

**BEFORE THE  
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	:	R-2025-3057237
	:	C-2025-3057935
v.	:	C-2025-3057993
	:	C-2025-3058103
City of Lancaster - Bureau of Water	:	C-2025-3058728

**BRIEFING AND SETTLEMENT ORDER**

On September 30, 2025, City of Lancaster – Bureau of Water (City or Lancaster) filed with the Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission (Commission or PUC) Supplement No. 49 to Tariff Water – PA P.U.C. No. 6 (Tariff) to become effective November 29, 2025. The City is requesting the Commission approve general rate increases to its water rates pursuant to Section 1308 of the Public Utility Code. The proposed tariff would increase the City’s total annual operating revenues for water service by \$7,005,217, or 20.1% overall,<sup>1</sup> based on a fully projected future test year (FPFTY) ending December 31, 2027.

On October 10, 2025, the Commission’s Bureau of Investigation & Enforcement (I&E) filed a Notice of Appearance. On October 10, 2025, the Office of Small Business Advocate (OSBA) filed a Formal Complaint and Public Statement. On October 12, 2025, the OSBA filed a Notice of Appearance. On October 23, 2025, James M. Blevins filed a Formal Complaint. On October 15, 2025, the Office of Consumer Advocate (OCA) filed a Formal Complaint, Public Statement, and Notice of Appearance. The three Formal Complaints were assigned the following docket numbers, respectively: C-2025-3057935, C-2025-3057993 and C-2025-3058103.

On November 6, 2025, the Commission suspended the proposed Tariff by operation of law until June 29, 2026. The matter was assigned to the Office of Administrative

---

<sup>1</sup> The proposed tariff would increase the City’s jurisdictional rates by 30.9% over existing rates.

Law Judge for Alternative Dispute Resolution, if possible, and for the prompt scheduling of such hearings as may be necessary to determine the lawfulness, justness, and reasonableness of the rates, rules, and regulations contained in Supplement No. 49, in addition to the City's existing rates.

I was assigned as presiding officer and, on November 6, 2025, the Commission issued a Prehearing Conference Notice, scheduling a telephonic prehearing conference for November 18, 2025.

I issued a Prehearing Conference Order on November 6, 2025 establishing procedural rules for the prehearing conference, interventions, and initial requirements for service.

On November 4, 2025, the City filed a Petition for Protective Order, and I issued a Protective Order on November 7, 2025.

On November 11, 2025, Pennsylvania State Senator James Andrew Malone filed a letter addressing the City's proposed rate increase.

The initial prehearing conference was held as scheduled on November 18, 2025. Lancaster, I&E, OCA and OSBA were present and represented by counsel. All existing complaints against the rate filing were consolidated.

On November 20, 2025, Nicholas Cammauf filed a Formal Complaint, which was assigned Docket No. C-2025-3058728.

On November 26, 2025, the Commission issued notice of in-person and telephonic public input hearings to be held on December 15, 2025 and December 16, 2025.

On December 15, 2025, I held two in-person public input hearings at the Manheim Township Municipal Office. Several members of the public attended and four customers testified.

On December 16, 2025, I held two telephonic public input hearings, where two customers testified.

On December 17, 2025, I issued a Scheduling Order memorializing the litigation schedule that was established at the prehearing conference. In the order, I directed that Mr. Cammauf's complaint and any additional formal complaints would be deemed consolidated with the rate filing docket without further order pursuant to 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.32 and 5.61. In addition, I directed that any consumer complainant seeking to participate as an active party must email all the parties to affirm their intent. In the absence of such email, both consumer complainants continued to receive all documents issued by the Commission but were removed from the service list for active parties.

Also, on December 17, 2025, the Commission issued notice for in-person evidentiary hearings to be held, in Harrisburg, on January 26, 2026 and January 27, 2026.

