,564.66	\$4,564.66
12/21/2016	BILL	4487	R	32	143	4.47	756		1/18/2017	\$198.34	\$4,763.00	\$4,763.00
1/25/2017	LPC									\$66.79	\$4,829.79	\$4,829.79
1/25/2017	BILL	4651	R	35	164	4.69	905		2/17/2017	\$241.03	\$5,070.82	\$5,070.82
2/1/2017	PAY							Check		(\$244.00)	\$4,826.82	\$4,826.82
2/1/2017	PAY							Check		(\$50.00)	\$4,776.82	\$4,776.82

Transaction Date	Transaction Type	Reading	Read Code	# of Days	CCF Usage	Average CCF/Day	Heating DDDs	Payment Type	Due Date	Transaction Amount	Current Balance	Actual Balance
2/9/2017	PAY							Cash		(\$200.00)	\$4,576.82	\$4,576.82
2/23/2017	LPC									\$68.65	\$4,645.47	\$4,645.47
2/23/2017	BILL	4777	R	29	126	4.34	681		3/20/2017	\$195.83	\$4,841.30	\$4,841.30
3/23/2017	LPC									\$71.58	\$4,912.88	\$4,912.88
3/23/2017	BILL	4892	R	28	115	4.11	620		4/18/2017	\$174.63	\$5,087.51	\$5,087.51
4/24/2017	PAY							Credit Card		(\$200.00)	\$4,887.51	\$4,887.51
4/24/2017	BILL	4953	R	30	61	2.03	308		5/17/2017	\$107.45	\$4,994.96	\$4,994.96
5/22/2017	LPC									\$74.92	\$5,069.88	\$5,069.88
5/22/2017	BILL	4970	R	28	17	0.61	146		6/15/2017	\$36.58	\$5,106.46	\$5,106.46
6/21/2017	LPC									\$75.47	\$5,181.93	\$5,181.93
6/21/2017	BILL	4983	R	32	13	0.41	29		7/17/2017	\$30.65	\$5,212.58	\$5,212.58
7/21/2017	BILL	4993	R	30	10	0.33	0		8/15/2017	\$26.46	\$5,239.04	\$5,239.04
8/18/2017	PAY							Credit Card		(\$100.00)	\$5,139.04	\$5,139.04
8/21/2017	BILL	5004	R	29	11	0.38	0		9/14/2017	\$27.80	\$5,166.84	\$5,166.84

PGW Exhibit - 1

Page 3 of 3

Search For Negotiated Payment Arrangement [X]

Search Criteria

Account... 0004 2050 6143 Thomas, Shantelle

From Date: 09/05/2017

Date	Seq	Status	Comments
09/19/2011	1	Broken	
09/17/2009	1	Broken	BCS 2584789
05/15/2009	1	Broken	
03/01/2005	1	Canceled	PUC DECISION
03/01/2005	2	Broken	PUC DECISION

5 record(s) found.

PGW Exhibit - 2

Page 1 of 6

Action



Negotiated Payment Arrangement...

Account Information

Account ID: 0004 2050 6143 Name: Thomas, Shantelle
Arrangement Date: 09/19/2011 Monthly Payment: 182.00
Status: Broken Broken Count:
Broken Date: Catch-Up Amount: 0.00 Remain Number Months: 0

Background Information

Household Income: 1,080.00 Source of Income: EMPL - Employi

Expenses

Rent/Mortgage: 750.00 Arrangement Type: R - Repeaters
Second Mortgage: 0.00 PUC Investigator:
Food: 0.00 Level of Payment: 1
Food Stamps: 550.00 Phone number: 215 279 7464
Electric: 111.00
Gas: 77.26 Total Number in Household: 4
Water/Sewer: 50.00 65 years or older: 0
Total Other Expense: 25.00 5 years or younger: 0

Arrangement Exception Explanation:

Empty text box with scroll arrows

- Main
- Arrangement/Budget
- Scheduled Payments

PGW Exhibit - 2

Page 2 of 6

Action

Negotiated Payment Arrangement...



Down Payment Arrangement

Due Date: 09/26/2011 Down Payment: 195.00 Status: Kept

Utility Arrears Arrangement

Due Date: 10/20/2011 Total Amount: 3,145.00
Monthly Repayment: 53.00 Repay Months: 60
Billing Method: U - Budget Tot React Amt: 0.00

Non Utility Arrears Arrangement

Due Date: 10/20/2011 Total Amount: 0.00
Monthly Repayment: 0.00 Repay Months: 0

Budget

First Scheduled Pay Date: 10/20/2011
Suggested Budget Amount: 129
Pay By EFT: No

Calculate NPAR Terms

Show Terms

Accept Terms

Reject Terms

Main

Arrangement/Budget

Scheduled Payments

PGW Exhibit - 2

Page 3 of 16



Negotiated Payment Arrangement...

