**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Meghan Flynn :

Rosemary Fuller :

Michael Walsh : P-2018-3006117

Nancy Harkins :

Gerald McMullen : C-2018-3006116

Caroline Hughes and :

Melissa Haines :

 :

 v. :

 :

Sunoco Pipeline, L.P. :

**AMENDED PROTECTIVE ORDER**

AND NOW, upon due consideration of Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.’s Motion for Amended Protective Order filed on April 17, 2019, Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.’s Motion to Strike Untimely Intervenors’ Answer to Motion for Amended Protective Order filed on May 17, 2019, Complainants Meghan Flynn, Rosemary Fuller, Michael Walsh, Nancy Harkins, Gerald McMullen, Caroline Hughes, and Melissa Haines Response to Sunoco’s Motion for Amended Protective Order filed on April 24, 2019, Intervenor Andover Homeowners’ Association’s Answer to Sunoco Pipeline L.P.’s Motion for Amended Protective Order filed on May 8, 2019, and Intervenors Chester County, Delaware County, East Goshen Township, Uwchlan Township, Downingtown School District, and Rose Tree Media School District’s Opposition to Sunoco Pipeline L.P.’s Motion for Amended Protective Order filed on May 19, 2019;

**IT IS ORDERED THAT:**

1. Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.’s Motion to Strike Untimely Intervenors’ Answer to Motion for Amended Protective Order filed on May 17, 2019 is denied.
2. Sunoco Pipeline, L.P.’s Motion to Amend Protective Order is hereby granted in part and denied in part with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 – 3 below that have been or will be filed with the Commission, produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during the above-captioned proceedings and all proceedings consolidated therewith.
3. The information subject to this Protective Order is all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, furnished in these proceedings, which are believed by the producing party to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and which are so designated by being marked “CONFIDENTIAL,” “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL,” or “EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS.” Such materials will be referred to below as “Proprietary Information.” When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be designated as such for the record.
4. This Protective Order applies to the following categories of materials: (a) the parties may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that customarily are treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury; (b) the parties may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL” those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature among the parties or of such a private, personal nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. Moreover, information subject to protection under the Public Utility Confidential Security Information Disclosure Protection Act (35 P.S. §§ 2141.1 to 2141.6) and PUC Regulations at 52 Pa. Code §§ 102.1-102.4 will also be designated as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL”; (c) the parties may designate as “EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS” those materials that are subject to protection under the Public Utility Confidential Security Information Disclosure Protection Act (35 P.S. §§ 2141.1 to 2141.6) and PUC Regulations at 52 Pa. Code §§ 102.1-102.4 and are of such an extremely sensitive security nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. The parties shall endeavor to limit their designation of information as Highly confidential PROTECTED MATERIAL and EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS.
5. Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for a party, subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in these proceedings. To the extent required for participation in these proceedings, counsel for a party may afford access to Proprietary Information subject to the conditions set forth in this Protective Order.
6. Information deemed as “CONFIDENTIAL” shall be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who is a person that has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as Appendix A, and who is:

 (i) An attorney who has entered an appearance in these proceedings for a party;

 (ii) Attorneys, paralegals, and other employees associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph 5(i);

 (iii) An expert or an employee of an expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising, preparing for or testifying in these proceedings; or

1. Employees or other representatives of a party appearing in these proceedings with significant responsibility for this docket.
2. Information deemed as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL”, may be provided to a “Reviewing Representative” who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as Appendix A and who is:

 (i) An attorney for a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code §1.8 or a counsel who has entered an appearance in these proceedings for a party;

 (ii) An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph (i);

 (iii) An outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a party for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in these proceedings; or

 (iv) A person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of Highly Confidential PROTECTED MATERIAL, provided that a Reviewing Representative for purposes of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL shall not include an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties, or of any shipper, customer or consignee of any affiliate of any competitor of the parties, or shipper, customer or consignee, or any employee of any such entity, if the employee’s duties involve marketing or pricing responsibilities, or any responsibility for marketing or pricing with respect to the transportation or commodity sales and/or exchanges of refined petroleum products.

Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission’s Rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e), any party may, by subsequent objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular persons or parties.

1. Information deemed as “EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS” will be provided for inspection or in-person review to the same persons constituting Reviewing Representatives under paragraph 6 of this Order. “EXTREMELY SENSISTIVE MATERIALS” will only be provided through in-person review at either the offices of Manko, Gold, Katcher & Fox, 401 City Avenue, Suite 901, Bala Cynwyd, PA 19004 or upon request of a party to this action, at another location designated by Sunoco Pipeline, L.P. in the Harrisburg-metro or Pittsburgh-metro areas of the Commonwealth, between the hours of 9AM to 5PM, Monday – Friday. Request to view such information shall be made to Diana Silva via email (dsilva@mankogold.com) at least 72-hours prior to the requested viewing session. Such review may be proctored and Reviewing Representatives are prohibited from reproducing such information in any form without the prior authorization of SPLP’s counsel (including taking detailed notes or cell phone pictures). If a party determines that it is necessary to use “EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS” as part of their presentation of evidence in this proceeding, such party shall request a copy from counsel for Sunoco Pipeline L.P., which permission shall not be unreasonably withheld and subject to that party confirming it understands and will abide by the terms of this Protective Order concerning use of such materials. Disputes over the designation of “EXTREMELY SENSISTIVE MATERIALS” or the withholding of copies of “EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS” to the parties must be presented to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution following an expedited opportunity (5-day period) for the other Parties to comment. Resolution of disputes may involve at the discretion of the presiding officer an *in camera* review of the discovery materials in question.
2. For purposes of this Protective Order, a Reviewing Representative may not be a “Restricted Person.”

 (a) A “Restricted Person” shall mean: (i) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services; (ii) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the parties (including any association of competitors of the parties) or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services; (iii) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; and (iv) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert’s interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than $10,000 or constituting more than a 1% interest in a business establishes a significant motive for violation.

 (b) If an expert for a party, another member of the expert’s firm or the expert’s firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person, said expert must: (i) identify for the parties each Restricted Person and each expert or consultant; (ii) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert’s participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (iii) if segregation of such personnel is impractical the expert shall give to the producing party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize the interests of the parties or their customers. The parties retain the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the parties’ or their customers’ interests will not be jeopardized. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission or the presiding Administrative Law Judge.

8. A qualified “Reviewing Representative” for “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL” may review and discuss “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL” with their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a “Restricted Person”, but may not share with or permit the client or entity to review the “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL.” Such discussions must be general in nature and not disclose specific “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL.”

1. Information deemed Proprietary Information shall not be used except as necessary for the conduct of these proceedings, nor shall it be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of these proceedings and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person’s responsibilities in these proceedings.
2. Reviewing Representatives may not use information contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through these proceedings to give any party or any competitor or customer or consignee of any party a commercial advantage. In the event that a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraphs 5(i) through 5(iv) or 6(i) through 6(iii) above, the party shall seek agreement from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative pursuant to Paragraph 6(iv) above with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.
3. (a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney's instruction, supervision or control need not do so. A copy of each Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel for the parties asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

 (b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with the Protective Order.

1. None of the parties waive their right to pursue any other legal or equitable remedies that may be available in the event of actual or anticipated disclosure of Proprietary Information.
2. The parties shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by marking the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL.” Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the parties, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in these proceedings, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information. The Proprietary Information shall be served upon the parties hereto only in an envelope separate from the nonproprietary materials, and the envelope shall be conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL.”

