

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2024-3048828
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2024-3049086
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2024-3049499
Brian Dugas	:	C-2024-3049100
Jean Switch	:	C-2024-3049239
Paula Mercuri	:	C-2024-3049667
Juan Ramos	:	C-2024-3049558
Louis Kern	:	C-2024-3049789
Anthony Debellis	:	C-2024-3049790
David Beedlemann	:	C-2024-3049797
	:	
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
	:	
UGI Utilities, Inc. – Gas Division	:	
1307(f) Proceeding	:	

ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER

On May 1, 2024, the UGI Utilities, Inc. – Gas Division (“UGI”) made its 30-day pre-filing with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (“Commission”) containing data related to the recovery of purchased gas costs (“PGC”) pursuant to Section 1307(f) of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa.C.S. § 1307(f), and in accordance with the Commission’s regulations at 52 Pa. Code §§ 53.64 and 53.65. On May 31, 2024, UGI filed its definitive PGC filing, including supporting information required by the Commission’s regulations, UGI’s direct testimony and exhibits, and its Pro Forma Tariff Supplement reflecting actual and projected changes in natural gas costs.

On August 13, 2024, UGI filed a Motion for Protective Order. UGI indicated in its Petition that no active party objected to the Petition.

Under 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362(a)(7) and 5.365, Presiding Officers may issue a Protective Order to limit or prohibit disclosure of Proprietary Information where the potential

harm to a participant would be substantial and outweighs the public's interest in having access to the Proprietary Information. In applying this standard, relevant factors to be considered include: the extent to which disclosure would cause unfair economic or competitive damage; the extent to which the information may already be known by others; and the potential value of such information to the participant and the participant's competitors and trade partners. 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.365(a)(1) – (3).

After review of the Petition, the relevant provisions of the Commission's regulations, and upon considering that no active party has indicated that it opposed the Protective Order, UGI's Motion for Protective Order will be granted.

The following Order is adopted:

ORDER

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. The Motion is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 – 3 below.

2. The information subject to this Protective Order includes, but is not limited to, all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, furnished in this proceeding, which are believed by the producing party to be of (a) a proprietary or confidential nature, and which are so designated by being stamped "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter referred to as "CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION") or (b) an extremely sensitive nature and marked "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter referred to as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION") (collectively, "Proprietary Information").

3. A producing party may designate as "CONFIDENTIAL" those materials which customarily are treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to

the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury.

4. A producing party may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature among the parties or of such a private, personal nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall include, but not be limited to, (1) information about the identity and natural gas usage characteristics of specific customers that UGI Gas is not otherwise authorized to release; and (2) specific wholesale supplier bid information or related information that could give wholesale suppliers an unfair competitive advantage. A producing party shall endeavor to limit their designation of information as HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.

5. Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for a party, subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, counsel for a party may afford access to Proprietary Information subject to the conditions set forth in this Protective Order. When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be designated as such for the record.

6. CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who is a person that has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as Appendix A or Appendix B, and who is:

- (a) An attorney for a statutory advocate (as defined in 52 Pa. Code § 1.8) or a counselor who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a party;
- (b) Attorneys, paralegals, and other employees associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph (a);
- (c) An expert or an employee of an expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding; or
- (d) Employees or other representatives of a party appearing in this proceeding with significant responsibility for this docket.

With regard to the Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”), CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be made available to I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose the CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutor may afford access to CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION only to I&E’s experts, without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, who are full-time employees of the Commission and bound by all the provisions of this Protective Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutor’s execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

With regard to the Office of Consumer Advocate (“OCA”) and Office of Small Business Advocate (“OSBA”), counsel for the OCA and OSBA may afford access to CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to the Consumer Advocate, Deputy Consumer Advocate, and Small Business Advocate, respectively, without the need for execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate. The Consumer Advocate, Deputy Consumer Advocate, and Small Business Advocate are bound by all of the provisions of the Protective Agreement by virtue of the OCA counsel’s and OSBA counsel’s execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

7. HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION may be provided to a “Reviewing Representative” who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as **Appendix B** and who is:

- (a) An attorney for a statutory advocate (as defined in 52 Pa. Code § 1.8) or a counselor who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a party;
- (b) Attorneys, paralegals, and other employees associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in Paragraph (a);
- (c) An outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a party for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding; or
- (d) A person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION.