Account Information

Account ID: 0004 2050 6143 Name: Thomas, Shantelle
 Arrangement Date: 09/17/2008 Monthly Payment: 196.00
 Status: Broken Broken Count:
 Broken Date: Catch-Up Amount: 0.00 Remain Number Months: 0

Background Information

Household Income: 3,000.00 Source of Income: DTHE - Other

Expenses

Rent/Mortgage: 0.00 Arrangement Type: S - Straight
 Second Mortgage: 0.00 PUC Investigator: BCS 2584789 Clark
 Food: 0.00 Level of Payment: 3
 Food Stamps: 0.00 Phone number: 215
 Electric: 0.00
 Gas: 0.00 Total Number in Household: 4
 Water/Sewer: 0.00 65 years or older: 0
 Total Other Expense: 0.00 5 years or younger: 0

Arrangement Exception Explanation: BCS 2584789

- Main
- Arrangement/Budget
- Scheduled Payments

Action

Negotiated Payment Arrangement...

Down Payment Arrangement

Due Date: [] Down Payment: [0.00] Status: Broken

Utility Arrears Arrangement

Due Date: 10/20/2009 Total Amount: 1,642.30
Monthly Repayment: [69.00] Repay Months: [24]
Billing Method: U - Budget Tot React Amt: 0.00

Non Utility Arrears Arrangement

Due Date: [] Total Amount: 0.00
Monthly Repayment: [0.00] Repay Months: [0]

Budget

First Scheduled Pay Date: 10/20/2009
Suggested Budget Amount: [127]
Pay By EFT: No

Calculate NPAR Terms

Show Terms

Accept Terms

Reject Terms

Main

Arrangement/Budget

Scheduled Payments

PGW Exhibit - 2

Page 5 of 6

Account... 0004 2050 6143

Name: Thomas, Shantelle

ID: 420506143

Agreement Status: S - Suspended

Status Date: 11/04/2015

Status Reason:

Current CRP Start Date: 10/07/2014

Agreement Type: 9.00 - 9.00% Of Income

Date Recertified:

Agreement Amount: 149.73

Nbr of Persons in Household: 4

Gender: Female

Nbr of Persons 18 and under: 3

Nbr of Persons 62 and over:

Monthly Household Income: 1,663.75 81.20%

Source of Income: OTHE - Other

Previous Status: D - Defaulted

Previous Status Date: 04/20/2015

Previous Type: 25MI - \$25 Minimum

Previous CRP End Date: 06/03/2014

Previous Source of Income: EMPL - Employment

Previous Nbr of Persons In Ho

Curable Amount: 464.19

Nbr of Times Cured: 0

Curable Bills Nbr: 0

Suggested CRP Agreement Type_Amount

Calculate

- Main
- Address
- Billing
- Bill Print
- Intercept
- Misc Pers
- Misc
- Bankruptcy

CRP Agreement

Blocker Code

WO Reactivation

PGW Exhibit - 2

Page 6 of 6

PHILADELPHIA GAS WORKS

PUC

Opening XML

Case Number: 3508077
Company Name: PGW (PHILA. GAS WORKS (NGDC))
Company Code: 0766
Company Type: GAS TRANSPORTER
Customer First Name: SHANTELLE
Customer Middle Initial:
Customer Last Name: THOMAS
Customer Account Number: 0420506143
Customer Home Phone w/ Area Code:
Customer Work Phone w/ Area Code:
Customer Service Class: RESIDENTIAL
Customer Mail Address 1:
Customer Mail Address 2:
Customer Mail Address City:
Customer Mail Address State:
Customer Mail Address Zip:
Customer Mail Address 4-Zip:
Customer Service Address 1: 1930 E ALBERT ST.
Customer Service Address 2:
Customer Service Address City: PHILADELPHIA
Customer Service Address State: PA
Customer Service Address Zip: 19125
Customer Service Address 4-Zip: PGW Exhibit - 3
Customer Family Adults: 1 Page 1 of 4
Customer Family Children: 3
Customer Family Age: 16.14.8
Gross Income
Source **Income Amount**
EMP 2106
Date Open: 2017-03-29
Reason For Contact: CAP DISPUTE (#67)
Term Date:
Business Name:
Case Problem:
Company Position: 03/29/2017 CO OFFERED SEVERAL DIFFERENT AMOUNTS TO GET BACK IN CRP
Related Information: CU CLAIMS THAT SHE KEEPS GETTING SEVERAL DIFFERENT AMOUNTS TO GET BACK IN CRP. CU ONLY RECEIVED \$245 FROM LIHEAP. CU WAS TOLD BY PUC THAT LIHEAP "MAY BE ENOUGH TO COVER THE CU TO GET BACK IN CRP" IT WAS NOT ENOUGH MONEY TO GET THE CU BACK INTO THE CRP PROGRAM. CU WOULD LIKE THE PUC TO HELP HER GET INTO THE CRP PROGRAM. THE CELL PHONE NUMBER (267) 581 - 9795

