**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission : R-2018-3000124

: R-2018-3000829

:

Office of Consumer Advocate : C-2018-3001029

Jason Dolby : C-2018-3001074

Peoples Natural Gas Company LLC : C-2018-3001152

Office of Small Business Advocate : C-2018-3001566

Duquesne Industrial Intervenors : C-2018-3001713

:

v. :

:

Duquesne Light Company :

1308(d) Proceeding :

**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Upon consideration of the Motion for a Protective Order that was filed by Duquesne Light Company on May 31, 2018 in the base rate proceeding captioned above;

IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. The Protective Order is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 and 3 below, which have been or will be filed with the Commission, produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during the above-captioned proceeding and all proceedings consolidated therewith. All persons previously or hereafter granted access to the materials and information identified in Ordering Paragraphs 2 and 3 of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Protective Order.
2. The materials or information subject to this Protective Order are all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials which are believed by the producing Party to be of a proprietary or confidential nature, and which are so designated by being stamped “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter collectively referred to as “Proprietary Information”). When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be appropriately designated as such for the record.
3. This Protective Order applies to the following materials:

(a) The producing Party may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” those materials which customarily are treated by that Party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that Party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury;

(b) To the extent that it is consistent with 52 Pa. Code § 5.365(e), the producing Party may also seek special restrictions of those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature or of such a private, personal nature that the producing Party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. Each of the Parties shall endeavor to limit its use of special restrictions.

1. Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for the nonproducing Party, subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination or argument in this proceeding and not in any other proceedings or matters. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, counsel for a Party may afford access to Proprietary Information subject to the conditions set forth in this Protective Order.
2. Proprietary Information produced in this proceeding shall be made available to the Commission and its Staff. Proprietary Information that is filed or otherwise provided to the Commission and placed in the Commission’s report folders, shall not be subject to public disclosure in accordance with routine Commission procedures. To the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s testimony or document folders, such information shall be separately bound, conspicuously marked, and accompanied by a copy of this Protective Order. Public inspection of Protected Information shall be permitted only in accordance with this Protective Order.
3. Proprietary Information shall be made available to a Reviewing Representative in this proceeding pursuant to the following procedures:
4. Information deemed as “CONFIDENTIAL”, shall be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who is a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and who is:

(i) an attorney who has made an appearance in this proceeding for a Party;

(ii) attorneys, paralegals, and other employees associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph (i);

(iii) an expert or an employee of an expert retained by a Party for the purpose of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding;

(iv) employees or other representatives of a Party appearing in this proceeding with significant responsibility for the docket.

1. Parties may also restrict access to “CONFIDENTIAL” information and materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature or of such a private, personal nature that the producing Party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. In such cases, this CONFIDENTIAL information would be

available to a Reviewing Representative that has signed a Non-Disclosure Agreement and who is:

1. an attorney for a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code §1.8 or an outside counsel who has made an appearance in this proceeding for a Party;

(ii) an attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph (i);

(iii) an outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a Party for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding;

(iv) a person designated as a Reviewing Representative pursuant to Paragraph 10.

If Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission’s rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e), the producing Party may, by subsequent motion or objection, seek further protection with respect to “CONFIDENTIAL” material, including but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular Parties.

1. Proprietary Information shall not be made available to a “Restricted Person.” For the purpose of this Protective Order, “Restricted Person” shall mean: (a) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, owner or employee of any competitor of a Party or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s primary duties involve the development, marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services; (b) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of a Party (including any association of competitors of a Party) or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s primary duties involve the development, marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services; (c) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of a competitor of a Party’s customer if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of a Party; and (d) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a Party’s customer if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of a Party; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert’s interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than $10,000 (excluding mutual funds) or constituting more than 1% interest in a business establishes a significant motive for violation.
2. If an expert for a Party, another member of the expert’s firm or the expert’s firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person, said expert must: (1) identify for the Parties each Restricted Person and each expert or consultant; (2) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert’s participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (3) if segregation of such personnel is impractical, the expert shall give to the producing Party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize the interests of the Parties or their customers. The producing Party retains the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the nonproducing Party or its customers’ interests will not be jeopardized. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission.
3. A qualified “Reviewing Representative” for CONFIDENTIAL materials subject to special restrictions may review and discuss the “CONFIDENTIAL” material that has been so restricted with his or her client or with the entity with which he or she is employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a “Restricted Person,” but may not share with or permit the client or entity to review the “CONFIDENTIAL” material that has been so restricted, provided, however, that counsel for the Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”), Office of Consumer Advocate and Office of Small Business Advocate may share Proprietary Information with the I&E Deputy Chief Prosecutor, I&E Director, Consumer Advocate and Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure certificate from these individuals, provided, however, that these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of the Protective Order.
4. Proprietary Information shall be treated by the nonproducing Party and by the Reviewing Representative in accordance with the certificate executed pursuant to Paragraph 12(a). Information deemed Proprietary Information shall not be used except as necessary for the conduct of this proceeding, nor shall it be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person’s responsibilities in this proceeding. For I&E, the I&E Prosecutor may afford access to Proprietary Information made available by Duquesne Light only to I&E’s assigned and identified internal expert(s) who are full-time I&E employees and therefore subject to the terms of this Protective Order by virtue of the signature of the I&E Prosecutor affixed to his executed Non-Disclosure Certificate. Prior to making the provided Proprietary Information available to its full-time employed expert as provided above, the I&E Prosecutor shall notify said internal expert of the existence of the Protective Order and shall provide a copy of it to that expert with an admonition that he or she is bound by its provisions for the duration of the proceeding. Said I&E Prosecutor is responsible for ensuring that each and every individual to whom he or she provides Proprietary Information complies with all terms and conditions of the Protective Order.
5. Reviewing Representatives may not use information contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through this proceeding to give any Party or any competitor of any Party a commercial advantage. In the event that the nonproducing Party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraph 6 above, that Party shall seek agreement from the Party producing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative pursuant to Paragraph 6 above with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the nonproducing Party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.
6. (a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate set forth in Appendix A hereto, provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney’s instruction, supervision or control need not do so. A copy of each Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel for the Party asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

