

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2025-3053442
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2025-3055746
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2025-3055824
Amy Nichols	:	C-2025-3056183
Kris Robertson	:	C-2025-3056377
Michael & Debra D'Angelo	:	C-2025-3056282
Katelyn Mooneyhan	:	C-2025-3056403
Gary Freedman	:	C-2025-3056782
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
The York Water Company - Water	:	

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2025-3053573
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2025-3055747
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2025-3055827
Cheryl Hoffman	:	C-2025-3055800
Brad S. Bock	:	C-2025-3056196
Russell Hudson	:	C-2025-3056217
Sarah Flemming	:	C-2025-3056115
Daniel O'Connor	:	C-2025-3056049
Eric Conrad	:	C-2025-3056050
Edward Madalis	:	C-2025-3056157
Sheri Stein	:	C-2025-3056225
Elizabeth Tetter	:	C-2025-3056284
Michael & Debra D'Angelo	:	C-2025-3056281
George McClellan Bentzel	:	C-2025-3056272
	:	
v.	:	
	:	
The York Water Company - Wastewater	:	

PROTECTIVE ORDER

On May 30, 2025, the York Water Company and the York Water Company – Wastewater Division (collectively, York Water or the Company) filed Supplement No. 165 to Tariff Water-Pa. P.U.C. No. 14 and Supplement No. 26 to Tariff Wastewater-Pa. P.U.C. No. 1, respectively, to become effective August 1, 2025. The Company proposes to increase water service rates to produce additional

annual revenues of approximately \$20.3 million. The Company additionally proposes to increase wastewater rates to produce additional annual revenues of approximately \$3.8 million.

York Water serves approximately 73,100 water customers and 6,700 wastewater customers. The Company provides water service and wastewater service in parts of York, Adams, Franklin, and Lancaster Counties, Pennsylvania.

On July 10, 2025, the Commission issued Orders that initiated an investigation into the lawfulness, justness, and reasonableness of the proposed rate increases in the Company's water and wastewater filings in addition to the Company's existing rates, rules, and regulations, assigned this matter to the Office of Administrative Law Judge for further proceedings as appropriate, and suspended the effective date of the tariff until March 1, 2026.

On July 14, 2025, a Telephonic Prehearing Conference Notice was issued, scheduling a prehearing conference for July 22, 2025, at 10:00 AM. A Prehearing Conference Order was also issued, directing parties to file Prehearing Memoranda by July 18, 2025.

On July 22, 2025, the Presiding Officers convened the telephonic prehearing conference as scheduled, at which the following parties participated: on behalf of York Water, Devin T. Ryan, Esquire and Alice Wade, Esquire; on behalf of the OCA, Jacob Guthrie, Esquire and Katherine Kennedy, Esquire; on behalf of tI&E, Carrie Wright, Esquire; on behalf of the OSBA, Rebecca Lyttle, Esquire.

On July 23, 2025, we issued Prehearing Order #1 for the proceedings at Docket Nos. R-2025- 3053442 and R-2025-3053573 establishing the litigation schedule.

On July 28, 2025, the Commission issued an in-person evidentiary hearings notice for hearings to be held on October 14, 2025 and October 15, 2025.

On July 31, 2025, the Commission issued notice of in-person and telephonic public input hearings to be held on August 26, 2025 and August 27, 2025.

On August 26, 2025, we held two in-person public input hearings at the York County Office Building. Several members of the public attended and testified at both hearings.

On August 27, 2025, we held two telephonic public input hearings. Several members of the public attended and testified at both hearings.

On October 10, 2025, York Water filed a Motion for Protective Order.

On October 14, 2025, the evidentiary hearing convened as scheduled. During the hearing, the following occurred: York Water, I&E, OCA, and OSBA moved for the admission of their pre-served testimony and exhibits into the record; all parties waived cross-examination of all witnesses; and we discussed various housekeeping matters. Included in those housekeeping matters, we provided instructions to the parties regarding any potential settlement, and we reminded the parties that briefs must be filed according to the schedule established in Prehearing Order #1. We further advised the parties of our intent to issue a subsequent briefing and settlement order. Additionally, we further advised the parties of our concerns regarding the Motion for Protective Order as-filed on October 10, 2025.