On January 21, 2026, Counsel for the City advised, via email, that the active parties had agreed to mutual waivers of cross examination of all witnesses, and requested that all witnesses be excused from the evidentiary hearing and all testimony and exhibits be permitted to be entered into the record by stipulation. Pursuant to this request, the first day of evidentiary hearings scheduled for January 26, 2026 was canceled.

The City also requested to provide its rejoinder testimony in writing, in lieu of oral rejoinder, on January 26, 2026. I granted the request, as it was unopposed, but declined to cancel the remaining day of evidentiary hearings before that testimony was served on me and the parties. Following my review of the rejoinder testimony and exhibits, I canceled the evidentiary hearing scheduled for January 27, 2026.

The instant order provides instructions to the parties regarding any potential settlement, and reminds the parties that briefs must be filed according to the schedule established in the Scheduling Order.

ORDER

THEREFORE,

IT IS ORDERED:

1. That, if parties finalize a settlement, a settlement petition and statements in support by each joining party shall be filed on or before 4:30 p.m. on Thursday, February 26, 2026. The City of Lancaster – Bureau of Water shall ensure that a copy of the settlement is served on the consumer complainants and any active party not joining the settlement. A conspicuous notice shall be placed on the cover page providing the deadline for filing written objections.

2. That, if a settlement petition is filed, any party wishing to object to the proposed settlement must file their objections in writing with the Commission’s Secretary’s Bureau and provide a copy to me as well as the parties named on the enclosed service list so that they are received on or before 4:30 p.m. on Tuesday, March 17, 2026. Service on me and the other parties to this proceeding may be by email. Late-filed objections will not be considered in the decision of this case.

3. That a settlement petition shall include the following:

- a. A stipulation of any facts that are necessary to support the terms of the settlement.
- b. Proposed conclusions of law and ordering paragraphs.
- c. An appendix table which sets forth the following information: the current rates for each customer class; the rate increase proposed in the initial filing for each customer class; and the rates proposed for each customer class in the petition for settlement. All of these costs and comparisons shall be stated in dollar/cents amounts and in percentages. Current, proposed and settlement rates must be presented consistently for all rate classes.

4. That statements in support shall comply with the following requirements:

a. Utilize a common outline, including headings and subheadings. Every party need not address every issue but should use the same headings.

b. Be specific about how the settlement benefits your client, particularly as it relates to any elements of the rate calculation that are in a black box. Boilerplate language regarding the general utility of settlements is not a substitute for an explanation of a party's support for the settlement. It is recommended that the parties address the testimony from the December 15, 2025 and December 16, 2025 public input hearings.

c. Include cites to the evidentiary record.

5. That, if a settlement petition is not filed, or reflects anything less than a full settlement of all issues among all active parties, the active parties shall file Main Briefs and may file Reply Briefs.

6. That Main Briefs must be deemed filed with the Commission and served to the presiding officer and all parties no later than 4:30 p.m. on Thursday, February 26, 2026.

7. Reply Briefs, if any, must be received by the presiding officer, deemed to be filed with the Commission, and served upon other parties no later than 4:30 p.m. on Tuesday, March 17, 2026.

8. That any brief not filed and served on or before the dates set forth above will not be accepted except by special permission of the Commission or the presiding Administrative Law Judge pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 5.502(c).

9. That the briefs must substantially comply with the Commission's regulations at 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.501, 5.502.

10. That all parties must use a common outline for Main and Reply Briefs.

11. That the briefs must contain: (a) a concise statement or counterstatement of the case; (b) an argument, with sufficient citations to record evidence, preceded by a summary; and (c) a conclusion with requested relief. It is recommended that the parties address the testimony from the public input hearings held in this proceeding.

12. That Main Briefs shall include (a) proposed Findings of Fact, together with page references to statements of testimony and exhibits; (b) proposed Conclusions of Law, together with legal citations; and (c) proposed Ordering Paragraphs.

13. That Main Briefs may not exceed 125 pages in length and Reply Briefs may not exceed 75 pages in length. Proposed Findings of Fact, proposed Conclusions of Law, and proposed Ordering Paragraphs do not count towards the 125-page limit for Main Briefs.