HAS BEEN ALLOWED TO BE SHARED.

Case Misc Info:
Hot Issue:
Case Origin: TELEPHONE
Prior Case Number: 3432718
Universal Service: Y
Arrearage: 4841
BCS Investigator First Name: BCS
BCS Investigator Last Name: CASE POOL
BCS Investigator Phone w/ Area Code: 7177875468
BCSIntaker First Name: MARK
BCSIntaker Last Name: COSTIK
Number Of Time Send: 1
Number Of Time Faxed: 0
Number Of Time Faxed: 7177876641

PGW Exhibit - 3
Page 2 of 4

PHILADELPHIA GAS WORKS

PUC

Closing XML

Case Number:	3508077	
Company Name:	PGW (PHILA. GAS WORKS (NGDC)	
Company Code:	0766	
Company Type:	GAS TRANSPORTER	
Customer First Name:	SHANTELLE	
Customer Middle Initial:		
Customer Last Name:	THOMAS	
Account Number:	420506143	
Service Address 1:	1930 EAST ALBERT STREET	
Service Address 2:		
Service City:	PHILADELPHIA	
Service State:	PA	
Service Zip 5:	19125	
Service Zip 4:		
Decision Issue:	Y	
Oral Written:	W	
Violation:	NO	
Chapter:		
Section Rule:		
Total Balance:	4794.96	
Date Closed:	2017-05-18	
Resolution:	DECISION ISSUED - THE LIHEAP PAYMENT IN THE AMOUNT OF \$294.00 WAS RECEIVED ON 2/1/2017 AND WAS NOT ENOUGH TO SATISFY THE CUSTOMER RESPONSIBILITY PROGRAM CURE AMOUNT. THE CUSTOMER RESPONSIBILITY PROGRAM CURE AMOUNT INCREASES OR DECREASES AS BILLS GENERATE AND PAYMENTS ARE RECEIVED. THE CUSTOMER RESPONSIBILITY PROGRAM AGREEMENT WOULD BE NON-BENEFICIAL TO THIS CUSTOMER AT THIS TIME BASED ON THE CUSTOMER'S HOUSEHOLD INCOME AND SIZE. THE CUSTOMER HAS NOT SATISFIED THE BALANCE ON THE PRIOR PUC PAYMENT AGREEMENT ISSUED ON CASE NUMBER 2584789 AND INELIGIBLE FOR ANOTHER AT THIS TIME. CASE DISMISSED.	
Balance Date:	2017-04-04	
Service Restored Pay:	0.00	
Service Continue Amount:	0.00	
Service Continue Date:		
Terms:		
Special Budget Amount:	0.00	PGW Exhibit - <u>3</u>
Regular Budget Amount:	0.00	
Arrears Payment Plus:	0.00	Page <u>3</u> of <u>4</u>
FinalMonthlyPayment:	0.00	
CurrentMonthlyPayment:	0.00	
EndMonthlyPayment:	0.00	

LetterDescription: EGW PAR W/COMPLEX DISPUTE/NO PAYMENT AGREEMENT/LEVEL 1
HeadDate: 2017-05-22
Paragraph:
Bill Date:
Reconnect Amount: 0
Pay Amount: 0.00
BCS Investigator First Name: MARIA
BCS Investigator Last Name: VELEZ
Number Of Time Send: 1
Number Of Time Faxed: 0
PUC Fax: 7177876641

PGW Exhibit - 3
Page 4 of 4

Shantelle Thomas v. PGW
Docket No. F-2017-2612646

SERVICE LIST

Shantelle Thomas
1930 E Albert Street
Philadelphia PA 19125
267 581 9795

Graciela Christlieb Esquire
Philadelphia Gas Works
800 W Montgomery Avenue
Philadelphia PA 19122
215.684.6164
ACCEPTS E-SERVICE