As we accomplished all necessary tasks during the first day of scheduled hearings, we cancelled the evidentiary hearing scheduled for October 15, 2025.

On October 23, 2025, York Water filed an Amended Motion for Protective Order. Upon consideration of the Amended Motion for Protective Order, the following Order will be entered.

ORDER

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. The Amended Motion is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 3 and 4 below.

2. That the materials subject to this Protective Order are all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, furnished in this proceeding, which are believed by the producing party to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and which are so designated by being stamped “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” Such materials will be referred to below as “Proprietary Information.”

3. That the parties may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” information and materials which customarily are treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that party or others to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury.

4. That the parties may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” information and materials that are of such a commercially sensitive or of such a private, personal nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. For example, but without limitation, “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” information and materials may include Proprietary Information that constitutes or describes: (1) customer names, addresses, annual volumes of water usage, or other customer-identifying information; or (2) highly sensitive security information about the Company’s operations and facilities. The parties shall endeavor to limit their designation of information as HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL. The parties agree that materials containing specific, individual customer information shall be identified as HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL and that access to these materials may be further restricted by the producing party.

5. That Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for the non-producing party, subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement discussions in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, counsel for a non-producing party may afford access to Proprietary Information subject to the conditions set forth herein.

6. Proprietary Information produced in this proceeding shall be made available to the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (“Commission”) and its Staff. For purposes of filing, to the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s report folders, such information shall be handled in accordance with routine Commission procedures inasmuch as the report folders are not subject to public disclosure. To the extent that Proprietary Information is placed in the Commission’s testimony or document folders, such information shall be separately bound, conspicuously marked, and accompanied by a copy of this Protective Order. Public inspection of Protected Information shall be permitted only in accordance with this Protective Order.

7. That “CONFIDENTIAL” information and materials may be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who is a person who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate in the form attached as **Appendix A** hereto and who is: (i) an attorney who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a party or a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8, if not an attorney; (ii) an attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this proceeding with an attorney described in subparagraph 7(i); (iii) an expert or an employee of an expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding; or (iv) an employee or other representative of a party with significant responsibility in this proceeding.

8. That “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” information and materials may be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate in the form attached as **Appendix B** and who is: (i) an attorney who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a party or a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8, if not an attorney; (ii) an attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph 8(i); (iii) an outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a party for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding; or (iv) a person designated as a Reviewing

Representative for purposes of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL information and materials. Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e), any party may, by subsequent objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular parties.

9. For purposes of this Protective Order, a Reviewing Representative may not be a "Restricted Person."

(a) A "Restricted Person" shall mean: (i) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services; (ii) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the parties (including any association of competitors of the parties) or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services; (iii) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; and (iv) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert's interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than \$10,000 or constituting more than a 1% interest in a business establishes a significant motive for violation.

(b) If an expert for a party, another member of the expert's firm or the expert's firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person, said expert must: (i) identify for the parties each Restricted Person and each expert or consultant; (ii) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert's participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (iii) if segregation of such personnel is impractical the expert shall give to the producing party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize

the interests of the parties or their customers. The parties retain the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the parties' or their customers' interests will not be jeopardized. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission.

10. That a Reviewing Representative of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL information and materials shall not be a "Restricted Person" as defined in Paragraph 9 or include any employee or agent of a customer of a party subject to this Protective Order, a competitor of a party subject to this Protective Order, or a competitor of a customer of a party subject to this Protective Order whose duties include: (i) the marketing, sale or purchase of water supply services or wastewater services; (ii) management regarding or supervision of any employee whose duties include the marketing, sale or purchase of water supply services or wastewater services for a competitor of a party subject to this Protective Order or a customer of the party; (iii) consulting services for a competitor of a party subject to this Protective Order or a customer of the party regarding the marketing, sale or purchase of water supply services or wastewater services; or (iv) responsibility regarding other strategic business activities in which use of market sensitive information could be reasonably expected to cause competitive harm to a party or to a customer of a party subject to this Protective Order.