1. The parties will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in Section 335(d) of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa. C.S. § 335(d), and the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Act, 65 P.S. §§ 67.101 *et seq.*, until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary. In the event that any person or entity seeks to compel the disclosure of Proprietary Information, the non-producing party shall promptly notify the producing party in order to provide the producing party an opportunity to oppose or limit such disclosure.
2. Any public reference to Proprietary Information by a party or its Reviewing Representatives shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.
3. Part of any record of these proceedings containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument, and responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 15 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties to this proceeding or pursuant to an order of the Commission.
4. The parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information. If a party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the party providing the information retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.
5. The parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information; to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground; and to refuse to produce Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection.
6. Within 30 days after a Commission final order is entered in the above-captioned proceedings, or in the event of appeals, within thirty days after appeals are finally decided, the parties, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the parties all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. In the event that a party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information to the parties, the party shall certify in writing to the other producing party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed.

Dated: June 6, 2019 /s/

 Elizabeth H. Barnes

 Administrative Law Judge

**BEFORE THE**

**PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| MEGHAN FLYNNROSEMARY FULLERMICHAEL WALSHNANCY HARKINSGERALD MCMULLENCAROLINE HUGHES andMELISSA HAINESComplainants, v.SUNOCO PIPELINE L.P., Respondent. | ::::::::::::::: | Docket No. C-2018-3006116 P-2018-3006117 |

**AMENDED NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE**

**TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:**

The undersigned is the \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ (the retaining party). The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order deals with the treatment of Proprietary Information, and the undersigned is a (check ONE):

€ Reviewing Representative for CONFIDENTIAL information.

€ Reviewing Representative for CONFIDENTIAL, HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL information, and EXTREMELY SENSITIVE MATERIALS.

The undersigned agrees to be bound by and comply with the terms and conditions of said Protective Order.

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Name

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Signature

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Address

 \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Employer

**C-2018-3006116 et. al.- MEGHAN FLYNN et. al. v. SUNOCO PIPELINE LP**

*(Revised 6.6.19)*

MICHAEL BOMSTEIN ESQUIREPINNOLA & BOMSTEINSUITE 2126 LAND TITLE BUILDING100 SOUTH BROAD STREETPHILADELPHIA PA 19110**215.592.8383***Representing Complainants*

MEGHAN FLYNN212 LUNDGREN ROADLENNI PA 19052*Complainant*

ROSEMARY FULLER226 VALLEY ROAD MEDIA PA 19063**610.358.1262*Accepts E-Service***

*Complainant*

MICHAEL WALSH12 HADLEY LANEGLEN MILLS PA 19342 *Complainant*

NANCY HARKINS

1521 WOODLAND RDWEST CHESTER PA 19382**484.678.9612*Accepts E-Service***

*Complainant*

GERALD MCMULLEN200 HILLSIDE DRIVEEXTON PA 19341

*Complainant*

CAROLINE HUGHES 1101 AMALFI DRIVE WEST CHESTER PA 19380**484.883.1156*Accepts E-Service***

MELISSA HAINES176 RONALD ROADASTON PA 19014*Complainant*

CURTIS STAMBAUGH ASSISTANT GENERAL COUNSELSUNOCO PIPELINE LP212 N THIRD STREET SUITE 201HARRISBURG PA 17101**717.236.1731**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Sunoco Pipeline LP*

NEIL S WITKES ESQUIRE

ROBERT D FOX ESQUIRE

DIANA A SILVA ESQUIRE

MANKO, GOLD, KATCHER & FOX LLP

401 CITY AVENUE

VALA CYNWYD PA 19004

**484.430.2314**

**484.430.2312**

**484.430.2347**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Sunoco Pipeline LP*

THOMAS J SNISCAK ESQUIREHAWKE MCKEON AND SNISCAK LLP100 N TENTH STREET HARRISBURG PA 17101**717.236.1300*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Sunoco Pipeline LP*

RICH RAIDERS ATTORNEY606 NORTH 5TH STREET READING PA 19601**484.509.2715*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Andover Homeowners’ Association Inc.*

