

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3046931
	:	
	:	
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2024-3048362
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2024-3048467
Alan McCarthy	:	C-2024-3048475
Philadelphia Area Industrial Energy Users Group	:	C-2024-3048671
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
PECO Energy Company (Electric)	:	

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3046932
	:	
	:	
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2024-3048363
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2024-3048456
State Representative Christina Sappey	:	C-2024-3048631
Alan McCarthy	:	C-2024-3048497
Philadelphia Area Industrial Energy Users Group	:	C-2024-3048881
	:	
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
PECO Energy Company (Gas)	:	

PROTECTIVE ORDER

Upon consideration of the request for Protective Order made by PECO Energy Company (PECO) which was attached to its Prehearing Conference Memorandum filed on May 6, 2024 in this matter and absent any objections by the other parties to the matter:

This Protective Order is hereby GRANTED with respect to all documents and information, as identified below, produced or presented, or hereafter produced or presented, in this proceeding. All persons now or hereafter granted access to such documents and/or information shall use and maintain the same only in strict accordance with this Protective Order.

This Protective Order is being entered to facilitate the orderly production of information and documents during discovery and the presentation of evidence at the hearings in this case, and to provide adequate protection of Confidential Information without prejudicing the rights of parties to have reasonable access to information that becomes part of the evidentiary record.

THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. The information subject to this Protective Order is all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, whether produced or reproduced or stored on paper, cards, tape, disk, film, electronic facsimile, magnetic or optical memory, computer storage devices or any other devices or media, including, but not limited to, electronic mail (e-mail), furnished in this proceeding that the producing party believes to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and are so designated by being stamped “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material. Such materials are referred to in this Order as “Proprietary Information.” When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be designated as such for the record.

2. For purposes of this Protective Order there are two categories of Proprietary Information: “CONFIDENTIAL” and “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material. A producing party may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that are customarily treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, that are not available to the public, and that, if generally disclosed, would subject that party or its clients to the risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury. A producing party may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature, relative to the business interests of parties to this proceeding, or of such a private or personal nature, that

the producing party determined that a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials is appropriate. The parties shall endeavor to limit the information designated as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material.

3. Subject to the terms of this Protective Order, Proprietary Information shall be provided to counsel for a party who meets the criteria of a “Reviewing Representative” as set forth below. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, testimony, cross examination or argument in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, such counsel may allow others to have access to Proprietary Information only in accordance with the conditions and limitations set forth in this Protective Order.

4. Information deemed “CONFIDENTIAL” shall be provided to a “Reviewing Representative.” For purposes of “CONFIDENTIAL” Proprietary Information, a “Reviewing Representative” is a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and is:

- i. A statutory advocate, or an attorney for a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8 or an attorney who has formally entered an appearance in this proceeding on behalf of a party;
- ii. An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph (i) above;
- iii. An expert or an employee of an expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising that party or testifying in this proceeding on behalf of that party; or
- iv. Employees or other representatives of a party to this proceeding who have significant responsibility for developing or presenting the party’s positions in this docket.

5. Information deemed “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material shall be provided to a Reviewing Representative, provided, however that a Reviewing Representative, for purposes of “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material, is limited to a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate and is:

- i. A statutory advocate, or an attorney for a statutory advocate, pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8 or an attorney who has

formally entered an appearance in this proceeding on behalf of a party;

ii. An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph (i);

iii. An outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a party for the purposes of advising that party or testifying in this proceeding on behalf of that party; or

iv. A person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material pursuant to paragraph 11.

Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure (52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e)) any party may, by objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular parties.

6. For purposes of this Protective Order, a Reviewing Representative may not be a "Restricted Person" absent agreement of the party producing the Proprietary Information pursuant to Paragraph 11. A "Restricted Person" shall mean: (a) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services or advising another person who has such duties; (b) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the parties (including any association of competitors of the parties) or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services or advising another person who has such duties; (c) an officer, director, stockholder, owner, agent (excluding any person under Paragraph 6.i or 6.ii), or employee of a competitor of a customer of the parties or of a competitor of a vendor of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer or vendor of the parties; and (d) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert's interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violating the limitations of permissible use of the

Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than \$10,000 or constituting more than a 1% interest in a business establish a significant motive for violation. A “Restricted Person” shall not include an expert for the Office of Small Business Advocate or Office of Consumer Advocate.

7. If an expert for a party, another member of the expert’s firm or the expert’s firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person (other than an expert or expert firm retained by the Office of Small Business Advocate or Office of Consumer Advocate), that expert must: (1) identify for the parties each Restricted Person and all personnel in or associated with the expert’s firm that work on behalf of the Restricted Person; (2) take all reasonable steps to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert’s participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (3) if segregation of such personnel is impractical, the expert shall give to the producing party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way adversely affect the interests of the parties or their customers. The parties retain the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the parties’ or their customers’ interests will not be adversely affected. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission.

8. Reviewing Representatives qualified to receive “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material may discuss HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material with their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a “Restricted Person,” but may not share with, or permit the client or entity to review or have access to, the HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL protected material.

