



PHILADELPHIA GAS WORKS

800 West Montgomery Avenue • Philadelphia, PA 19122

Anita J. Murray, Esquire
Senior Attorney
Legal Department
Direct Dial: 215-684-6659
Fax: 215-684-6798
Email: anita.murray@pgworks.com

December 20, 2024

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Rosemary Chiavetta, Secretary
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
P.O. Box 3265
Harrisburg, PA 17105-3265

VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL ONLY

Administrative Law Judge Marta Guhl
Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission
801 Market Street, Suite 4063
Philadelphia, PA 19107

Re: Kimberly Fisher v. Philadelphia Gas Works, Docket No. F-2024-3049915

Dear Secretary Chiavetta and Judge Guhl:

Enclosed for electronic filing please find Philadelphia Gas Works' Objections to Complainant's Late-Filed Exhibits in the above referenced matter. Copies will be served in accordance with the attached Certificate of Service.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me.

Very truly yours,

/s/**Anita J. Murray**
Anita J. Murray

/awm
encl.

cc (w/encl.): Kimberly Fisher via Email: grantkim92@gmail.com and heal017@live.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have on this day served a true and correct copy of Philadelphia Gas Works' Objections to Complainant's Late-Filed Exhibits upon the person(s) listed below in the manner indicated below in accordance with the requirements of 52 Pa. Code § 1.54 (relating to service by a party).

VIA EMAIL ONLY

Kimberly Fisher
grantkim92@gmail.com
heal017@live.com

/s/ Anita J. Murray
Anita J. Murray, Esquire

Date: Dec. 20, 2024

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Kimberly Fisher,	:	
Complainant,	:	
v.	:	Docket No. F-2024-3049915
	:	
Philadelphia Gas Works,	:	
Respondent.	:	

**OBJECTIONS BY THE PHILADELPHIA GAS WORKS
TO COMPLAINANT’S LATE-FILED EXHIBITS**

Philadelphia Gas Works (“PGW” or “Respondent”), by and through its undersigned attorney, and pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 5.401, hereby objects to the Late-Filed Exhibits of Complainant, Kimberly Fisher (“Complainant”). PGW objects as follows:

1. Complainant filed a Formal Complaint dated June 22, 2024, with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission and alleged that when she requested gas service in her name at real property located at 1234 N. 57th Street, Philadelphia, PA (“Service Address”), PGW required her to assume the prior occupant’s charges as she was linked to the Service Address. Complainant further averred that she should not be responsible for any gas charges incurred prior to March 1, 2024, because 1. she lived at other addresses prior to March 1, 2024; and 2. she moved into the Service Address on March 1, 2024.

2. PGW filed an Answer on July 23, 2024, and denied her allegations, as Experian linked her to the Service Address since October 2007.

3. On December 10, 2024, a hearing was held before ALJ Marta Guhl, with Complainant, Complainant’s witness, a PGW Customer Review Officer, and undersigned counsel in attendance.

4. At the hearing, both parties and their witnesses presented testimony and PGW Exhibits 1-5 were admitted into evidence.

5. At the hearing, ALJ Guhl also permitted Complainant to provide additional documentary evidence supporting her position as late-filed exhibits, with a submission deadline of December 17, 2024.

6. The issue in this case is whether Complainant should be responsible for gas charges

in the total amount of \$2,229.06 as of December 3, 2024, which were accrued from July 13, 2023 to the present (“Time Period”).

7. On December 16, 2024, over two (2) emails, Complainant offered several additional documents as her late-filed exhibits. Complainant’s documents consist of:

- a. A 1-page documents with partial copies of Complainant’s bank statements reflecting her address in Swedesboro, NJ in September 2023 and December 2023 (“Bank Statements”).
- b. A 1-page document from Clarksville Gas & Water dated December 10, 2024, with “Proof of Service” as a heading. The document states that Complainant had service at Raleigh Ct., Clarksville, TN from February 8, 2019 to March 30, 2022 (“Proof of Utility Service”).
- c. A 1-page document containing a photo of an unidentified payment coupon of an unknown date, showing Complainant’s address in Swedesboro, NJ (“Photo”).
- d. Complainant’s pay stub from Macy’s dated January 18, 2019, with a Raleigh Ct. address (“Pay Stub”).
- e. A 1-page document with a partial copy of Complainant’s Social Security Benefit Verification Letter dated February 16, 2024, showing her Swedesboro, NJ address (“Benefit Letter”).
- f. A 1-page document with a partial copy of Complainant’s Social Security Supplemental Security Income Award Letter dated February 14, 2018, showing her Ephrata, PA address (“Award Letter”).
- g. A 1-page document with a partial copy of Complainant’s “Change to Contact Information” for her bank dated February 9, 2018, showing her Ephrata, PA address (“Bank Change of Address”).
- h. A 1-page document with a partial copy of Complainant’s Notice of Medicaid Eligibility, undated, showing her Ephrata, PA address (“Medicaid Notice”).

8. PGW does **not** object to the admission of the following documents as Late-Filed Exhibits because they are relevant and within the Time Period: Bank Statements; Benefit Letter.

9. PGW now files Objections to Complainant’s remaining documents: Proof of Utility

Service; Photo; Pay Stub; Award Letter; Bank Change of Address; and Medicaid Notice.

10. PGW specifically objects to the Photo and Medicaid Notice as lacking relevancy because these submissions are undated. Therefore, it cannot be determined if they address events or activity that took place during the relevant Time Period.

11. PGW objects to the Proof of Utility Service; Photo; Pay Stub; Award Letter; Bank Change of Address; and Medicaid Notice as lacking relevancy because the dates and/or addresses shown thereon are for periods of time which are outside of the relevant Time Period, i.e. 2018-2022 vs. July 13, 2023 to the present. PGW is only seeking to hold Complainant responsible for gas charges accrued during the Time Period of July 13, 2023 to the present. Admission of these documents into the record will only cause confusion. Therefore, PGW objects to the admission of these documents into evidence.

12. WHEREFORE, PGW respectfully requests that Complainant's Proof of Utility Service; Photo; Pay Stub; Award Letter; Bank Change of Address; and Medicaid Notice not be admitted into the record as Late-Filed Exhibits.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Anita J. Murray

Anita J. Murray, Esquire
Attorney I.D. 84703
Philadelphia Gas Works
800 W. Montgomery Avenue
Philadelphia, PA 19122
Telephone: (215) 684-6659
anita.murray@pgworks.com

Date: Dec. 20, 2024

Counsel for PGW