

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission, <i>et al</i>	:	
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
Wellsboro Electric Company	:	R-2025-3054392
	:	
and	:	
	:	
Valley Energy, Inc.	:	R-2025-3054393
	:	
and	:	
	:	
Citizen’s Electric Company of Lewisburg	:	R-2025-3054394

PROTECTIVE ORDER

Wellsboro Electric Company, Valley Energy, Inc., and Citizens’ Electric Company of Lewisburg, PA, (collectively, Companies) filed a motion for protective order on June 30, 2025. The Companies represent that no active party opposes the motion.

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. The Petition is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraph 2 below, which are or will be filed with the Commission, produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during these proceedings. All persons now and hereafter granted access to the materials and information identified in Paragraph 2 of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Order.

2. The materials subject to this Order are all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials which a party or an affiliate of a party furnishes in this proceeding pursuant to Commission rules and regulations, discovery procedures, testimony or oral examination, or provided as a courtesy to a party to this proceeding, which are claimed to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and which are designated "PROPRIETARY" "CONFIDENTIAL" or "CONFIDENTIAL AND PROPRIETARY" (hereinafter collectively referred to as "Proprietary Information").

3. In addition, the parties may designate extremely sensitive Proprietary Information as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter referred to as "Highly Confidential Information") and thus secure the additional protections set forth in this Order pertaining to such material. Such Highly Confidential Information shall include, but not be limited to, financial, strategic or business planning or marketing information including information regarding Citizens' and Wellsboro's bidding and supply management strategies in the PJM markets that have not been previously disclosed to the public.

4. Proprietary Information and Highly Confidential Information produced in this proceeding shall be made available to the Commission and its Staff, the Office of Consumer Advocate ("OCA"), the Office of Small Business Advocate ("OSBA"), the Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement ("I&E"), Kelly Road Solar, LCC, Lancaster Avenue Solar, LLC, and Twilight Renewables, LLC (collectively "Solar Projects"), and any other party solely for use in this proceeding. For purposes of filing, to the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission's report folders, such information shall be handled in accordance with routine Commission procedures in as much as the report folders are not subject to public disclosure. To the extent that Proprietary Information or Highly Confidential Information is placed in the Commission's testimony or document folders, such information shall be separately bound, conspicuously marked, and accompanied by a copy of this Order. Public inspection of Proprietary Information and Highly Confidential Information shall be permitted only in accordance with this Protective Order.

5. Proprietary Information and Highly Confidential Information shall be made available to counsel of record and statutory advocates in this proceeding pursuant to the following procedures:

a. Proprietary Information. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, a party's counsel may afford access to Proprietary Information made available by another party ("the producing party") to the party's expert(s), subject to the following restrictions.

i. Such experts may not hold any of the following positions with any competitor of the producing party: (a) an officer, board member, stockholder, partner, owner, or an employee who is primarily involved in the pricing, development, and/or marketing of products or services that are offered or purchased in competition with those of the producing party; or (b) an officer, board member, stockholder, partner, owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the producing party; provided, however, that any expert shall not be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless his/her interest in the business constitutes a significant potential for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information.

ii. If a party's independent expert, another member of the independent expert's firm or the independent expert's firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to a competitor or any affiliate of a competitor of the producing party, said independent expert must: (1) advise the producing party of the competitor's or affiliate's name(s); (2) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert's participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a competitor or any affiliate of a competitor of the producing party; and (3) if segregation of such personnel is impractical, the independent expert shall give to the producing party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize the interests of the producing party. The producing party retains the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that its interests will not be jeopardized.

iii. With regard to I&E, Proprietary Information shall be made available to I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. The I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross

examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutors may afford access to Proprietary Information only to I&E's experts, without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, who are full-time employees of the Commission and bound by all the provisions of this Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutors' execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

iv. Any information provided under this provision may be used only for and to the extent that it is necessary for participation in this proceeding; any person obtaining information disclosed through this provision may not use that information to gain any commercial advantage and any person obtaining information may not forward it to any person to gain commercial advantage.