With regard to I&E, HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION shall be made available to the I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. The I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose the HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutor may afford access to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, only to I&E's experts who are full-time employees of the Commission and who are bound by all the provisions of this Protective Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutor's execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

With regard to the OCA and OSBA, counsel for the OCA and OSBA may afford access to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION to the Consumer Advocate, Deputy Consumer Advocate, and Small Business Advocate, respectively, without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate. The Consumer Advocate, Deputy Consumer Advocate, and Small Business Advocate are bound by all of the provisions of the Protective Agreement by virtue of the OCA counsel's and OSBA counsel's execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e), any party may, by subsequent objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular parties.

8. For purposes of this Protective Order, a Reviewing Representative may not be a "Restricted Person."

(a) A "Restricted Person" shall mean: (i) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services; (ii) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the parties (including any association of competitors of the parties) or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services; (iii) an officer, director, stockholder,

owner or employee of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; and (iv) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert's interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than \$10,000 or constituting more than a 1% interest in a business establishes a significant motive for violation.

(b) If an expert for a party, another member of the expert's firm or the expert's firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person, said expert must: (i) identify for the parties each Restricted Person and each expert or consultant; (ii) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert's participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (iii) if segregation of such personnel is impractical, the expert shall give to the producing party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize the interests of the parties or their customers. The parties retain the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the parties' or their customers' interests will not be jeopardized. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission.

(c) The OSBA's consultant, Mr. Mark Ewen, will not be considered a Restricted Person, and Paragraphs 7(a) and 7(b) will not apply to Mr. Ewen, provided that Mr. Ewen does not share or discuss the Proprietary Information with any person except authorized OSBA representatives.

9. In the event that a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraphs 6(a) through 6(d) or 7(a) through 7(c) above, or a person that is a Restricted Person under Paragraph 8, the party shall seek agreement from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.

10. A qualified "Reviewing Representative" for HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION may review and discuss HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION with

their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a “Restricted Person,” but may not share with or permit the client or entity to review the HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION. Such discussions must be general in nature and not disclose specific HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION, provided, however, that counsel for I&E, the OCA, and OSBA may share proprietary information with the I&E Director, Consumer Advocate, Deputy Consumer Advocate, Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure Certificate from these individuals, so long as these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of the Protective Order.

11. Information deemed Proprietary Information shall not be used except as necessary for the conduct of this proceeding, nor shall it be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person’s responsibilities in this proceeding. Reviewing Representatives may not use information contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through this proceeding to give any party or any competitor of any party a commercial advantage.

12. Reviewing Representatives shall execute a Non-Disclosure Certificate in order to obtain access to Proprietary Information, and will be subject to the following conditions:

(a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate, provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney’s instruction, supervision or control need not do so, nor do Commission employees assisting I&E as noted above in Paragraphs 6 and 7. A copy of each Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel for the party asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

(b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with the Protective Order.

13. None of the parties waive their right to pursue any other legal or equitable remedies that may be available in the event of actual or anticipated disclosure of Proprietary Information.

14. The producing party shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by marking the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the producing party, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents that constitute or contain Proprietary Information. The Proprietary Information shall be served upon the parties hereto only and the materials shall be conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” For filing purposes, Proprietary Information shall be filed separately from the nonproprietary materials and conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.”

15. The parties will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in Section 335(d) of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa.C.S. § 335(d), and the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Act, 65 P.S. §§ 67.101 *et seq.*, until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary. In the event that any person or entity seeks to compel the disclosure of Proprietary Information, the non-producing party shall promptly notify the producing party in order to provide the producing party an opportunity to oppose or limit such disclosure.

16. Any public reference to Proprietary Information by a party or its Reviewing Representatives shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

17. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument, and

responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 16 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties to this proceeding or pursuant to an order of the Commission.

