

**BEFORE THE
PENNSYLVANIA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION**

| | | |
|--|---|----------------|
| Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission | : | |
| Office of Consumer Advocate | : | |
| Office of Small Business Advocate | : | |
| CAUSE-PA | : | R-2025-3059428 |
| | : | C-2026-3060292 |
| v. | : | C-2026-3060354 |
| | : | C-2026-3060437 |
| National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation | : | |

PROTECTIVE ORDER

On January 28, 2026, National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation (NFGDC) filed Supplement No. 294 to Tariff Gas Pa. P.U.C. No. 9 (Supplement No. 294) at Docket No. R-2025-3059428, with an effective date of March 29, 2026. NFGDC proposed to increase overall rates by approximately \$19.7 million per year, or 7.4%, over present revenues. NFGDC's proposal, if approved, would increase the average residential customer's bill using 80 CCF per month from \$83.49 to \$88.44, or by approximately 5.9%. NFGDC proposed to reinstate a tariff rider that would provide a refund of Other-Post Employment Benefits (OPEB) funds of approximately \$6.2 million to all customers and provide a one-time bill credit of \$30, totaling approximately \$1.025 million, to confirmed Level 1 and Level 2 customers and Customer Assistance Program (CAP) customers. Supplement No. 294 includes a request seeking approval of two alternative rate mechanisms: permanent approval of the Weather Normalization Adjustment and approval of the Energy Efficiency pilot program.

On February 19, 2026, the Commission suspended the implementation of Supplement No. 294 by operation of law, pursuant to 66 Pa.C.S. § 1308(d), until October 29, 2026, unless permitted by Commission Order to become effective at an earlier date, and instituted an investigation into the lawfulness, justness, and reasonableness of the rates, rules, and regulations proposed in Supplement No. 294.

On February 26, 2026, the presiding officer conducted a call-in telephonic prehearing conference at which the parties addressed procedural matters. On February 27, 2026, the presiding officer issued the Prehearing Order which memorialized the matters discussed, including discovery rules.

On March 30, 2026, NFGDC filed a Motion for a Protective Order (Motion) pursuant to 52 Pa.Code § 5.362(a)(7) and § 5.365(a). NFGDC requested the presiding officer issue a Protective Order because Proprietary Information (within the definition of 52 Pa. Code § 5.365 and as described in 66 Pa.C.S. § 335(d)), was presented or will be presented during this proceeding, which justifies the issuance of a Protective Order. NFGDC contended restricted treatment of such information is justified because unrestricted disclosure of such information would not be in the public interest. NFGDC averred these considerations constitute cause for the restrictions specified in 52 Pa.Code §§ 5.362 and 5.365, and in Administrative Law Judge or Commission Orders granting relief pursuant to said regulation. In addition, NFGDC contended the unrestricted disclosure of this information has a real potential for economic, societal and/or competitive harm if disclosed. NFGDC asserted limiting disclosure will not prejudice the rights of the participants, nor will such limitation frustrate the prompt and fair resolution of this proceeding. As such, NFGDC averred the proposed Protective Order balances the interests of the parties, the public, and the Commission. In its Motion, NFGDC asserted it consulted with the other parties to the proceeding and none of the parties objected to the granting of this Motion.

Upon consideration of the Motion for a Protective Order that was filed by PNG on April 10, 2026, and noting no party objected to its issuance:

IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. The Motion is hereby granted with respect to all materials and information identified in Paragraphs 2 and 3 below, which have been or will be filed with the Commission, produced in discovery, or otherwise presented during the above-captioned proceeding and all proceedings consolidated therewith. All persons previously or hereafter granted access to the

materials and information identified in Ordering Paragraphs 2 and 3 of this Protective Order shall use and disclose such information only in accordance with this Protective Order.

2. The information subject to this Protective Order is all correspondence, documents, data, information, studies, methodologies and other materials, furnished in this proceeding, which are believed by the producing party to be of a proprietary or confidential nature and which are so designated by being marked “CONFIDENTIAL,” “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL”, or “CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION.” Such materials will be referred to below as “Proprietary Information.” When a statement or exhibit is identified for the record, the portions thereof that constitute Proprietary Information shall be designated as such for the record.

3. The parties may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL” those materials which customarily are treated by that party as sensitive or proprietary, which are not available to the public, and which, if disclosed freely, would subject that party or its clients to risk of competitive disadvantage or other business injury. The parties may designate as “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL” those materials that are of such a commercially sensitive nature among the parties or of such a private, personal nature that the producing party is able to justify a heightened level of confidential protection with respect to those materials. The parties shall endeavor to limit their designation of information as HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL. The parties agree that materials containing specific, individual customer information shall be identified as HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL and that any party may seek by subsequent objection or motion to further restrict access to these materials. The parties may designate as “CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION” those materials, as defined in Section 2 of Act 156 of 2006, P.L. 1425, No. 156, 35 P.S. § 2141.2, *et seq.*, “The Public Utility Confidential Security Information Disclosure Protection Act,” the disclosure of which creates a reasonable likelihood of endangering the physical security of public utility resources, infrastructure, facility or information storage system; and information regarding computer hardware, software and networks, including administrative and technical records, which, if disclosed, would be reasonably likely to jeopardize computer security.