9. Proprietary Information shall be treated by the parties and by the Reviewing Representative in accordance with the terms of this Protective Order, which are hereby expressly incorporated into the certificate that must be executed pursuant to Paragraph 12(a). Proprietary Information shall be used as necessary, for the conduct of this proceeding and for no other purpose. Proprietary Information shall not be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who

needs to know the information in order to carry out that person's responsibilities in this proceeding, provided, however, that counsel for I&E, the Office of Consumer Advocate, and Office of Small Business Advocate may share Proprietary Information with the I&E Director, the Consumer Advocate, and the Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure Certificate from these individuals, provided, however, that these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of the Protective Order.

10. Reviewing Representatives may not use anything contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through this proceeding to give any party or any competitor of any party a commercial advantage. In the event that a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in paragraph 6 (i) through (iii) above, the party must first seek agreement to do so from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, the designated individual shall be a Reviewing Representative pursuant to Paragraph 6 (iv) above with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party seeking to have a person designated a Reviewing Representative shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.

11. (a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate in the form provided in Appendix A, provided, however, that if an attorney or expert qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under his or her instruction, supervision or control need not do so. A copy of each executed Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel for the party asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

(b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with the Protective Order.

12. The parties shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by stamping the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” protected material. Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the parties, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information. The Commission and all parties, including the statutory advocates and any other agency or department of state government will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Act (65 P.S. § 67.708(b)(11)) until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary.

13. Any public reference to Proprietary Information by a party or its Reviewing Representatives shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

14. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument, and responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in paragraph 14 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties to this proceeding or pursuant to an order of the Commission.

15. The parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information. If a party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the party providing the information retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.

16. The parties shall retain the right to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground, and to refuse to produce Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection.

17. Within 30 days after a Commission final order is entered in the above-captioned proceeding, or in the event of appeals, within thirty days after appeals are finally decided, the receiving party, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the parties all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. In its request, a providing party may specify whether such materials should be destroyed or returned. In the event that the materials are destroyed instead of returned, the receiving party shall certify in writing to the providing party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed. In the event that the materials are returned instead of destroyed, the receiving party shall certify in writing to the providing party that no copies of materials containing the Proprietary Information have been retained.

Date: May 10, 2024

_____/s/
Darlene Heep
Administrative Law Judge

_____/s/
Marta Guhl
Administrative Law Judge

Appendix A

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3046931
	:	
	:	
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2024-3048362
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2024-3048467
Alan McCarthy	:	C-2024-3048475
Philadelphia Area Industrial Energy Users Group	:	C-2024-3048671
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
PECO Energy Company (Electric)	:	

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3046932
	:	
	:	
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2024-3048363
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2024-3048456
State Representative Christina Sappey	:	C-2024-3048631
Alan McCarthy	:	C-2024-3048497
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
PECO Energy Company (Gas)	:	

NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____
(the receiving party).

The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order deals with the treatment of Proprietary Information. The undersigned agrees to be bound by, and comply with, the terms and conditions of said Order, which are incorporated herein by reference.

SIGNATURE

PRINT NAME

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

DATE: _____

R-2024-3046931, R-2024-3046932 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. PECO ENERGY COMPANY - ELECTRIC

JACK GARFINKLE ESQUIRE
ANTHONY GAY ESQUIRE
JENNEDY JOHNSON ESQUIRE
CAROLINE S CHOI ESQUIRE
BRANDON J PIERCE ESQUIRE
ADESOLA K ADEGBESAN ESQUIRE
PECO ENERGY COMPANY
2301 MARKET STREET S23-1
PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
267.533.1999
jack.garfinkle@exeloncorp.com
Accepts eService

KENNETH M KULAK ESQUIRE
MARK A LAZAROFF ESQUIRE
CATHERINE G VASUDEVAN ESQUIRE
BROOKE E MCGLINN ESQUIRE
MORGAN LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
2222 MARKET STREET
PHILADELPHIA PA 19103
215.963.5384
215.963.4603
215.963.5952
215.963.5404
ken.kulak@morganlewis.com
mark.lazaroff@morganlewis.com
catherine.vasudevan@morganlewis.com
bmcglinn@morganlewis.com
(Accepts eService)

CARRIE B WRIGHT ESQUIRE
BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION AND
ENFORCEMENT
SECOND FLOOR WEST
400 NORTH STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17120
717.783.6156
717.787.4887
carwright@pa.gov
Accepts eService

PATRICK M CICERO ESQUIRE
BARRETT SHERIDAN ESQUIRE
ERIN L GANNON ESQUIRE
GINA L MILLER ESQUIRE
JACOB GUTHRIE ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET 5TH FLOOR
FORUM PLACE
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.5048
bsheridan@paoca.org
egannon@paoca.org
[gmiller@paoca.org](mailto:gmilller@paoca.org)
jguthrie@paoca.org
pcicero@paoca.org
Accepts eService

NICHOLAS J ENOCH ESQUIRE
LUBIN & ENOCH PC
349 NORTH FOURTH AVENUE
PHOENIX AZ 85003
602.234.0008
nick@lubinandenoch.com
Accepts eService
(Counsel for IBEW Local 614)