11. In the event that a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraphs 7(i) through 7(iv) or 8(i) through 8(iv) above, or a person that is a Restricted Person under Paragraph 9, the party shall seek agreement from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judges for resolution.

12. A qualified "Reviewing Representative" for "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" information and materials may review and discuss "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" information and materials with their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a "Restricted Person", but may not share with or permit the client or entity to review the "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" information and materials. Such discussions must be general in nature and not disclose specific "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" information or materials; provided, however, that counsel for the Commission's Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement ("I&E"), the Office of Consumer Advocate, and Office of Small Business Advocate may share

proprietary information with the I&E Director, Consumer Advocate and Deputy Consumer Advocate, and Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure Certificate from these individuals, provided however, that these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of the Protective Order.

13. That Proprietary Information shall be treated by non-producing parties subject to this Protective Order and by all Reviewing Representatives in accordance with the Non-Disclosure Certificates attached as **Appendix A** and **Appendix B** and executed pursuant to Paragraphs 7 through 8. Information deemed Proprietary Information shall not be used except as necessary for the conduct of this proceeding, nor shall it be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person's responsibilities in this proceeding.

14. That Reviewing Representatives may not use information contained in any Proprietary Information obtained through this proceeding to give any commercial advantage. If a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraphs 7 through 8 above, the party shall seek agreement from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.

15. Reviewing Representatives shall execute a Non-Disclosure Certificate to obtain access to Proprietary Information and will be subject to the following conditions:

- (a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney's instruction, supervision or control need not do so, nor do Commission employees assisting the attorney as noted above in Paragraphs 6 through 8. A copy of each Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel

for the party asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

(b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with the Protective Order.

16. That none of the parties waive their right to pursue any other legal or equitable remedies that may be available in the event of actual or anticipated disclosure of Proprietary Information.

17. That the producing party shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by stamping the documents “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the parties, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents which constitute or contain Proprietary Information. The Proprietary Information shall be served in an envelope separate from the nonproprietary materials, and the envelope shall be conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.” For filing purposes, Proprietary Information shall be filed separately from the nonproprietary materials and conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL.”

18. That the parties will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in Section 335(d) of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa.C.S. § 335(d), and the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Law, 65 P.S. §§ 67.101 *et seq.*, until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary. If any person or entity seeks to compel the disclosure of Proprietary Information, the non-producing party shall promptly notify the producing party in order to provide the producing party an opportunity to oppose or limit such disclosure.

19. That any public reference to Proprietary Information by a party shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

20. That, when a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be designated as such for the record.

21. That any part of the record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination and argument, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 19 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties to this Protective Order or pursuant to an order of the Commission.

22. That the parties shall retain the right to question or challenge the confidential or proprietary nature of Proprietary Information and to question or challenge the admissibility of Proprietary Information. If a party challenges the designation of a document or information as proprietary, the party providing the information retains the burden of demonstrating that the designation is appropriate.

23. That the parties shall retain the right to question or object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground; to object to the production of Proprietary Information on any proper ground; and to seek additional measures of protection of Proprietary Information pending the adjudication of the objection.

24. That within 30 days after a Commission final order is entered in the above- captioned proceeding, or in the event of appeals, within 30 days after appeals are finally decided, the non-producing party, upon request, shall either destroy or return to the producing party all copies of all documents and other materials not entered into the record, including notes, which contain any Proprietary Information. If the non-producing party elects to destroy all copies of documents and other materials containing Proprietary Information instead of returning the copies of documents and other

materials containing Proprietary Information to the producing party, the non-producing party shall certify in writing to the other party that the Proprietary Information has been destroyed.

Date: October 24, 2025

/s/

John M. Coogan
Administrative Law Judge

/s/

Emily A. Farren
Administrative Law Judge

APPENDIX A

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	Docket Nos. R-2025-3053442
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2025-3055746
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2025-3055824

v.