4. Proprietary Information shall be made available to counsel for a party, subject to the terms of this Protective Order. Such counsel shall use or disclose the Proprietary Information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, counsel for a party may afford access to Proprietary Information subject to the conditions set forth in this Protective Order.

5. Information deemed as “CONFIDENTIAL”, shall be made available to a “Reviewing Representative” who is a person that has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as Appendix A or Appendix B, and who is:

- (a) An attorney who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a party or a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8, if not an attorney;
- (b) Attorneys, paralegals, and other employees associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph 5(a);
- (c) An expert or an employee of an expert retained by a party for the purpose of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding;
or
- (d) Employees or other representatives of a party appearing in this proceeding with significant responsibility for this docket.

With regard to the Bureau of Investigation and Enforcement (“I&E”), information deemed as “CONFIDENTIAL” shall be made available to I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. The I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose the CONFIDENTIAL information only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutors may afford access to CONFIDENTIAL information only to I&E’s experts,

without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, who are full-time employees of the Commission and bound by all the provisions of this Protective Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutors' execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate(s).

6. Information deemed as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL", may be provided to a "Reviewing Representative" who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as Appendix B and who is:

- (a) An attorney who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a party or a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8, if not an attorney;
- (b) An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph 6(a);
- (c) An outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a party for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding; or
- (d) A person designated as a Reviewing Representative for purposes of HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL.

With regard to I&E, information deemed as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL" shall be made available to the I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. The I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose the HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutors may afford access to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL, only to I&E's experts, without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, who are full-time employees of the Commission and

bound by all the provisions of this Protective Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutors' execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate(s).

Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e), any party may, by subsequent objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular parties.

7. Information deemed as "CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION", may be provided to a "Reviewing Representative" who has signed a Non-Disclosure Certificate attached as Appendix B and who is:

- (a) An attorney who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a statutory advocate pursuant to 52 Pa. Code § 1.8, or a statutory advocate if not an attorney;
- (b) An attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in subparagraph 7(a); or
- (c) An outside expert or an employee of an outside expert retained by a statutory advocate for the purposes of advising, preparing for or testifying in this proceeding.

CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION will only be provided for inspection via in-person review at the offices of Post & Schell, P.C., 17 N. Second Street, 12th Floor, Harrisburg, PA 1701, or upon request of a statutory advocate or an attorney for a statutory advocate, at another location in the Harrisburg-metro area of the Commonwealth, between the hours of 9 A.M. to 5 P.M., Monday through Friday. Such review may be proctored and the Reviewing Representatives are prohibited from reproducing such information in any form without the prior authorization of National Fuel's counsel (including taking detailed notes,

making photocopies, or taking pictures). If a statutory advocate determines that it is necessary to use CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION as part of their presentation of evidence in this proceeding, such statutory advocate shall request a copy from counsel for National Fuel, which permission shall not be unreasonably withheld and subject to that party confirming it understands and will abide by the terms of this Protective Order concerning use of such materials.

With regard to I&E, information deemed as “CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION” shall be made available to the I&E Prosecutors subject to the terms of this Protective Order. The I&E Prosecutors shall use or disclose the CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION only for purposes of preparing or presenting evidence, cross examination, argument, or settlement in this proceeding. To the extent required for participation in this proceeding, the I&E Prosecutors may afford access to CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION, only to I&E’s experts, without the need for the execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate, who are full-time employees of the Commission and bound by all the provisions of this Protective Order by virtue of the I&E Prosecutors’ execution of a Non-Disclosure Certificate.

Provided, further, that in accordance with the provisions of Sections 5.362 and 5.365(e) of the Commission’s Rules of Practice and Procedure, 52 Pa. Code §§ 5.362, 5.365(e), any party may, by subsequent objection or motion, seek further protection with respect to CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure or limitation of disclosure only to particular parties.