CHARLES T JOYCE ESQUIRE
SAMUEL SHOPP ESQUIRE*
SPEAR WILDERMAN PC
230 S BROAD STREET SUITE 1400
PHILADELPHIA PA 19102
215.732.0101
215.732.7790
Ctjoyce@spearwilderman.com
sshopp@spearwilderman.com
Accepts eService
**Served via email and first class mail
(Counsel for IBEW Local 614)*

NAZAARAH SABREE ESQUIRE
STEVEN GRAY ESQUIRE
SHARON E WEBB ESQUIRE
REBECCA LYTTLE ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
ADVOCATE
FORUM PLACE
555 WALNUT STREET 1ST FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.2525
717.783.2831
swebb@pa.gov
relyttle@pa.gov
ra-sba@pa.gov
Served via email

JONATHAN NASE ESQUIRE
DAVID P ZAMBITO ESQUIRE
COZEN O'CONNOR
17 NORTH SECOND STREET
SUITE 1410
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.773.4191
717.703.5892
jnase@cozen.com
dzambito@cozen.com
Accepts eService
(Counsel for UPENN)

CHARIS MINCAVAGE ESQUIRE
ADEOLU A BAKARE ESQUIRE
BRIGID LANDY KHURI ESQUIRE
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK
100 PINE STREET
PO BOX 1166
HARRISBURG PA 17108
717.237.5437
717.232.8000
cmincavage@mwn.com
abakare@mcneeslaw.com
bkhuri@mcneeslaw.com
Accepts eService
(Counsel for PAIEUG)

CHRISTINA SAPPEY
698 UNIONVILLE ROAD
KENNETT SQUARE PA 19348
484.200.8264
RepSappey@pahouse.net
Accepts eService

ALAN MCCARTHY
705 E BARNARD ST
WEST CHESTER PA 19382
484.467.2845
alanmccarthy25@hotmail.com
Accepts eService

CHARLOTTE EDELSTEIN ESQUIRE
JOLINE R PRICE ESQUIRE
VIKRAM A PATEL ESQUIRE
ROBERT W BALLENGER ESQUIRE
1410 W. ERIE AVE
PHILADELPHIA PA 19140
215.227.4732
cedelstein@clsphila.org
Accepts eService
(Representing TURN and CAUSE-PA)

BERNICE I CORMAN ESQUIRE
BICKY CORMAN LAW
1250 CONNECTICUT AVE
NW #700
WASHINGTON DC 20036
202.213.1672
bcorman@bickycormanlaw.com
Accepts eService
(Representing EVgo Service LLC)

BARRY A NAUM ESQUIRE
DERRICK P WILLIAMSON ESQUIRE
STEVEN W LEE ESQUIRE
SPILMAN THOMAS & BATTLE
1100 BENT CREEK BLVD
MECHANICBURG PA 17050
717.795.2742
717.795.2740
717.791.2012
bnaum@spilmanlaw.com
dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com
slee@spilmanlaw.com
Accepts eService
(Representing Walmart, Inc.)

LAURA ANTINUCCI ESQUIRE
PHILADELPHIA LAW DEPT
1515 ARCH ST
16TH FLOOR
PHILADELPHIA PA 19102
215.683.8452
laura.antinucci@phila.gov
Accepts eService

ALAN SELTZER ESQUIRE
JOHN F POLVILAITIS ESQUIRE
BUCHANAN INGERSOLL & ROONEY
409 N SECOND STREET, SUITE 500
HARRISBURG PA 17101-1357
717-237-4862 (Seltzer)
717-237-4825 (Povilaitis)
alan.seltzer@bipc.com
john.povilaitis@bipc.com
(Representing Constellation Energy
Generation LLC and Constellation
NewEnergy, Inc.)

WILLIAM LESSER ESQUIRE
COZEN O'CONNOR
3 WTC
175 GREENWICH STREET
55th FLOOR
NEW YORK NY 10007
212.509.9400
wlessen@cozen.com
(Representing Electrify America, LLC)

STEPHEN BRIGHT ESQUIRE
1950 OPPORTUNITY WAY, SUITE 1500
RESTON, VIRGINIA 20190
Steve.Bright@electrifyamerica.com
(Representing Electrify America LLC)

C BAIRD BROWN ESQUIRE

ECO(N)LAW LLC

230 S BROAD ST

17TH FLOOR

PHILADELPHIA PA 19102

215.586.6615

baird@eco-n-law.net

Accepts eService

(Representing Philadelphia Energy

Authority)

ROBERT A WEISHAAR JR ESQUIRE

MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC

1200 G STREET NW

SUITE 800

WASHINGTON DC 2000

202.898.5700

rweishaa@mwn.com

Accepts eService

(Representing Amtrak)

TODD STEWART ESQUIRE

HAWKE MCKEON AND SNISCAK LLP

100 N 10TH STREET

HARRISBURG PA 17101

717.236.1300

tsstewart@hmslegal.com

Accepts eService

(Representing SEPTA)