14. That all parties must complete the Excel tables that the presiding officer provided by email on January 20, 2026, and submit the tables along with the Main Briefs.

15. That if a party submits a settlement petition or brief containing confidential information, the party must submit two versions of the filing: (1) one version conspicuously marked as containing confidential information, only to be served to the presiding Administrative Law Judge and those active parties that have executed an agreement and/or protective order appendix on the treatment of confidential information; and (2) a second, public version with all confidential information redacted. Settlement petitions and briefs may not include Confidential Security Information unless a party receives prior permission from the presiding Administrative Law Judge. When filing a settlement petition or brief containing confidential information, parties must clearly indicate to the Commission's Secretary's Bureau that the brief contains confidential information to ensure that the settlement or brief is not published on the Commission's website, and to ensure that it is appropriately filed.

16. That, if a settlement petition or brief contains a citation to a decision which is not available on Westlaw or the Commission's website, a copy of that decision must be appended to the settlement or brief.

17. That an electronic version of any settlement petition or brief shall be provided to the presiding officer in Word document and PDF as-filed versions.

18. That the parties are advised not to include any extra-record evidence in a settlement petition or brief.

19. That if any party fails to follow these instructions in the smallest detail that party's position will not be considered, regardless of where the record may support it or the position of any other party to this proceeding.

20. That unless ordered otherwise, the record shall close on March 17, 2026.

Date: January 28, 2026

\_\_\_\_\_/s/\_\_\_\_\_  
Erin L. Gannon  
Administrative Law Judge

**R-2025-3057237 - PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. CITY OF LANCASTER - BUREAU OF WATER**

*Revised: December 17, 2025*

COURTNEY L SCHULTZ ESQUIRE  
KRUTI B PATEL ESQUIRE  
SAUL EWING LLP  
1735 MARKET STREET  
SUITE 3400  
PHILADELPHIA PA 19102  
**215-972-7717**  
**215-972-7735**

[courtney.schultz@saul.com](mailto:courtney.schultz@saul.com)

[kruti.patel@saul.com](mailto:kruti.patel@saul.com)

Served via eService January 28, 2026

*(Counsel for the City of Lancaster -  
Bureau of Water)*

SCOTT B GRANGER ESQUIRE  
PA PUC BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION  
& ENFORCEMENT  
SECOND FLOOR WEST  
400 NORTH STREET  
HARRISBURG PA 17120  
**717-425-7593**  
**717-884-1440**

[sgranger@pa.gov](mailto:sgranger@pa.gov)

Served via eService January 28, 2026

REBECCA LYTTLE ESQUIRE  
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCATE  
1ST FLOOR FORUM PLACE  
555 WALNUT STREET  
HARRISBURG PA 17101  
**717-783-2525**

[relyttle@pa.gov](mailto:relyttle@pa.gov)

Served via email January 28, 2026

#C-2025-3057935

HARRISON W BREITMAN ESQUIRE  
RYAN MORDEN ESQUIRE  
JOSIAH B HARMAR ESQUIRE  
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE  
5TH FLOOR FORUM PLACE  
555 WALNUT STREET  
HARRISBURG PA 17101-1923  
**717-783-5048**

[OCALancaster2025@paoca.org](mailto:OCALancaster2025@paoca.org)

Served via eService January 28, 2026

#C-2025-3057993

JAMES M. BLEVINS  
134 SANDSTONE DRIVE  
WILLOW STREET PA 17584  
**717-917-5765**

[jblevins250@gmail.com](mailto:jblevins250@gmail.com)

Served via eService January 28, 2026

#C-2025-3058103

NICHOLAS CAMMAUF  
1942 PARK PLAZA  
LANCASTER PA 17601  
**717-371-1579**

[nicholascammauf@hotmail.com](mailto:nicholascammauf@hotmail.com)

Served via First-Class Mail January 28, 2026

#C-2025-3058728