ANTHONY D KANAGY ESQUIRE

GARRET P LENT ESQUIRE

POST & SCHELL PC

17 N SECOND ST 12TH FL

HARRISBURG PA 17101-1601

**717.612.6034**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Range Resources Appalachia*

ERIN MCDOWELL ESQUIRE

3000 TOWN CENTER BLVD

CANONSBURG PA 15317

**725.754.5352**

*Representing Intervenor Range Resources Appalachia*

LEAH ROTENBERG ESQUIRE MAYS CONNARD & ROTENBERG LLP1235 PENN AVE SUITE 202WYOMISSING PA 19610**610.400.0481*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Twins Valley School District*

MARGARET A MORRIS ESQUIREREGER RIZZO & DARNALL2929 ARCH STREET 13TH FLOORPHILADELPHIA PA 19104**215.495.6524*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor East Goshen Township*

 VINCENT MATTHEW POMPO ESQUIRELAMB MCERLANE PC24 EAST MARKET ST PO BOX 565WEST CHESTER PA 19381**610.701.4411*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor West Whiteland Township*

MARK L FREED ESQUIRE
JOANNA WALDRON ESQUIRECURTIN & HEEFNER LLPDOYLESTOWN COMMERCE CENTER 2005 S EASTON ROAD SUITE 100DOYLESTOWN PA 18901**267.898.0570*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Uwchlan Township*

JAMES R FLANDREAUPAUL FLANDREAU & BERGER LLP320 WEST FRONT ST MEDIA PA 19063**610.565.4750*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Middletown Township*

PATRICIA BISWANGER ESQUIREPATRICIA BISWANGER217 NORTH MONROE STREETMEDIA PA 19063**610.608.0687*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor County of Delaware*

ALEX JOHN BAUMLER ESQUIRE LAMB MCERLANE PC24 EAST MARKET STBOX 565WEST CHESTER PA 19381**610.701.3277*Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Downingtown Area School District, et al.*

GUY DONATELLI ESQUIRE

LAMB MCERLANE PC24 EAST MARKET STBOX 565WEST CHESTER PA 19381

**610.430.8000***Representing Intervenor Rose Tree Media School District*

JAMES DALTONUNRUH TURNER BURKE & FREESPO BOX 515WEST CHESTER PA 19381**610.692.1371***Representing Intervenor West Chester Area School District*

JAMES BYRNE ESQUIRE

MCNICHOL BYRNE & MATLAWSKI PC

1223 N PROVIDENCE RD

MEDIA PA 19063

**610.565.4322**

***Accepts E-Service***

*Representing Intervenor Thornbury Township*

MELISSA DIBERNARDINO

1602 OLD ORCHARD LANE

WEST CHESTER PA 19380

**484.881.2829**
***Accepts E-Service***

VIRGINIA MARCILLE KERSLAKE

103 SHOEN ROAD

EXTON PA 19341

**215.200.2966**

***Accepts E-Service****Intervenor*

LAURA OBENSKI

14 S VILLAGE AVE

EXTON PA 19341

**484.947.6149**

***Accepts E-Service***

REBECCA BRITTON

211 ANDOVER DR

EXTON PA 19341

**215.776.7516**

***Accepts E-Service***

JOSH MAXWELL

MAYOR OF DOWNINGTOWN

4 W LANCASTER AVENUE DOWNINGTON PA 19335

*Intervenor*

THOMAS CASEY

1113 WINDSOR DR

WEST CHESTER PA 19380

*Intervenor*

KELLY SULLIVAN ESQUIRE

MCNICHOL BYRNE & MATLAWSKI

1223 NORTH PROVIDENCE RD

MEDIA PA 19063
**610.565.4322
*Accepts E-Service****Representing Thornbury Twp.*

MICHAEL P PIERCE ESQUIRE

MICHAEL P PIERCE PC

17 VETERANS SQUARE

PO BOX 604

MEDIA PA 19063
**610.566.0911
*Accepts E-Service****Representing Edgmont Twp.*