The York Water Company – Water Division

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	Docket Nos. R-2025-3053573
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2025-3055747
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2025-3055827

v.

The York Water Company – Wastewater
Division

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is _____ of
_____(the non-producing party) and has
read and understands the Protective Order that deals with the treatment of Proprietary Information
in the above-captioned proceeding. The undersigned agrees to be bound by, and comply with, the
terms and conditions of said Order. In the case of a witness or expert, the undersigned represents
that he or she has complied with the applicable provisions of the Order.

SIGNATURE

PRINT NAME

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

DATE:

APPENDIX B

BEFORE THE PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	Docket Nos. R-2025-3053442
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2025-3055746
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2025-3055824

v.

The York Water Company – Water
Division

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	Docket Nos. R-2025-3053573
Office of Consumer Advocate	:	C-2025-3055747
Office of Small Business Advocate	:	C-2025-305-5827

v.

The York Water Company – Wastewater
Division

NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE FOR HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL MATERIALS

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the
of

_____(the retaining party). The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order and the required treatment of information designated as “CONFIDENTIAL” or “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL” as defined in the Protective Order. The undersigned agrees to be bound by and comply with the terms and conditions of said Protective Order. The undersigned understands and agrees that pursuant to Paragraph 8, a party providing HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL may seek further protection, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure as to particular individuals, even where Appendix B has been executed.

SIGNATURE

PRINT NAME

ADDRESS

EMPLOYER

DATE:

**R-2025-3053442 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. THE YORK WATER
COMPANY - WATER**

Revised 8/12/2025

DEVIN T RYAN ESQUIRE
ALICE WADE ESQUIRE
POST & SCHELL PC
ONE OXFORD CENTRE
301 GRANT STREET SUITE 3010
PITTSBURGH PA 15219
717.612.6052
717.731.1970
dryan@postschell.com
alice.wade@postschell.com
Served via eService October 27, 2025

MICHAEL W HASSELL ESQUIRE
POST & SCHELL PC
17 NORTH SECOND STREET 12TH
FLOOR
717.612.6029
mhassell@postschell.com
Served via eService October 27, 2025

CARRIE B WRIGHT ESQUIRE
PA PUC BIE
SECOND FLOOR WEST
400 NORTH STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17120
717.783.6156
717.787.4887
carwright@pa.gov
Served via eService October 27, 2025

AMY NICHOLS
3175 HACKBERRY LANE
YORK PA 17404
717.683.5180
ajsnichols@gmail.com
Served via First Class Mail October 27,
2025

MICHAEL & DEBRA D'ANGELO
343 QUIET CREEK DRIVE
GETTYSBURG PA 17325
973.519.1873
miked8348@gmail.com
Served via First Class Mail October 27,
2025

JACOB GUTHRIE ESQUIRE
KATHERINE M KENNEDY ESQUIRE
RYAN MORDEN ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET
5TH FLOOR FORUM PLACE
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.5048
jguthrie@paoca.org
kkennedy@paoca.org
rmorden@paoca.org
OCAYork2025@paoca.org
Served via eService October 27, 2025

STEVEN C GRAY ESQUIRE
REBECCA LYTTLE ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET 1ST FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.2525
717.783.2831
sgray@pa.gov
relyttle@pa.gov
Served via Email October 27, 2025

KRIS ROBERTSON
20 ROLLING HILLS WAY
GETTYSBURG PA 17325
315.391.0634
bobturtle@yahoo.com
Served via Email October 27, 2025

KATELYN MOONEYHAN
179 WINIFRED DRIVE
HANOVER PA 17331
443-841-6044
Kmooneyhan24@icloud.com
Served via eService October 27, 2025

GARY FREEDMAN
1021 COUNTRYSIDE ROAD
SEVEN VALLEYS PA 17360
410.591.0980
Garyfreedman5@gmail.com
Served via Email October 27, 2025