b. Highly Confidential Information. Where information is asserted to be Highly Confidential Information, it will be made available for inspection and review as provided for in this protective order and not copying except as specified herein. The producing party shall permit counsel for the OCA and OSBA (individually "public advocate" and collectively the "public advocates") or counsel for the Solar Projects to take custody of a copy of such Highly Confidential Information, provided that it shall not be copied, except for the public advocate or Solar Projects counsel, and the public advocates' or Solar Projects' in-house staff or independent consultants, in accordance with the protocols set forth below and shall be returned as provided for in this protective order. Such Highly Confidential Information may be provided by a public advocate or Solar Projects to its eligible independent consultants (as defined in 52 Pa. Code 5.423(d)) or to eligible in-house staff who are assisting counsel with the preparation or presentation of the public advocate's or Solar Projects' case in these proceedings, provided that such consultants or in-house staff execute and return the acknowledgement attached to this protective order to the producing party. Counsel for other parties and additional representatives may view Highly Confidential information at the offices of the Producing Party or another mutually-convenient location; provided, however, that non-lawyer representatives of parties may view Highly Confidential information only if the representative executes the acknowledgment attached to this protective order and if the Producing Party receives sufficient assurances that the representative is not

involved in activities or roles within the organization where knowledge of the particular information to be viewed could place the Producing Party at a competitive disadvantage.

i. Notwithstanding the above restrictions, with regard to I&E, Highly Confidential Information shall be made available to the I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. The I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose Highly Confidential Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutors may afford access to Highly Confidential Information, only to I&E's experts, without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, who are full-time employees of the Commission and bound by all the provisions of this Protective Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutors' execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

c. No other person may have access to the Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information except as authorized by the order of the Commission or of the presiding Administrative Law Judge. No person who may be entitled to receive, or who is afforded access to any Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information shall use or disclose such information for the purposes of business or competition, or any purpose other than the preparation for and conduct of this proceeding or any administrative or judicial review thereof.

6. Prior to making Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information available to any person as provided in paragraph 5 of this Protective Order, counsel shall deliver a copy of this Order to such person and shall receive a written acknowledgment from that person in the form attached to this Order and designated as Appendix A. Counsel shall promptly deliver to the producing party a copy of the executed acknowledgment form.

7. A producing party shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information by affixing an appropriate proprietary stamp or type written designation on such data or documents. Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information,

the producing party shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information.

8. Any public reference to Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information by counsel or persons afforded access thereto shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information to fully understand the reference and not more. Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

9. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, argument and responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Ordering paragraph 8 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information is released from the restrictions of this Order, either through the agreement of the parties or pursuant to order of the Administrative Law Judge, the Commission or appellate court. Unresolved challenges arising under paragraph 10 shall be decided on petition by the presiding officer or the Commission as provided by 52 Pa. Code § 5.423(a). All such challenges will be resolved in conformity with existing rules, regulations, orders, statutes, precedents, etc., to the extent that such guidance is available.

10. The parties affected by the terms of this Order shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information; to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information; to refuse or object to the production of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information on any proper ground, including but not limited to irrelevance, immateriality or undue burden; to seek an order permitting disclosure of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information beyond that allowed in this Order; and to seek additional measures of protection of Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information beyond those provided in this Order. If a challenge is made to the designation of a document or information as Proprietary or Highly Confidential, the party

claiming that the information is Proprietary or Highly Confidential retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is necessary and appropriate.

11. Upon completion of this proceeding, including any administrative or judicial review, all copies of all documents and other materials, including notes, which contain any Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information shall be immediately returned upon request to the party furnishing such Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information. In the alternative, parties may provide an affidavit of counsel affirming that the materials containing or reflecting Proprietary or Highly Confidential Information have been destroyed.

Appendix A

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission :
 :
 v. : R-2025-3054394
 :
 Citizens' Electric Company of Lewisburg, PA :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission :
 :
 v. : R-2025-3054392
 :
 Wellsboro Electric Company :

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission :
 :
 v. : R-2025-3054393
 :
 Valley Energy, Inc. :

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____ (the retaining party) and is not, or has no knowledge or basis for believing that he/she is (1) an officer, board member, stockholder, partner or owner of any competitor of _____ (the "Producing Party") or, in the event that the information involves a specific customer, such customer; or an employee of any competitor of the Producing Party or such customer who is primarily involved in the pricing, development, and/or marketing of products or services that are offered or purchased in competition with those of the Producing Party or such customer; or (2) an officer, board member, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a Competitor of the Producing Party or such customer.