8. For purposes of this Protective Order, a Reviewing Representative may not be a “Restricted Person.”

(a) A “Restricted Person” shall mean: (i) an officer, director, stockholder, partner, or owner of any competitor of the parties or an employee of such an entity if the employee’s duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor’s products or services; (ii) an officer, director,

stockholder, partner, or owner of any affiliate of a competitor of the parties (including any association of competitors of the parties) or an employee of such an entity if the employee's duties involve marketing or pricing of the competitor's products or services; (iii) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; and (iv) an officer, director, stockholder, owner or employee of an affiliate of a competitor of a customer of the parties if the Proprietary Information concerns a specific, identifiable customer of the parties; provided, however, that no expert shall be disqualified on account of being a stockholder, partner, or owner unless that expert's interest in the business would provide a significant motive for violation of the limitations of permissible use of the Proprietary Information. For purposes of this Protective Order, stocks, partnership or other ownership interests valued at more than \$10,000 or constituting more than a 1% interest in a business establishes a significant motive for violation.

(b) If an expert for a party, another member of the expert's firm or the expert's firm generally also serves as an expert for, or as a consultant or advisor to, a Restricted Person, said expert must: (i) identify for the parties each Restricted Person and each expert or consultant; (ii) make reasonable attempts to segregate those personnel assisting in the expert's participation in this proceeding from those personnel working on behalf of a Restricted Person; and (iii) if segregation of such personnel is impractical the expert shall give to the producing party written assurances that the lack of segregation will in no way jeopardize the interests of the parties or their customers. The parties retain the right to challenge the adequacy of the written assurances that the parties' or their customers' interests will not be jeopardized. No other persons may have access to the Proprietary Information except as authorized by order of the Commission.

(c) The Office of Small Business Advocate's ("OSBA's") consultant, Mr. Justin Farr, will not be considered to be a Restricted Person, and Paragraphs 8(a) and 8(b) will not apply to Justin Farr, provided that Justin Farr does not share or discuss the Proprietary Information with any person except authorized OSBA representatives.

9. In the event that a party wishes to designate as a Reviewing Representative a person not described in Paragraphs 5(a) through 5(d), 6(a) through 6(c), or 7(a) through 7(c) above, or a person that is a Restricted Person under Paragraph 8, the party shall seek agreement from the party providing the Proprietary Information. If an agreement is reached, that person shall be a Reviewing Representative with respect to those materials. If no agreement is reached, the party shall submit the disputed designation to the presiding Administrative Law Judge for resolution.

10. A qualified "Reviewing Representative" for "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL" may review and discuss "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL" with their client or with the entity with which they are employed or associated, to the extent that the client or entity is not a "Restricted Person", but may not share with or permit the client or entity to review the "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL." Such discussions must be general in nature and not disclose specific "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL," provided however that counsel for I&E, the Office of Consumer Advocate, and OSBA may share proprietary information with the I&E Director, Consumer Advocate, Deputy Consumer Advocate, and Small Business Advocate, respectively, without obtaining a Non-Disclosure Certificate from these individuals, provided however, that these individuals otherwise abide by the terms of the Protective Order.

11. Information deemed Proprietary Information shall not be used except as necessary for the conduct of this proceeding, nor shall it be disclosed in any manner to any person except a Reviewing Representative who is engaged in the conduct of this proceeding and who needs to know the information in order to carry out that person's responsibilities in this proceeding. Reviewing Representatives may not use information contained in any Proprietary

Information obtained through this proceeding to give any party or any competitor of any party a commercial advantage.

12. Reviewing Representatives shall execute a Non-Disclosure Certificate in order to obtain access to Proprietary Information, and will be subject to the following conditions:

(a) A Reviewing Representative shall not be permitted to inspect, participate in discussions regarding, or otherwise be permitted access to Proprietary Information pursuant to this Protective Order unless that Reviewing Representative has first executed a Non-Disclosure Certificate provided that if an attorney qualified as a Reviewing Representative has executed such a certificate, the paralegals, secretarial and clerical personnel under the attorney's instruction, supervision or control need not do so, nor do Commission employees assisting I&E as noted above in Paragraphs 5, 6, and 7. A copy of each Non-Disclosure Certificate shall be provided to counsel asserting confidentiality prior to disclosure of any Proprietary Information to that Reviewing Representative.

(b) Attorneys and outside experts qualified as Reviewing Representatives are responsible for ensuring that persons under their supervision or control comply with the Protective Order.

13. None of the parties waive their right to pursue any other legal or equitable remedies that may be available in the event of actual or anticipated disclosure of Proprietary Information.

14. The parties shall designate data or documents as constituting or containing Proprietary Information by marking the documents "CONFIDENTIAL," "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL," or "CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION." Where only part of data compilations or multi-page documents constitutes or contains Proprietary Information, the parties, insofar as reasonably practicable within discovery

and other time constraints imposed in this proceeding, shall designate only the specific data or pages of documents that constitute or contain Proprietary Information. The Proprietary Information shall be served upon the parties hereto only and the materials shall be separate from the nonproprietary materials and conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL,” “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL,” or “CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION.” For filing purposes, Proprietary Information shall be filed separately from the nonproprietary materials and conspicuously marked “CONFIDENTIAL,” “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL,” or “CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION.”