18. The parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information. If a party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the party providing the information retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.

19. The parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information; to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground; and to refuse to produce Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection.

20. Within thirty (30) days after a Commission final order is entered in the above-captioned proceeding, or in the event of appeals, within thirty (30) days after appeals are finally decided, the parties, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the parties all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. In the event that a party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information to the parties, the party shall certify in writing to the producing party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed.

Dated: August 14, 2024

_____/s/
Dennis J. Buckley
Administrative Law Judge

_____/s/
Alphonso Arnold III
Administrative Law Judge

APPENDIX A
BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	
	:	
v.	:	Docket Nos. R-2024-3048828, <i>et al.</i>
	:	
UGI Utilities, Inc. – Gas Division	:	
1307(f) Proceeding	:	

NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE FOR
CONFIDENTIAL MATERIALS

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____ (the retaining party). The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order and the required treatment of “CONFIDENTIAL” materials as defined in the Protective Order. The undersigned agrees to be bound by and comply with the terms and conditions of said Protective Order.

SIGNATURE

NAME (Printed)

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

APPENDIX B
BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	
	:	
v.	:	Docket Nos. R-2024-3048828, <i>et al.</i>
	:	
UGI Utilities, Inc. – Gas Division	:	
1307(f) Proceeding	:	

NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE FOR
HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL MATERIALS

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____ (the retaining party). The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order and the required treatment of “CONFIDENTIAL” and “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” material as defined in the Protective Order. The undersigned agrees to be bound by and comply with the terms and conditions of said Protective Order. The undersigned understands and agrees that, pursuant to Paragraph 7, a party providing HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL material may seek further protection, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure as to particular individuals, even where Appendix B has been executed.

SIGNATURE

NAME (Printed)

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

R-2024-3048828 et al. - PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. UGI UTILITIES INC - GAS DIVISION

Revised: June 27, 2024

DEVIN T RYAN ESQUIRE
POST & SCHELL PC
ONE OXFORD CENTRE
301 GRANT STREET
SUITE 3010
PITTSBURGH PA 15219
717.612.6052
dryan@postschell.com
Accepts eService
*(Counsel for UGI Utilities, Inc. -
Gas Division)*

STEVEN C GRAY ESQUIRE
NAZAARAH SABREE
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
ADVOCATE
FORUM PLACE
555 WALNUT STREET 1ST FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.2525
sgray@pa.gov
ra-sba@pa.gov
Served via email

EMILY A FARREN ESQUIRE
MELANIE J EL ATIEH ESQUIRE
PATRICK M CICERO ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET
5TH FLOOR FORUM PLACE
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.5048
efarren@paoca.org
melatieh@paoca.org
pcicero@paoca.org
Accepts eService
(#C-2024-3049086)

SCOTT B GRANGER ESQUIRE
PA PUC BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION
& ENFORCEMENT
SECOND FLOOR WEST
400 NORTH STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17120
717.425.7593
sgranger@pa.gov
Accepts eService

BRIAN DUGAS
10 MONUMENT AVE APT 2
WYOMING PA 18644
570.406.0515
briandugas54@gmail.com
Accepts eService
(#C-2024-3049100)

JEAN SUITCH
30 ROCKLEDGE DRIVE
MOUNTAIN TOP PA 18707
570.498.9289
jasuitch@aol.com
Served via email
(#C-2024-3049239)

JUAN FRANCISCO RAMOS
64 SAGEBROOK DRIVE
READING PA 19606
209.677.9110
jramos1193@gmail.com
Accepts eService
(#C-2024-3049558)

PAULA MERCURI
3 VILLA DRIVE
MOOSIC PA 18507
570.972.5770
qwilliams22@gmail.com
Accepts eService
(#C-2024-3049667)

LOUIS KERN
195 BROAD STREET
PITTSTON PA 18640
570.654.6931
203.435.3807
lak195315@gmail.com
Served via email
(#C-2024-3049789)

ANTHONY DEBELLIS
106 UPPER KNAPP ROAD
CLARKS SUMMIT PA 18411
203.200.9710
tonydb5724@gmail.com
Served via email
(#C-2024-3049790)