The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order deals with the treatment of Proprietary and Highly Confidential Information. The undersigned agrees to be bound by, and comply with, the terms and conditions of said Order. In the case of an independent expert, the undersigned represents that he/she has complied with the provisions of paragraph 5 of the Order prior to submitting this Affidavit.

SIGNATURE

PRINT NAME

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

DATE: _____

R-2025-3054392 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. WELLSBORO ELECTRIC COMPANY

R-2025-3054393 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. VALLEY ENERGY INC

R-2025-3054394 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. CITIZENS ELECTRIC COMPANY OF LEWISBURG PA

Revised 6/3/2025

ADEOLU A BAKARE ESQUIRE
MATTHEW L GARBER ESQUIRE
REBECCA KIMMEL ESQUIRE
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
100 PINE STREET
PO BOX 1166
HARRISBURG PA 17108-1166
717-232-8000

abakare@mcneeslaw.com
mgarber@mcneeslaw.com
rkimmel@mcneeslaw.com

Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**
*(Counsel for Wellsboro Electric Company,
Valley Energy Inc, Citizens Electric)*

PAMELA C POLACEK ESQUIRE
C ANDT ENTERPRISES, INC
P.O. BOX 129
VENETIA, PA 15367
570.724.9469

ppolacek@ctenterprises.org

Served via email – **July 1, 2025**

STEVEN C GRAY ESQUIRE
REBECCA LYTTLE ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET 1ST FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101

717.783.2525

717.783.2831

sgray@pa.gov
relyttle@pa.gov

C-2025-3055193, C-2025-3055189,
C-2025-3055186.

Served via email – **July 1, 2025**

MELANIE EL ATIEH ESQUIRE
RYAN MORDEN ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17101

717.783.5048

melatieh@paoca.org
rmorden@paoca.org

C-2025-3055105, C-2025-3055106,
C-2025-3055103

Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**

MICHAEL PODSKOCH JR ESQUIRE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY
COMMISSION
BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION AND
ENFORCEMENT
HARRISBURG PA 17120
717.783.6151
mpodskoch@pa.gov
R-2025-3054392, R-2025-3054394
Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**

ADAM J WILLIAMS ESQUIRE.
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY
COMMISSION
BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION AND
ENFORCEMENT
COMMONWEALTH KEYSTONE
BUILDING
400 NORTH STREET
HARRISBURG, PA 17120
adawilliam@pa.gov
R-2025-3054393
Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**

TODD S STEWART ESQUIRE
HMS LEGAL LLP
501 CORPORATE CIRCLE SUITE302
HARRISBURG PA 17110
717.236.1300
717.236.4841
tsstewart@hmslegal.com
R-2025-3054394
Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**
*(Counsel for Kelly Road Solar, LLC,
Lancaster Avenue Solar, LLC and Twilight
Renewables, LLC)*

VICTORIA A GEDDIS ESQUIRE
170 N. RADNOR-CHESTER RD
SUITE 350
RADNOR PA 19087
223.225.4640
610. 505.5118 vgeddis@mcneeslaw.com
Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**
*(Counsel for Wellsboro Electric Company,
Valley Energy Inc, Citizens Electric)*

MICHAEL A GRUIN ESQUIRE
NICHOLAS STOBBE ESQUIRE
STEVENS & LEE
17 N 2ND ST 16TH FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17552
717.724.3445
717.255.7365
R-2025-3054392, R-2025-3054394
nicholas.stobbe@stevenslee.com
michael.gruin@stevenslee.com
Served via eService – **July 1, 2025**

ERIC J WALLACE ESQUIRE.
GREENEHURLOCKER PLC
4908 MONUMENT AVENUE
SUITE 200
RICHMOND VIRGINIA 23230
804. 672.4544
R-2025-3054392, R-2025-3054394
ewallace@greenehurlocker.com
Served via email – **July 1, 2025**

ZACHARY AND ASHLEY WATTLES
188 BUTLER ROAD
WELLSBORO PA 16901
607.857.5801
a.wattles@outlook.com
C-2025-3054985(Wellsboro)
Served via eService and email – **July 1,
2025**