15. The parties will consider and treat the Proprietary Information as within the exemptions from disclosure provided in Section 335(d) of the Public Utility Code, 66 Pa.C.S. § 335(d), and the Pennsylvania Right-to-Know Law, 65 P.S. §§ 67.101 *et seq.*, until such time as the information is found to be non-proprietary. In the event that any person or entity seeks to compel the disclosure of Proprietary Information, the non-producing party shall promptly notify the producing party in order to provide the producing party an opportunity to oppose or limit such disclosure.

16. Any public reference to Proprietary Information by a party or its Reviewing Representatives shall be to the title or exhibit reference in sufficient detail to permit persons with access to the Proprietary Information to understand fully the reference and not more. The Proprietary Information shall remain a part of the record, to the extent admitted, for all purposes of administrative or judicial review.

17. Part of any record of this proceeding containing Proprietary Information, including but not limited to all exhibits, writings, testimony, cross examination, arguments, and responses to discovery, and including reference thereto as mentioned in Paragraph 16 above, shall be sealed for all purposes, including administrative and judicial review, unless such Proprietary Information is released from the restrictions of this Protective Order, either through the agreement of the parties to this proceeding or pursuant to an order of the Commission.

APPENDIX A

| | | |
|--|---|----------------|
| Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission | : | |
| Office of Consumer Advocate | : | |
| Office of Small Business Advocate | : | |
| CAUSE-PA | : | R-2025-3059428 |
| | : | C-2026-3060292 |
| v. | : | C-2026-3060354 |
| | : | C-2026-3060437 |
| National Fuel Gas Distribution Corporation | : | |

NON-DISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE

TO WHOM IT MAY CONCERN:

The undersigned is the _____ of _____ (the retaining party). The undersigned has read and understands the Protective Order and the required treatment of information designated as “CONFIDENTIAL,” “HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL” or “CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION” as defined in the Protective Order. The undersigned agrees to be bound by and comply with the terms and conditions of said Protective Order. The undersigned understands and agrees that, pursuant to Paragraphs 6 and 7, a party providing HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL PROTECTED MATERIAL and CONFIDENTIAL SECURITY INFORMATION may seek further protection, including, but not limited to, total prohibition of disclosure as to particular individuals, even where Appendix B has been executed.

Name

Address

Signature

Employer

R-2025-3059428 - PA PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION v. NATIONAL FUEL GAS DISTRIBUTION CORPORATION

ANTHONY D. KANAGY ESQUIRE
MEGAN E RULLI ESQUIRE
17 NORTH 2ND STREET, 12TH FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101-1601
717.612.6034
717.612.6012
717.731.1985
717.472.0466

akanagy@postschell.com
mrulli@postschell.com

Served via eService April 23, 2026

SCOTT B. GRANGER ESQUIRE
PA PUC BUREAU OF INVESTIGATION &
ENFORCEMENT
400 NORTH STREET, 2ND FLOOR WEST
HARRISBURG PA 17120
717.425.7593
717.884.1440

sgranger@pa.gov

Served via eService April 23, 2026

REBECCA LYTTLE
NAZAARAH SABREE
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS
ADVOCATE
555 WALNUT STREET, 1ST FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.2525
717.783.2831

relyttle@pa.gov

ra-sba@pa.gov

Served via Email April 23, 2026

JOSEPH L. VULLO ESQUIRE
BURKE VULLO REILLY ROBERTS
1460 WYOMING AVENUE
FORTY FORT PA 18704
570.288.6441

jvullo@bvrrlaw.com

Served via eService April 23, 2026

JOEL H. CHESKIS ESQUIRE
RYAN MORDEN ESQUIRE
OLIVIA M. SPERGEL ESQUIRE
HARRISON W. BREITMAN ESQUIRE
JANNA E. WILLIAMS ESQUIRE
CRYSTAL M. ZOOK ESQUIRE
OFFICE OF CONSUMER ADVOCATE
FORUM PLACE
555 WALNUT STREET, 5TH FLOOR
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.783.5048
717.780.4536

jcheskis@paoca.org

rmorden@paoca.org

ospergel@paoca.org

hbreitman@paoca.org

jwilliams@paoca.org

czook@paoca.org

Served via eService April 23, 2026

JOHN SWEET ESQUIRE
LEVI PHILLIPS ESQUIRE
RIA PEREIRA ESQUIRE
ELIZABETH R. MARX ESQUIRE
LAUREN BERMAN ESQUIRE
PA UTILITY LAW PROJECT
118 LOCUST STREET
HARRISBURG PA 17101
717.701.3837
717.710.3825
717.236.9486

jsweet@putilitylawproject.org

lphillips@putilitylawproject.org

rpereira@putilitylawproject.org

emarx@putilitylawproject.org

lberman@putilitylawproject.org

Served via eService April 23, 2026