(b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with this Protective Order.

1. A producing Party shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by stamping the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or otherwise noting that the materials are subject to special restrictions. Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the producing Party, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information. The Proprietary Information shall be served upon the nonproducing Party hereto only in an envelope separate from the nonproprietary materials, and the envelope shall be conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL”
2. The nonproducing Party will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in Section 335(d) of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa. C.S. § 335(d), and is within the definition of “confidential proprietary information” in the Pennsylvania Right to Know Law, Act of February 14, 2008, P.L. 6, 65 P.S. §§ 67.101-67.3104, until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary. In the event that any person or entity seeks to compel the disclosure of Proprietary Information, the nonproducing Party shall promptly notify the producing Party in order to provide the producing Party an opportunity to oppose or limit such disclosure.
3. Any public reference to Proprietary Information by a Party or its Reviewing Representative shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to fully understand the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.
4. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument and responses to discovery, and including references thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 15 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the Parties or pursuant to order of the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission or appellate court.
5. The nonproducing Party shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and any special restrictions on the review and discussion of such information with a Restricted Person. If a nonproducing Party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the Party providing the information retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.
6. Each Party shall retain the right to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information; to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground; to refuse to produce Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection; and to seek additional measures of protection of Proprietary Information beyond those provided in this Protective Order.
7. Within thirty (30) days after a Commission final order is entered in the above-captioned proceeding, or in the event of appeals, within thirty (30) days after appeals are finally decided, the nonproducing Party, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the producing Party all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. In the event that the nonproducing Party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information to the producing Party, the nonproducing Party shall certify in writing to the producing Party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed.

Dated: June 1, 2018

Katrina L. Dunderdale

Administrative Law Judge

**R-2018-3000124 – PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION V. DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY 1308(D)**

*(Revised 5/29/18)*

MICHAEL W GANG ESQUIRE

**\***ANTHONY D KANAGY ESQUIRE

POST & SCHELL PC

12TH FLOOR

17 NORTH SECOND STREET

HARRISBURG PA 17101-1601

**717.731.1970**

*Representing Duquesne Light Company*

***\*Accepts e-Service***

DAVID T FISFIS ESQUIRE

**\***TISHEKIA E WILLIAMS ESQUIRE

**\***MICHAEL ZIMMERMAN ESQUIRE

EMILY M FARAH ESQUIRE

DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY

411 SEVENTH AVENUE

PITTSBURGH PA 15219

**412.393.6924**

**412.393.1541**

**412.393.6268**

**412.393.6431**

*Representing Duquesne Light Company*

***\*Accepts e-Service***

ANTHONY C DECUSATIS ESQUIRE

MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

1701 MARKET STREET

PHILADELPHIA PA 19103-2921

**215.963.5034**

*Representing Duquesne Light Company*

***Accepts e-Service***

C JAMES DAVIS DIRECTOR

RATE & TARIFF SERVICES

DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY

411 7TH AVENUE

MAIL DROP 15-S

PITTSBURGH PA 15219

**412.393.6402**

\*PHILLIP D DEMANCHICK ESQUIRE

DAVID T EVRARD ESQUIRE

ARON J BEATTY ESQUIRE

OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE

555 WALNUT ST 5TH FL FORUM PLACE

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717.783.5048**

*Representing Office of Consumer Advocate*

***C-2018-3001029***

***\*Accepts e-Service***

SHARON E WEBB ESQUIRE

DANIEL G ASMUS ESQUIRE

JOHN R EVANS

OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE

300 NORTH SECOND STREET

SUITE 202

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717.783.2525**

*Representing Office of Small Business Advocate*

***C-2018-3001566***

GINA L MILLER ESQURE

JOHN M COOGAN ESQUIRE

PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION & ENFORCEMENT

PO BOX 3265

HARRISBURG PA 17105-3265

**717.783.8754**

**717.783.6151**

**717.783.7998**

*Representing BI&E*

***Accepts e-Service***

JOSEPH L VULLO ESQUIRE

BURKE VULLO REILLY ROBERTS

1460 WYOMING AVENUE

FORTY FORT PA 18704

**570.288.6441**

*Representing Community Action Association of Pennsylvania (CAAP)*

***Accepts e-Service***

SCOTT J RUBIN ESQUIRE

333 OAK LANE

BLOOMSBURG PA 17815-2036

**570.387.1893**

*Representing International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers Local 29 (IBEW)*

***Accepts e-Service***

DAVID P ZAMBITO ESQUIRE

JONATHAN NASE ESQUIRE

COZEN O’CONNOR

17 NORTH SECOND STREET

SUITE 1410

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717.703.5892**

**717.773.4191**

*Representing Peoples Natural Gas Company LLC*

***Accepts e-Service***

PATRICK M CICERO ESQUIRE

KADEEM G MORRIS ESQUIRE

**\***ELIZABETH RMARX ESQUIRE

PENNSYLVANIA UTILITY LAW PROJECT

118 LOCUST STREET

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717.236.9486**

*Representing Coalition for Affordable Utility Services (CAUSE-PA)*

***\*Accepts e-Service***

MARK C SZYBIST ESQUIRE

NATURAL RESOURCES

DEFENSE COUNCIL

1152 15TH STREET NW SUITE 300

WASHINGTON DC 20005

**202.289.2422**

*Representing Natural Resources Defense Council (NRDC)*

***Accepts e-Service***

PAMELA C POLACEK ESQUIRE

MATTHEW L GARBER ESQUIRE

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

100 PINE STREET

PO BOX 1166

HARRISBURG PA 17108-1166

**717.232-8000**

*Representing Duquesne Industrial Intervenors*

***Accepts e-Service***

JOSEPH OTIS MINOTT ESQUIRE

LOGAN WELDE ESQUIRE

CLEAN AIR COUNCIL

135 SOUTH 19TH STREET

SUITE 300

PHILADELPHIA PA 19103

**215.567.4004**

*Representing Clean Air Council*

***Accepts e-Service***

DERRICK PRICE WILLIAMSON ESQUIRE

BARRY A NAUM ESQUIRE

SPILMAN THOMAS & BATTLE PLLC

1100 BENT CREEK BOULEVARD

SUITE 101

MECHANICSBURG PA 17050

**717.795.2740**

**717.795.2742**

*Representing Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc. (collectively, Walmart)*

***Accepts e-Service***

RENARDO L HICKS ESQUIRE

DILWORTH PAXSON LLP

2 NORTH 2ND STREET

SUITE 1101

HARRISBURG PA 17101-2105

**717.213.4106**

*Representing ChargePoint, Inc.*

***Accepts e-Service***

JASON DOLBY

409 ANAWANDA AVENUE

PITTSBURGH PA 15228

***C-2018-3001074***

***Accepts e-Service***

**C-2018-3001152 – PEOPLES NATURAL GAS COMPANY LLC v. DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY 1308(D)**

*(Revised 6/1/18)*

ANTHONY C DECUSATIS ESQUIRE

MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP

1701 MARKET STREET

PHILADELPHIA PA 19103-2921

**215.963.5034**

*Representing Duquesne Light Company*

***Accepts e-Service***

TISHEKIA WILLIAMS ESQUIRE

DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY

411 SEVENTH AVENUE 16TH FLOOR

PITTSBURGH PA 15219

**412.393.1541**

*Representing Duquesne Light Company*

***Accepts e-Service***

C JAMES DAVIS DIRECTOR

RATE & TARIFF SERVICES

DUQUESNE LIGHT COMPANY

411 7TH AVENUE

MAIL DROP 15-S

PITTSBURGH PA 15219

**412.393.6402**

DAVID P ZAMBITO ESQUIRE

JONATHAN NASE ESQUIRE

COZEN O’CONNOR

17 NORTH SECOND STREET

SUITE 1410

HARRISBURG PA 17101

**717.703.5892**

**717.773.4191**

*Representing Peoples Natural Gas Company LLC*

***Accepts e-Service***